

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Friday, 10 June 2022

2 (10.01 am)

3 LORD BRACADALE: Good morning.

4 Good morning, Dr Crawford.

5 We will continue with your evidence now, so

6 Ms Thomson, when you're ready.

7 DR RUDY CRAWFORD (continued)

8 Questions from MS THOMSON (continued)

9 MS THOMSON: Thank you.

10 Good morning, Mr Crawford.

11 A. Good morning.

12 Q. Yesterday afternoon I think we maybe went a little off  
13 topic and it was absolutely my fault, but what I would  
14 like to do this morning is get back on point and really  
15 focus on the matters that will help the Chair. I would  
16 like to look at any evidence that is available to the  
17 Chair for his consideration regarding any injuries to  
18 Nicole Short's back, and whether that evidence is  
19 consistent with the stamps as described and demonstrated  
20 by Constables Tomlinson and Walker.

21 We're going to do that this morning, you and I, by

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 exploring three areas. Firstly, I would like us to look  
2 at Nicole Short's medical records and identify any  
3 entries that may be consistent with the stamps to her  
4 lower back or kidney area, as demonstrated. Then I'm  
5 going to invite your comment on the evidence given by  
6 Mr Ian Anderson who expressed the view that the injuries  
7 that he noted when he examined Nicole Short on  
8 21 May 2015 were not consistent with the stamps as  
9 demonstrated. And finally, we're going to look at your  
10 Inquiry statement briefly and clarify your position for  
11 the benefit of the Chair.

12 So we're going to begin by looking at some medical  
13 records, Mr Crawford, and I understand that you would  
14 ordinarily wear prescription glasses for looking at  
15 medical records --

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. -- and you have perhaps left those behind this morning.

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. But you do, by happenstance, have a pair of prescription  
20 sunglasses in your brief case.

21 A. Yes, yes, I'm very embarrassed about that.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Q. Please don't be, please don't be embarrassed in the  
2 slightest. The most important thing is that you are  
3 able to read the text in front of you. All of the notes  
4 are in hard copy, we may bring some up on the screen,  
5 but I'm going to ask you to simply look through notes to  
6 identify entries for me, so if you would be more  
7 comfortable doing so with your prescription sunglasses  
8 on, then please feel free to pop them on.

9 A. Thank you.

10 Q. So we don't need to bring these up on the screen just  
11 now, Ms Wildgoose, but I'm going to ask you firstly,  
12 Mr Crawford, to look at the accident and emergency notes  
13 from 3 May 2015, and they will have a PIRC reference on  
14 them, which is 01158. That might help you to find them  
15 in the folder. It may be that Mr Bruce and Ms Pang  
16 might be able to assist.

17 A. Yes, I have them.

18 Q. At the very beginning --

19 A. Yes, at the very beginning.

20 Q. -- there we are. There are only a few pages of notes  
21 and what I will ask you to do -- there are only two

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 pages of handwritten notes completed by Dr Mitchell.

2 Can I ask you please simply to cast your eye over those  
3 notes and identify any entries that are consistent with  
4 stamps to Nicole Short's lower back or kidney area, as  
5 demonstrated. Please take the time that you need to  
6 read through the records. Please don't feel intimidated  
7 by the silence.

8 A. Thank you. Thank you.

9 (Pause).

10 Q. Having read the notes, Mr Crawford, if you form the view  
11 that there are no entries that would be consistent with  
12 the stamps we saw demonstrated, please just tell me and  
13 we will move on.

14 A. Yes, I am familiar with the notes, but I was just  
15 reading them again. There is no reference to any injury  
16 or injury mechanism like that in these particular notes.  
17 The only thing that I previously noted but which is not  
18 directly relevant to stamps so I don't know whether I  
19 should actually mention it -- is there's an entry on  
20 a blank page here that's not annotated in any way but it  
21 says "Query loss of consciousness, punches to back

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 head", and, you know -- which applies or suggests that  
2 there was a head injury, but that's not related to  
3 stamping.

4 Q. And the Chair heard from Dr Mitchell yesterday as to who  
5 may have made that entry and the significance of it so  
6 rest assured, that's not a matter that need concern you  
7 today.

8 A. Okay, fine.

9 Q. So we can move on then from the notes from the accident  
10 and emergency department on 3 May 2015 and we will look  
11 now at the report and notes prepared by Dr Norrie, the  
12 forensic medical examiner, who examined Nicole Short  
13 later that day and again, what I'm going to ask you to  
14 do, Mr Crawford, is look through these notes and  
15 identify for the Chair any entries that you consider are  
16 consistent with stamps to the lower back or kidney area,  
17 as demonstrated by the officers, and for present  
18 purposes, I don't think we need to concern ourselves  
19 with any entries to do with head injuries.

20 A. Sure, okay.

21 Q. Now, these have PIRC references 01310 and 01301. I'm

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           not sure where in your folder they will be.

2           A. Yes, I have them here.

3           Q. You have them?

4           A. Yes. So 01310 --

5           Q. 01310 is the type-written report.

6           A. Oh, right.

7           Q. 01301 are the handwritten notes that preceded it.

8           A. Okay.

9                       (Pause).

10                  Right, again, there are none.

11           Q. All right. Let's move on then to the records from the

12                  accident and emergency department on 4 May 2015. They

13                  have PIRC reference 01160. Are you able to find those,

14                  Mr Crawford?

15           A. Yes, I've got them.

16           Q. Grand. Again, please take the time that you need.

17                       (Pause).

18                  You mentioned yesterday afternoon that you recalled

19                  somewhere seeing a reference to --

20           A. Yes, it's in these records.

21           Q. -- paraspinal tenderness.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 Q. It's here, isn't it?
- 3 A. It is. It was on the attendance at the emergency  
4 department on 4 May 2015.
- 5 Q. Let's bring these records up, please, Ms Wildgoose.  
6 This is PIRC 01160, and the relevant entry I think,  
7 Mr Crawford, is on page 5.
- 8 A. Yes. It is a little bit lower down.
- 9 Q. Bottom right-hand corner.
- 10 A. There it is, that's it.
- 11 Q. There we are.
- 12 A. "Mild right paraspinal tenderness."
- 13 Q. Just to help those who are looking at the screen, that's  
14 in the margin on the right-hand side of the page, is  
15 that right?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. But if we look slightly to the left, do we also see  
18 recorded:
- 19 "No C-spine tenderness FROM ..."  
20 Which I think is full range of movement?
- 21 A. Full range of movement, yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. "... neck ... no T/L/S spine tenderness..."
- 2 A. Thoracic, lumber or sacral spine tenderness or bruising.
- 3 Q. Thank you. And then in the margin "mild right
- 4 paraspinal tenderness."
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And that's the entry that you recalled ringing a bell
- 7 with you yesterday afternoon?
- 8 A. Yes, and that's the area -- these notes refer to
- 9 specific bony tenderness of the spine and that entry
- 10 refers to the muscles around the spine, in this case on
- 11 the right side, where I was referring to yesterday which
- 12 also coincides with the kidney area, you know, that kind
- 13 of area, and so I formed the view that that was
- 14 supportive evidence of an injury there and that could be
- 15 attributed to a stamp.
- 16 Q. I see. Am I right to understand that the paraspinal
- 17 muscles run from the top to bottom of the spine on both
- 18 sides?
- 19 A. Well, you're -- yes, but these ones actually run from
- 20 the lower thoracic area to the pelvic area, so these are
- 21 lumbar muscles, they're predominantly in the -- either



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 side of the lumbar spine, the ones that they're  
2 referring to there.

3 Q. What makes you think that they're references to the  
4 muscles in the lumbar spine?

5 A. Because -- well, it's in the entry where she is  
6 examining the spine and it is right next to where she  
7 says that there's no bony tenderness of the thoracic  
8 lumbar or sacral spine, and paraspinal muscles in  
9 clinical practice, that would normally be referring to  
10 that area of the body at the time they're examining  
11 them. If it was cervical spine -- because you could say  
12 paraspinal in relation to the cervical spine, but most  
13 people don't, they would say cervical spine, but that  
14 would be in relation to the cervical spine, so that's  
15 put in there and that was my interpretation of it.

16 Q. So that's how you have interpreted what's written in  
17 those records?

18 A. That's how I have interpreted it. This is the right  
19 paravertebral muscles, in other words, the right lumbar  
20 back area of the spine.

21 Q. Mr Crawford, I'm going to ask you to consider some

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 evidence that is before the Inquiry in written form from  
2 Dr Smeed, and Dr Smeed is the doctor who made these  
3 entries. Now you have not seen this before?

4 A. No.

5 Q. But if I can ask you, please, Ms Wildgoose, to bring up  
6 on the screen SBPI 00121 and we will just satisfy  
7 ourselves that this is in fact Dr Zoe Smeed's statement  
8 and it is, and it was given to a member of the Inquiry  
9 team on 4 April of this year.

10 Can we scroll down, please, to paragraph 60 and 61  
11 and I will read these out, Mr Crawford, to save you  
12 having to put your sunglasses on again. 60:

13 "I have been referred to the medical records at  
14 page 5: 'no C-spine tenderness FROM neck mild R  
15 paraspinal tenderness'. 'FROM' means full range of  
16 movement. She's moving her neck normally. She had no  
17 tenderness over the bones in her neck, she had some mild  
18 tenderness to her right paraspinal muscles at her neck,  
19 which are more muscular and she was able to fully move  
20 her neck. So you do that if you're worried about  
21 looking for a fracture with the neck. I test tenderness

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 by feeling down the spinal bones and checking if it is  
2 sore.

3 "I have been referred to the medical records at  
4 page 5: 'no TLS spine tenderness/bruising'. This means  
5 she has no thoracic, lumbar or sacral spine tenderness  
6 or bruising."

7 In light of that evidence, Mr Crawford, and the  
8 clarification that the tenderness was mild and was to  
9 the right paraspinal muscles at her neck and not in the  
10 lumbar spine as you had understood the position to be,  
11 do you consider that the entry on page 5 of the records  
12 that we looked at a moment ago is consistent with the  
13 stamps to the lower back or kidney area as demonstrated  
14 by Constable Tomlinson and Constable Walker?

15 A. If that doesn't refer to the area -- to the entry "No  
16 thoracic, lumbar or sacral spine tenderness or  
17 bruising", if it doesn't refer to that, then I would  
18 interpret that as being that there was no evidence of  
19 injury in that area.

20 Q. So no evidence of injury in the thoracic, lumbar or  
21 spinal area?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1       A. If that entry didn't apply to -- if the marginal note  
2       didn't apply to that entry.
- 3       Q. Which it doesn't; the evidence before the Chair by the  
4       author of that note is that the marginal note does not  
5       apply to "No T/L/S spine tenderness/bruising", but does  
6       apply to "No C-spine tenderness FROM neck". That is the  
7       entry to which the marginal note refers.
- 8               That being the case, do you consider that the entry  
9       is consistent with stamps to the lower back or  
10      kidney area as demonstrated by the officers?
- 11      A. Well, if it doesn't refer to that then no, it's not  
12      consistent with that.
- 13      Q. Would the tenderness in the right paraspinal muscles be  
14      more consistent with Nicole Short having been struck to  
15      the back of the head, behind her right ear with such  
16      force that her feet left the ground?
- 17      A. Sorry, would you repeat that question, please?
- 18      Q. Of course. I'm wondering whether the tenderness in the  
19      right paraspinal muscles of the neck might be more  
20      consistent with Nicole Short having been struck to the  
21      back of her head, behind her right ear, with such force

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that her feet left the ground?

2           A. It would be consistent with that, yes. It would be  
3           entirely consistent with that.

4           Q. We will move on. Can I ask you to look at another set  
5           of records. These are slightly longer. PIRC 01361. We  
6           don't need these on the screen, thank you. Let me know  
7           when you find these, Mr Crawford.

8           A. Yes, I have them.

9           Q. They're a little bit longer and they encompass records  
10          relating to an acute admission on 10 May following  
11          a call to NHS 24, CT scans from 11 May and the GP  
12          referral from 18 May to the maxillofacial unit where  
13          Nicole Short was seen on 8 June, so they are quite long.  
14          Please take the time that you need to go through these  
15          records and again, I'm going to ask you to identify, for  
16          the benefit of the Chair, any entries that you consider  
17          are consistent with a stamp or stamps to the lower back  
18          or kidney area as described and demonstrated by the  
19          officers.

20          A. Well, on page 9, dated 8 June 2015, it says:  
21                 "Referred by GP."

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           And the presenting complaint is there of "Weakness  
2           of the right lower face and reduced sensation right side  
3           of face and" -- which is slowly improving, but in the  
4           history that's been given to the doctor who has made  
5           these notes it says that she was kicked and stamped on  
6           the head.

7           Q.   Yes.  Would you forgive me for interrupting you there,  
8           Mr Crawford.  I anticipated that you might note that  
9           entry and we see it, I think, on at least three  
10          occasions within this bundle of notes.

11          A.   Yes.

12          Q.   And Ms Short was asked about this in her evidence and  
13          she gave very clear evidence that she has no  
14          recollection of being kicked or stamped on the head,  
15          no one told her that she was kicked or stamped on  
16          the head, there is no eye-witness evidence whatsoever  
17          before the Chair to that effect, and this appears to be  
18          a rogue entry.  We cannot explain how it came to be in  
19          the records.  She does not consider that she provided  
20          that information to the doctor, she can't explain how it  
21          got there, but there is no information or evidence

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           before the Chair to suggest that she was kicked or  
2           stamped on the head, so if we could perhaps leave  
3           references to kicking or stamping of the head to one  
4           side because they appear to be without foundation.

5           A.   Mm-hm.

6                         (Pause).

7           Right, well, there's no other reference -- sorry,  
8           I haven't completed the notes, but in the handwritten  
9           notes there, so far there's no specific reference to  
10          other injuries related to stamping.

11          Q.   Or any injuries to her back, Mr Crawford?

12          A.   No, no, no, there's not.

13          Q.   Nothing, okay.

14          A.   The immediate discharge -- no, again, that's -- there's  
15          a principle diagnosis: discharge of concussion/muscular  
16          pain, but it is not specified.

17                         Sorry, these notes go on -- am I still on the same  
18          set?

19          Q.   They are quite lengthy but you will see that many pages  
20          have been redacted and are blank sheets.

21          A.   Yes, indeed.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 (Pause).

2 Again, the only references so far have been in the  
3 history that's given, because on page 18, again, that  
4 history is repeated, which is what I would expect. It  
5 says that she was stamped on whilst on the ground:

6 "... punched to the back of head, collapsed, stamped  
7 on whilst on the ground."

8 Q. That's part of the history --

9 A. That's the history.

10 Q. -- but what we're really looking for, and what I would  
11 invite you to focus on, Mr Crawford, are any references  
12 to injuries, bruising, tenderness, anything that's  
13 consistent with the stamps that you saw demonstrated  
14 yesterday.

15 A. The -- I have seen these notes before and I know that  
16 there was no specific evidence of physical injuries,  
17 you know, to the back of the spine.

18 Q. Very well. If you have seen them before and that's your  
19 recollection, are you content that we move on?

20 A. Yes, I'm happy to accept that, yes.

21 Q. I would like to take you now to a report prepared by



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 a professional colleague of yours, Mr Ian Anderson. He  
2 examined Nicole Short on 21 May of 2015 and I think in  
3 fact you had sight of his report at the time that you  
4 prepared your own report.

5 A. I had, yes.

6 Q. And I will ask that we bring this up on the screen  
7 please. It is PIRC 1405. If we scroll down we will see  
8 that this is indeed the report prepared by Mr Anderson  
9 on 21 May and, as I mentioned a moment ago, he examined  
10 Nicole Short on that date and gave evidence to that  
11 effect yesterday.

12 I would like to take you very briefly, Mr Crawford,  
13 to three very short entries, firstly, on page 6, fourth  
14 paragraph down on page 6 -- this is page 6 of the  
15 report. The PDF might have an additional page in.  
16 I think it must be page 7 on the PDF, Ms Wildgoose.  
17 There we are. Exactly:

18 "She described ongoing, troublesome symptoms of  
19 headache, together with neck discomfort and stiffness.  
20 She described discomfort and tenderness over the right  
21 side of her torso."

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           So that's the history that she gave to Mr Anderson.

2           Then on page 7, please, or the next page, about five  
3 paragraphs down beginning "No residual", there we are:

4           "No residual bruising was noted on either side of  
5 her rib cage but localised tenderness was noted over the  
6 outer aspect of the right side of her lower rib cage.

7           Aus --

8           A. "Auscultation".

9           Q. Thank you, I was about to ask for your help with that  
10 word:

11           "... of her chest using a stethoscope revealed  
12 normal breath sounds."

13           And onto the next page, please, for the final  
14 entry -- so that was from Mr Anderson's examination, and  
15 this section is his opinion and we see at the bottom of  
16 the screen there -- just there is perfect, thank you:

17           "She suffered contusions to the right side of her  
18 torso, particularly over her lower right rib cage,  
19 consistent with having been caused by blunt injury."

20           So you have heard there from Mr Anderson's report  
21 the history that he took insofar as it is relevant to

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 issues concerning the back, his findings on examination  
2 and his opinion.

3 Now, Mr Anderson gave evidence yesterday,  
4 Mr Crawford, and in his evidence he said that he did not  
5 consider that his findings on examination on 21 May were  
6 consistent with a stamp to the lower back or kidney area  
7 as demonstrated by Constable Walker and Constable  
8 Tomlinson. Would you wish to disagree with him?

9 A. I would say that tenderness over the right lower  
10 rib cage is consistent with having been caused by blunt  
11 injury, and I would say that that could be -- in my view  
12 it is also consistent with that blunt injury being  
13 a stamp or a blow to the right lower chest. There is  
14 uncertainty as to exactly -- well, (a) whether this  
15 occurred, (b) if it did occur, exactly where, it's not  
16 just the back, it's -- there's suggestions that it could  
17 be -- you know, it's the back area which includes the  
18 right lower chest and that, in my view, could be  
19 consistent, or would also be consistent with a stamp to  
20 the right lower chest injuring the ribs and this is  
21 21 May, which is a couple of weeks after the incident

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 I think, thereabouts, and, you know, so there's  
2 definitely -- to me that's evidence of an injury there  
3 and that would be consistent with a stamp.

4 Q. Evidence of an injury there consistent with a stamp, but  
5 would it be consistent, in your opinion, Mr Crawford,  
6 with the stamps demonstrated by Constable Walker and  
7 Constable Tomlinson?

8 A. I have reservations about the interpretation of that in  
9 terms of the potential severity of injury that actually  
10 occurs, because quite clearly the demonstration is  
11 impressive of, you know, a potential -- of a severe  
12 force and a serious mechanism of injury. However, there  
13 are other variables in this situation, you know, not  
14 every person who is stamped on sustains serious  
15 injuries, even if the stamps occur with apparent force,  
16 so I'm not sure how I can answer that question more  
17 accurately because I -- there are patients who can have  
18 an apparent stamp like that but not sustain a serious  
19 injury or a life-threatening injury, and this is  
20 a couple of weeks down the line.

21 Q. So should we understand, then, that you disagree with

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Mr Anderson who had the benefit of examining the patient  
2 which is a benefit that you did not have?

3 A. Well, I disagree to the extent that -- I do agree to the  
4 extent that she didn't have any signs of a serious  
5 injury having been sustained, but I -- my concern is  
6 that you could not exclude a stamp injury based on that  
7 alone, because there is no other -- you know, there  
8 are -- there doesn't appear to be another explanation  
9 offered for that injury and -- or other injuries that  
10 she may have sustained.

11 Q. Mr Crawford, you will correct me if I'm wrong, but  
12 I think yesterday in your evidence you accepted that  
13 pain to the right side could have been caused by her  
14 lying on her right side curled up on top of her utility  
15 belt and CS spray, and could also have been caused by  
16 her falling to the ground?

17 A. Well, if I remember correctly, I didn't -- well, if she  
18 had fallen on the ground onto her right side it could  
19 have caused that. I think when you asked me that  
20 question yesterday you specifically referred -- included  
21 pain around the hip areas, which you were saying could

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that be caused by lying, or contact with the spray and  
2           the answer to that was yes.

3           However, I do recollect, and I saw it in the notes  
4           there, that she actually had removed her spray from her  
5           utility belt and, you know, it's not certain whether it  
6           was actually in the utility belt at the time she fell.  
7           That's for the Chair --

8           Q. Mr Crawford, these are very much matters within the  
9           province --

10          A. Yes, so --

11          Q. -- the exclusive province -- if I may finish --

12          A. Yes, okay.

13          Q. -- of the Chair and it may be that the evidence that he  
14           heard was in fact the casing was still on the belt and  
15           the cover -- the spray itself had been --

16          A. Okay, well, sorry, I accept that and I don't want to  
17           stray, but when I was considering mechanisms of injury,  
18           I'm considering these factors as to how the injury was  
19           caused, because if it's there, or if it's not there  
20           would affect -- would have an influence on whether or  
21           not an injury was sustained by that. That was all,

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           sorry.

2           Q. It's a matter for the Chair to consider --

3           A. Yes, okay, I accept that.

4           Q. -- to consider the cause of various injuries and really  
5           my focus this morning is very, very narrow and it is to  
6           explore with you whether there are any entries in any of  
7           the records that are consistent with the stamps as  
8           demonstrated by Constable Tomlinson and Constable  
9           Walker, and that's what I'm interested in, because that  
10          I think will assist the Chair.

11                    So we should understand then that you disagree with  
12          Mr Anderson to the extent that you consider that the  
13          contusions to the right side of the torso may have been  
14          caused, or may be consistent with a stamping injury.

15          A. (nods)

16          Q. And that's not withstanding the fact that the first  
17          relevant entry appears to be on 21 May 2015 and that  
18          there appear to be no relevant entries, or history  
19          whatsoever, prior to that date?

20          A. I feel you're trying to lead me down a path that is very  
21          strict and narrow and looking for a yes or a no answer.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Medicine is very rarely like that and you can -- and  
2 the -- in the presence of a history of being stamped on,  
3 that type of injury would be consistent with that.  
4 That's all I'm saying. I'm not saying that it did or it  
5 did not happen.

6 In the absence of a history, or if the evidence is  
7 it did not happen, the -- sorry, I'm getting myself  
8 confused. You said in the manner demonstrated. There  
9 is sufficient uncertainty in my mind between  
10 a demonstration and a real life situation to -- for me  
11 to say "Oh, no, it is not consistent with that", because  
12 the mechanism is stamping and the -- it would be  
13 consistent with a stamp, and with an apparent stamp --  
14 or a stamp of apparent severe force, but I absolutely  
15 accept that she has not got physical evidence of  
16 injuries that -- of a significant or serious injury  
17 caused by a stamp but she -- as I said before, she was  
18 wearing protective gear and there are other factors that  
19 could affect the severity of the injuries that occurred  
20 as a result of a mechanism like that.

21 Q. Can I take you to your Inquiry statement, please, in



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 conclusion of your evidence. That's SBPI -- we have it,  
2 thank you.

3 So this is a statement you gave to a member of the  
4 Inquiry team on 12 May 2022 and can I take you to  
5 page 10, paragraph 41.

6 To put this in context you were provided with the  
7 description of the stamp by Constable Tomlinson. You  
8 weren't provided with the description by  
9 Constable Walker, although they were quite similar, and  
10 of course you weren't provided with the demonstrations  
11 because they hadn't happened yet, but having been  
12 provided with the description, you were asked if you  
13 would:

14 "... expect the doctors examining Nicole Short to  
15 discover any visible injuries on her back or side in A&E  
16 on 3 or 4 May ... when she saw the [FME] and when she  
17 saw her GP on 5 May ..."

18 If we scroll down to the next paragraph you say:

19 "Clearly PC Short didn't have broken ribs, punctured  
20 lungs, internal bleeding and things like that. If it  
21 happened she would have had bruising, straining, soft

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 tissue injuries. You may feel it at the time or may not  
2 feel it at the time. You might not be aware of the pain  
3 or injury but only later all the adrenaline and things  
4 wear off. Over a period of time because muscles and  
5 tissue suffer microtrauma, they can stiffen up within  
6 a day, two days, 24 to 36 hours, that's when you get  
7 maximum symptoms as the changes in the tissue cause  
8 that. A light injury could take several days to a week  
9 or longer to settle. Severely bruised ribs or broken  
10 ribs can take 6 weeks or longer to get better. You  
11 would get stiffness. It would take several days to  
12 resolve it. It depends on your level of fitness and  
13 what you're used to having."

14 Can I ask you whether the paragraphs that I have  
15 read out to you just now remain your opinion today?

16 A. What I was trying to explain in that was that there is  
17 a spectrum, or a range and -- a range of severity and  
18 the -- you can go from, you know, a mild injury to  
19 a severe injury, but there are shades of grey in-between  
20 as well, you know, and it can vary and it can be very  
21 difficult to predict just exactly how long symptoms

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           would persist.

2           I also explained during that discussion that,  
3           you know, there can be other causes for stiffness and  
4           soreness in muscles after extreme physical exertion  
5           and -- but in one way we're going from a general to  
6           a specific.

7           I do fully accept that in this particular case there  
8           was no evidence of significant or severe injury to the  
9           body of Ms Short as a result of stamping. My opinion  
10          that was formed was based on the reports and the  
11          statements that were given to me at the time describing  
12          the mechanism of injury and describing, you know, her  
13          symptoms and clinical presentation that -- to me at that  
14          time in those statements was consistent with a stamping  
15          injury.

16        MS THOMSON: Bear with me a moment, please, Mr Crawford.

17                   (Pause).

18           I am grateful for your time. I have no further  
19          questions for you.

20        A. Okay, thank you.

21        LORD BRACADALE: Are there any Rule 9 applications?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Dr Crawford, I wonder if you would retire to the witness  
2 room while I hear a submission.

3 MS MCCALL: Sir, I wonder whether I can have a few minutes  
4 to consider that?

5 LORD BRACADALE: Yes, very well. Do you want me to adjourn  
6 then? I will adjourn for a short time to allow that.

7 (10.37 am)

8 (Short Break)

9 (10.53 am)

10 LORD BRACADALE: Ms McCall, do you have an application?

11 MS MCCALL: No, thank you, sir.

12 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Mitchell, would you come to the table  
13 please.

14 (Pause).

15 Yes.

16 Application by MS MITCHELL

17 MS MITCHELL: The issue 1 is in relation to breathing,  
18 Nicole Short's breathing. Yesterday there was evidence  
19 given by this witness where he said on the information  
20 that he was provided with, there were various places  
21 where Ms Short did complain of being unable to breathe

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 and he explained that he thought that would be  
2 consistent with receiving -- having a blow in that area  
3 because she was unable to breathe because of an injury  
4 to there, possibly having been winded or an injury  
5 causing pain that was restricting breathing.

6 Now, I didn't propose to take him through possible  
7 other mechanism for the pain injury at the side because  
8 my learned friend has already done that, but I was going  
9 to ask him to look at PIRC statement 253 which is the  
10 statement of Nicole Short, page 3 thereof, because  
11 Nicole Short says in her interaction with Sheku Bayoh,  
12 before there's any question of any contact between the  
13 two she said:

14 "I was in terror and fear of my life. I just turned  
15 away and tried to run. I remember screaming 'no' and  
16 crying but no tears were coming out and struggling to  
17 breathe."

18 So I would like to take the witness to that part of  
19 the statement where he can see that the symptom -- the  
20 breathlessness symptom pre-dates any suggestion of  
21 a punch or a stamp, and then simply identifying in the

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 emergency -- accident and emergency records, which he  
2 records in his own report at page 7 of 26, at  
3 subsection 3, that the witness's breathing was 16  
4 breaths per minute as being recorded and just to confirm  
5 with him that's within the normal range.

6 LORD BRACADALE: That's the only matter?

7 MS MITCHELL: No, no, there's one other matter. The second  
8 matter is on the issue of Crown instruction and how the  
9 report was obtained, the information given -- I will  
10 give it more detail, my Lord, but the information given  
11 and the reason for that, my Lord, is the Inquiry will of  
12 course understand that part of the Inquiry terms --  
13 whilst not specifically relevant to this Inquiry -- this  
14 part of the hearing, is to examine the post-incident  
15 management process and the investigation up to but not  
16 including the making by the Lord Advocate of the  
17 prosecutorial decision communicated to the family, and  
18 it also says in brackets:

19 "... (and the victim's right to review process that  
20 was undertaken by the Crown counsel in 2019 including  
21 (1), the effectiveness of procedures for gathering and

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 analysing information et cetera)..."

2 In this particular report what I would like to deal  
3 with this witness is some restrictions in the report,  
4 for example the methodology, the questions that were  
5 asked and the broadness of those questions, the  
6 documentation, just to check that he didn't receive any  
7 information on audio, such as Airwaves -- he was given  
8 some visuals only -- and very importantly, in light of  
9 the evidence that he has given about the mechanisms of  
10 energy and efficacy and whether or not something was an  
11 assault which was severe and most effective, whether or  
12 not he was given any information on Mr Sheku Bayoh  
13 himself, because it doesn't appear from the  
14 documentation that that happened.

15 And then take him to the fact that there doesn't  
16 appear to be any discussions, as was explored in  
17 evidence, about outdoor shoes or the vest or repeated  
18 stamps, or again the height, weight or fitness of  
19 Mr Sheku Bayoh, and to ask him about the part of his  
20 statement where he says:

21 "I don't think I was questioned on the report. It's

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 very common for solicitors to seek clarification of  
2 certain points, or if there are any factual  
3 inaccuracies."

4 And ask whether or not he can recall anyone from  
5 Crown Office coming back to him to ask him about any of  
6 these things and those would be my questions.

### Ruling

7  
8 LORD BRACADALE: Thank you. In relation to the first issue  
9 it seems to me that I will have all that evidence  
10 available to me and I don't consider it would assist for  
11 this to be further explored with this witness. It can  
12 be addressed in closing submissions in relation to the  
13 whole evidence.

14 In relation to the second matter, that's really  
15 a matter for the later hearing and I don't want to  
16 embark on that with this witness at this stage. It may  
17 be that the exploration of that issue by the Inquiry  
18 will lead it back to this witness, but I wouldn't wish  
19 to explore that with him at this stage, so I shall not  
20 allow any questioning further of this witness.

21 MS MITCHELL: I'm obliged, and I'm obviously obliged



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 the court indicating that at some future point this may  
2 need to be revisited. The question of the family's  
3 contact with the Crown and the VRR and what the Crown  
4 did thereafter is obviously a critical issue so --

5 LORD BRACADALE: Well, it's a matter -- the whole conduct of  
6 the Crown is a matter of great interest to the Inquiry.  
7 Thank you.

8 Could we have the witness back now, please?

9 (Pause).

10 Dr Crawford, thank you very much for coming to give  
11 evidence to the Inquiry. I'm going to rise very briefly  
12 so that the next witness can be brought in. When that  
13 happens, you will be free to go.

14 A. Thank you very much.

15 (11.00 am)

16 (Short Break)

17

18 (11.03 am)

19 LORD BRACADALE: Now, Ms Grahame, who is the next witness?

20 MS GRAHAME: The next witness is Ms Jane Combe.

21 LORD BRACADALE: Good morning, Ms Combe.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Good morning.

2 LORD BRACADALE: Would you take the oath, please, if you  
3 raise your hand.

4 MS JANE COMBE (sworn)

5 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Grahame.

6 Questions from MS GRAHAME

7 MS GRAHAME: Thank you.

8 Good morning. Is it Ms Combe or Ms Combe?

9 A. Combe.

10 Q. Combe, thank you. I will try to get that right  
11 throughout. As everyone here knows, I have an issue  
12 with names at times.

13 You are a former police inspector?

14 A. I am.

15 Q. And what age are you?

16 A. 52.

17 Q. And you have been retired from the police force as  
18 I understand it for about three years, is that right?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. But when you were working, you worked mainly in Fife?

21 A. I did.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

- 1 Q. And you had various inspector roles. You were first  
2 promoted to inspector in 2010, is that correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And you were posted to Kirkcaldy Police Office at that  
5 time?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Good, thank you. Now, all of your contact details are  
8 known to the Inquiry, so we won't ask you to say those  
9 here. What I want to do, first of all, is to make sure  
10 that you've got everything that you might need in front  
11 of you, so as we go through your evidence you've got  
12 hard copies. So you can see the black folder and what  
13 you -- I will take you through what should be in there,  
14 so when I'm maybe referring to a paragraph or  
15 a particular section, it should come up on the screen in  
16 front of you and so we will be able to see maybe  
17 a paragraph, but if you want to look around that you've  
18 got the hard copy and you please refer to it.
- 19 A. Thank you.
- 20 Q. And at any time if you wish to refer me to something you  
21 would like to speak to, let me know and I can get that

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 brought up on the screen as well.

2 So the first thing I want to talk about is PIRC 190  
3 which I believe is an operational statement dated  
4 15 May 2015, and if that can be brought up on the  
5 screen. We will see your name and the date it was taken  
6 was 15 May 2015 at 9.00 in the morning and it says  
7 "Self", so you prepared this yourself?

8 A. I did.

9 Q. And this was after the events of 3 May 2015.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And you prepared this in Cowdenbeath. Were you based in  
12 Cowdenbeath at the time?

13 A. Yes, that's where I was stationed at the time.

14 Q. Right. And were you doing your best on 15 May to give  
15 a true and accurate record of what you had done on  
16 3 May?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Thank you. Can we look at paragraph 66 of your Inquiry  
19 statement -- we will look at the first page first. We  
20 will see this is your Inquiry statement. It was taken  
21 by a member of the team on 22 March this year?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And then if we can look at paragraph 66 you say:

3 "My operational statement ..."

4 Which is the one we were looking at a moment ago of

5 15 May:

6 "... would be the one that's most clear and I stand  
7 by that because I gave that shortly after the event."

8 A. That's correct.

9 Q. So this was the first statement prepared by you after  
10 the events of 3 May.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And then can we look at the end of Inquiry statement,  
13 the last paragraphs, paragraph 125, and it says:

14 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
15 statement are true. I understand that this statement  
16 may form part of the evidence before the Inquiry and be  
17 published on the Inquiry's website."

18 And in light of that you signed the pages of this  
19 Inquiry statement?

20 A. I did.

21 Q. And although on the screen you will see it is redacted,

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 I believe the hard copy you have should have your  
2 electronic signature.

3 A. Yes, on all pages.

4 Q. Thank you. And that was signed by you on 18 May this  
5 year.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Thanks. And then can we also confirm that you were  
8 doing your best when you gave this statement to the  
9 Inquiry to be truthful and accurate in everything you  
10 mentioned?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And then can we look at a statement dated 8 March 2018,  
13 so this is almost three years after the events, and this  
14 is PIRC 191. Again, at the top we should see your name,  
15 we can just see your name, Jane, there we are, and then  
16 we see it's dated 8 March 2018, 10.10 hours, and it was  
17 noted by investigating officer Neil Duncan and the place  
18 was at Cupar. Where you based at Cupar by 2018?

19 A. I was, yes.

20 Q. Thank you. And again, when you gave this statement was  
21 this to PIRC, Police Information and Review Commission

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           officers?

2           A. Yes.

3           Q. And you were doing your best again, three years later,  
4           to give a true and accurate record of what you had  
5           done --

6           A. Yes.

7           Q. -- on 3 May 2015. Can we look at paragraphs in your  
8           Inquiry statement again please, 65 and 66 and 67. Let's  
9           start with 65, and you are talking about the different  
10          statements that you have given and you say:

11                 "The second was taken by PIRC who interviewed me on  
12                 8 March 2018 ... they came to see me at Cupar ... I told  
13                 them the truth ..."

14                 And then in paragraph 66, which we looked at  
15                 a moment ago, you say:

16                 "My PIRC statement will be less clear, likewise my  
17                 later statement provided, given the passage of time. In  
18                 2018 my recollection of that incident will be the same  
19                 as it is now. By 'clear' I mean my recollection would  
20                 not be affected by what I have seen in the media,  
21                 particularly the Panorama programme and media

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 reporting."

2 So it's something that you have kept an eye on in  
3 the media, or been aware of?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And then paragraph 67:

6 "The content of both statements are exactly the same  
7 other than the addition in the PIRC statement regarding  
8 the contact with the force medical examiner (FME).

9 I don't see any difference in the content of my first  
10 statement and my second statement. The only addendum  
11 they have put in there is the contact with the FME, and  
12 if I could remember any conversation with Nicole Short.  
13 I don't think there's any other difference. If there is  
14 a difference I stand by my operational statement because  
15 it was produced closer to the time."

16 To help the Chair really it's the operational  
17 statement, the first statement, that you think is  
18 clearer and the most accurate?

19 A. Yes, definitely.

20 Q. Thank you. So if the Chair thinks there's any  
21 difference between later statements, or your Inquiry



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 statement, or even your evidence today, if there's  
2 a difference between what you have said and your first  
3 statement, he should prefer your first one?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Thank you. Lovely. Can I also ask you about  
6 paragraph 68 of your Inquiry statement and you say:

7 "I've also been interviewed numerous times as well  
8 by the officers working on behalf of the  
9 police officers. A Mr John Sallens and somebody else as  
10 well, during COVID, they have also been in contact. So  
11 I have given a statement, it's the same statement and  
12 I've never changed it."

13 So we have heard the name of John Sallens previously  
14 from others; do you know who Mr Sallens is?

15 A. No. I know that he was working obviously on behalf of  
16 the solicitors for the police officers but I don't know.

17 Q. Right. And when did you give him a statement or speak  
18 to him?

19 A. That was just when COVID began, so probably  
20 about March 2020, about that time.

21 Q. So that's roughly when we went into lockdown, around

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           about that time?

2           A. Yes, just at lockdown.

3           Q. Just then. Do you know what happened to that statement?

4           A. No.

5           Q. But that was a later statement than your original

6           operational statement and your PIRC statement?

7           A. Yes.

8           Q. Thank you. What sort of things was he asking you about

9           at that time in 2020?

10          A. Just exactly the same: can I recall what happened on

11          that day, did I have any conversations with the

12          officers, did I have any conversation with Nicole Short

13          and that's what I could remember from him.

14          Q. All right, thank you. Do you still have a copy of that

15          statement, or was that only in the hands of Mr Sallens?

16          A. Mr Sallens' statement? No, it was dictated and then

17          they took that to be typed up but I've never seen that

18          statement.

19          Q. Right, thank you. And you also talk about being

20          interviewed numerous times. Were there other people who

21          interviewed you?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. No, I think it was just Mr Sallens. I went into Police  
2 Headquarters and then he was in contact via telephone so  
3 that's what I mean by numerous times, but it was the  
4 same person about the same statement.
- 5 Q. So PIRC interviewed you, the Inquiry team have  
6 interviewed you and Mr Sallens has spoken to you as  
7 well?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Thank you. And he spoke to you said at Police  
10 Headquarters, is that --
- 11 A. Sorry, Glenrothes Police Headquarters, Fife Division  
12 Police Headquarters.
- 13 Q. Fife Division Police Headquarters. And again, that's  
14 where you were based?
- 15 A. No, I was retired by that time.
- 16 Q. Oh, I see.
- 17 A. There was an arrangement for me to go in.
- 18 Q. Thank you. Are you happy you've got everything that you  
19 would need in front of you today?
- 20 A. Yes, thank you.
- 21 Q. Good. Can I ask you about paragraphs 37 to 47 in your

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Inquiry statement, and the Chair can read through all of  
2 these paragraphs himself, but you're talking here about  
3 police culture and what it was to you and how it has  
4 changed over the years, and you talk about it being very  
5 different in 1991 to how it is today and I think I'm  
6 very interested in your impressions of police culture in  
7 2015.

8 A. It depends on which you mean by police culture. I mean,  
9 I was asked that question, I didn't evoke that, I didn't  
10 say I wanted to speak about that, so I was asked about  
11 police culture, and for me, it's just the parameters of  
12 an organisation, what we work within and what we think  
13 is acceptable. We're obviously different from the fire  
14 service, the police, education, but it has changed and  
15 we are evolving all the time.

16 Q. Right. Can we move the screen up then and just have  
17 a look. So you have talked about the difference between  
18 working in a more urban area like Kirkcaldy where there  
19 are more officers and maybe more violence, compared to  
20 someone maybe in more of a rural area?

21 A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. And is that the sort of thing that can make a difference  
2 to culture and the way police officers act in a police  
3 station?

4 A. No, not necessarily, because every police officer should  
5 deal with the situation as they find them on that time.

6 Q. Right. And you have said at paragraph 40:

7 "Compared to somebody up in St Andrews or Cupar  
8 where I actually started my service you had to take  
9 a different approach because your back up was maybe  
10 10/15 miles away."

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. "Whereas in Kirkcaldy, if required and appropriate,  
13 officers could take a more robust approach, however  
14 officers should always adopt a policing style relevant  
15 to the situation."

16 And so is this an issue about the support available  
17 and how close --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. -- or how much time it would take?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. -- for officers to have back up and support?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Less immediate in a rural area; more immediate in an  
3 urban area?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Is that fair to say?

6 A. That's my experience.

7 Q. But as you say, every policing style or every tactical  
8 option adopted by a police officer will depend on the  
9 particular circumstances that they're faced with?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And then you talk at paragraph 41 about not advocating  
12 arresting individuals in a large crowd, and it can  
13 escalate a situation. Is that something that you were  
14 always conscious of, not to escalate situations or make  
15 them worse --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. -- but is de-escalating situations something that  
18 officers consider on a regular basis?

19 A. On a daily basis.

20 Q. What does it mean to you to de-escalate a situation?  
21 How would you achieve that?

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1       A. Well, obviously the example I was asked and I was given  
2       was in a football crowd you wouldn't go in and arrest  
3       someone there because you put the officers more at risk  
4       and the public, so you would take an appropriate time,  
5       whether that was them leaving the stadium, or if you  
6       knew their identity you could get them at a later date,  
7       and obviously, if that was a domestic situation you  
8       would try and separate both parties. So officers have  
9       a lot of things in their toolkit they can use to  
10      de-escalate, communication being the priority one.

11      Q. So officers can bide their time --

12      A. Yes.

13      Q. -- pick their moment, depending on the circumstances  
14      when it is appropriate.

15      A. Yes.

16      Q. And they can communicate. We have heard a lot of  
17      evidence from officers talking about your voice is  
18      actually a tool in your armoury --

19      A. Yes.

20      Q. -- that you can always be trying to communicate with  
21      people and that can be an effective technique for

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 de-escalating a situation?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And you would agree with that?

4 A. 100%.

5 Q. Thank you. And then if we move up the screen you talk  
6 about -- at paragraph 42, talking about negotiation  
7 tactics and "talking people down". Is that what you  
8 mean by de-escalating?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Right. And you say 43:

11 "I would expect any officer to adopt a tactic  
12 correct for the situation they are faced with."

13 But the location can be an important factor in that?

14 A. It can be.

15 Q. So you have talked about football stadiums, a lot of  
16 fans present, you talked about urban areas, rural areas,  
17 it can be an important factor?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. We have heard evidence from a number of people about the  
20 National Decision-Making Model. Is that something you  
21 were aware of before you retired?



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And we have heard that you are feeding in new  
3 information, information about all the circumstances,  
4 and that could include things like location and the  
5 incident?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And then you're working out your tactical options and  
8 the more information, the new information you get in you  
9 review -- is that the type of thing that you're doing  
10 all the time?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Thank you. And you then, at paragraph 44, talk about:

13 "In an urban area assistance is more readily  
14 available."

15 And again, that's about the level of support that  
16 may be available to officers at any time?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Thank you. And then looking further down, you again  
19 repeat it's the situation you're faced with and you have  
20 mentioned Alan Smith. We have heard from PC Smith and  
21 you were aware of him?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes, he was one of my officers.

2 Q. So you were actually his inspector, were you?

3 A. No, I think I was his sergeant at that time.

4 Q. Right. And we have heard from PC Smith that he was  
5 a trainer and first aid trained and the Chair has heard  
6 his evidence so ... and then 47 you have also had the  
7 benefit of working in London alongside the Met.

8 A. I did, yes.

9 Q. So that's a very built up and urban area; it's quite  
10 different again from Kirkcaldy.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And you have talked there about:  
13 "Officers cannot afford to alienate themselves  
14 because potentially they could have their property  
15 damaged."  
16 Can I just ask you about that paragraph.

17 A. The point I think I was trying to make there is it's  
18 a very different policing style, certainly in Fife  
19 Division, when I was there, the officers actually live  
20 in the community, so they're actually part of the  
21 community, so the approach that I have witnessed down in

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           the Metropolitan Police or some of the larger police  
2           forces down south was a different style of policing in  
3           my opinion.

4           Q. I would imagine -- and you can tell me if I'm wrong  
5           about this, that in London you could maybe meet someone  
6           one year and not see them again --

7           A. Yes.

8           Q. -- for many years, if at all?

9           A. Yes.

10          Q. But maybe that is less likely to happen in a town like  
11          Kirkcaldy?

12          A. Yes.

13          Q. Thank you. And that may also be a factor in how you  
14          police the community?

15          A. Yes.

16          Q. And we have heard some evidence about how important it  
17          is for the police to have support from the community and  
18          engagement with the community --

19          A. Yes.

20          Q. -- in which they are working. Can I ask you about  
21          paragraph 48, please. You have been asked a number of

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           questions about race and you have said you have never  
2           heard any of the officers subject to this Inquiry saying  
3           anything with a racial overtone, and I'm interested in  
4           whether you have ever seen or heard anything from any of  
5           the officers with a racial undertone?

6           A. No.

7           Q. No. So both overtones and under --

8           A. Yes.

9           Q. -- not just blatant things, but maybe more subtle  
10          things?

11          A. No, nothing.

12          Q. You have not seen anything like that?

13          A. No.

14          Q. And do you think that officers would tone things down if  
15          they're in the presence of an inspector, that's a senior  
16          rank in the police?

17          A. Potentially, but when you're walking about the corridors  
18          you can overhear conversations you maybe shouldn't  
19          overhear.

20          Q. And partly I would imagine as an inspector your job is  
21          to be aware of what's happening with your team?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Now, I think you have said you have -- at 49 you have  
3 worked in the alcohol and violence reduction unit?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And your role was to engage with all communities?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And I'm interested in what engagement over the years you  
8 had with the black community, if I can phrase it that  
9 way?
- 10 A. There wasn't a large black community in Kirkcaldy, or  
11 actually in Fife, but they were part of the larger  
12 ethnic minority, so we went to open days, seminars,  
13 mosque visits, engagement with youth, having some of the  
14 ethnic minority youths come into the police station, so  
15 we actually worked quite closely with them.
- 16 Q. And can you tell me sort of roughly when was it you were  
17 working with all these communities?
- 18 A. That would be 2000 and -- probably 2014 to 2018, about  
19 that time.
- 20 Q. And when you say you were visiting and having open days  
21 and attending those --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- how big a part of your role at that time was visiting  
3 with communities and attending events?

4 A. It was quite a large part of that role.

5 Q. Would you be able to assist the Chair and say how  
6 regular those visits were? Was it weekly, or was it  
7 monthly?

8 A. It actually depended on what events they were actually  
9 arranging because we were invited along as guests so it  
10 was dictated by the communities when the police were  
11 actually invited as guests to that, and then obviously  
12 if there were any community messages that were needed to  
13 be put out, we also did that. Latterly we had a really  
14 good system in Fife where we could actually just send  
15 an email. I think there was always this mystique that  
16 we always had to go on prayer day on a Friday, but we  
17 actually engaged with the community and they said that  
18 wasn't appropriate, they felt they were businessmen,  
19 they went to prayers, they wanted to get away, so it was  
20 hindering them, so we actually listened to the community  
21 and we were able to put out this messaging service that

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           we used quite regularly in Fife.
- 2           Q. So that was through better communication?
- 3           A. Yes, listening to the community.
- 4           Q. And then adapting your approach to suit the messages  
5           that you were getting from the community?
- 6           A. Yes.
- 7           Q. And you have talked about a community message on  
8           a Friday. Can you just explain what that is?
- 9           A. Well, for example, if Police Scotland or the wider  
10          police community wanted to put a message out for  
11          security, that would be a letter or something from the  
12          Chief Constable to be delivered, so we would have to do  
13          that, but that was only if and when it was required.
- 14          Q. Was that a personal visit by you with the message?
- 15          A. No, as I said, they didn't want that personal -- they  
16          said "Yes, by all means you can come in, you're  
17          welcome", but they were actually quite happy then to get  
18          that as a leaflet drop.
- 19          Q. A leaflet drop or emails you mentioned as well?
- 20          A. Yes.
- 21          Q. And you've said you were quite close to the black

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 community, small as it was. Can you tell me about your  
2 connection with the black community?

3 A. Well, they obviously had what were called Frae Fife and  
4 we actually had some of the members of Frae Fife who  
5 would actually come in and assist us with some police  
6 inputs.

7 Q. We have heard very limited evidence about Frae Fife. It  
8 has been mentioned to the Chair. Could you tell us  
9 a bit more about it in your -- the experience you had.

10 A. The experience I had was that they were sort of an  
11 interface, if you want to call it that, with the ethnic  
12 community, so they had the relationship with the police,  
13 if they had any issues they could come to us, kind of  
14 ask about things like that.

15 Q. Tell me about the organisation itself. Did it have  
16 people in charge, or leaders or --

17 A. From my knowledge -- I'm not an expert on Frae Fife,  
18 I think it was like trustees and they had, like,  
19 a manager and then they had volunteers who worked with  
20 them, but I can't give comment on it because I don't  
21 exactly know how they were structured.



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

- 1 Q. No, I'm only interested in your impression at the time.  
2 But you did have contact with them?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Thank you. And were you aware at that time about any  
5 concerns that the black community had or Frae Fife had  
6 about policing of black people in Kirkcaldy?
- 7 A. No. The concerns they had were the same as any of the  
8 communities in Fife, was the time police took to  
9 respond, the lack of communication that we gave them, so  
10 that was across all communities in Fife, that wasn't  
11 just with our black communities, but they did have  
12 concerns but, as I said, there was nothing just  
13 specifically to them.
- 14 Q. Can you remember now what the concerns were about  
15 communication with Police Scotland? Was there anything  
16 specific that you can remember?
- 17 A. No, nothing specific.
- 18 Q. And do you -- you obviously personally had a lot of  
19 contact.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. What about other officers in Kirkcaldy? Did they have

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 contact with the black community, or with Frae Fife?
- 2 A. It wouldn't be unless it was their specialism, but a lot  
3 of the community officers, as part of their role, if the  
4 meeting or the event was -- when they were on duty they  
5 would go -- and to their credit a lot of officers  
6 actually went to these events actually off-duty.
- 7 Q. And can you explain what is a community officer compared  
8 to an ordinary police constable, if I can say,  
9 a non-community officer?
- 10 A. I would explain it as a community officer has  
11 responsibility for a certain area, so they could build  
12 up that rapport, whether it's business or with schools.  
13 Whereas a response officer doesn't have that luxury, if  
14 you want to call it that, and they have to respond to  
15 all the incidents coming in. Whereas a community  
16 officer, usually they can put things in their diary, so  
17 they have more time to spend on an incident.
- 18 Q. And so that's the distinction there: the response  
19 officer and the community officer.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And is a community officer based in a particular

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 location for longer to allow them to build a rapport?

2 A. Usually.

3 Q. So a response officer may be moved about?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Paragraph 50, please. You have talked about:

6 "Following the tragic incident, there were concerns  
7 that there could be a negative and adverse reaction from  
8 the ethnic minority community in Fife and a breakdown in  
9 our engagement with these communities which could  
10 manifest in demonstration and protest. However due to  
11 the continued position community engagement and  
12 dialogue, this was avoided."

13 A. I think that should read "Positive".

14 Q. "Positive community engagement", thank you. So we can  
15 amend that. So:

16 "... due to the continued positive community  
17 engagement and dialogue, this was avoided. Meetings  
18 took place with community leaders where any concerns  
19 could be addressed and discussed."

20 I would like to ask you about this paragraph. So  
21 what was the continued positive community engagement

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that you're referring to?

2           A. Well, after the event there was actually a meeting which  
3           was chaired and all the community leaders were invited  
4           to come to that meeting to see if they had any concerns  
5           that they wanted to raise.

6           Q. And do you remember now when that meeting took place?

7           A. No, I couldn't give you a date, but it was quite close  
8           after the incident.

9           Q. So some time after 3 May 2015?

10          A. Yes. I would say it would be in May, no later  
11          than June, but I couldn't give you a date, sorry.

12          Q. Where did that meeting take place?

13          A. In -- I think it's still called Dunnikier House Hotel in  
14          Kirkcaldy.

15          Q. Is that in the centre of Kirkcaldy?

16          A. On the outskirts.

17          Q. On the outskirts. And then who was it that arranged  
18          that meeting?

19          A. I don't know who arranged it, but it would be somebody  
20          from the management team in police -- in Fife Division.

21          Q. So it was Police Scotland that arranged it?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And were you present at that meeting?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you have talked about community leaders being  
5 invited. Tell me who was invited?

6 A. I couldn't give you a list of who was invited, but it  
7 would be the Imam, business owners, anyone who had,  
8 I would say, influence in the community, so members of  
9 Frae Fife, Fife Equality, they would have representation  
10 there as well.

11 Q. So someone in Police Scotland -- we may be able to get  
12 more information about this --

13 A. Possibly.

14 Q. -- someone in Police Scotland would have selected a list  
15 of people to invite?

16 A. The invite would go out and then they would respond who  
17 would come.

18 Q. Was it invitation only, or was it a meeting open to all?

19 A. I can't recall.

20 Q. Were there -- was it advertised in any way more  
21 publicly?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           A. I don't know.

2           Q. And who was responsible, if you know, or if you don't  
3           know, tell me, who was responsible for selecting the  
4           invitees?

5           A. I don't know.

6           Q. Right. And do you know anything about how they were  
7           identified?

8           A. No.

9           Q. Do you remember what concerns, if any, were addressed or  
10          discussed at that meeting?

11          A. No.

12          Q. Not now. And it may be the view that the idea of  
13          community leaders, as an amorphous body, if you like, is  
14          quite an outdated view of how to engage with a community  
15          such as the black community, that there are no longer  
16          community leaders as such. Do you have any views on  
17          that at all?

18          A. No, I think going back to 2015 you've got to use what  
19          communication you have and for the police that was our  
20          method of communicating with them, but I do recall there  
21          were some very young men at that meeting, so they

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           wouldn't be the leaders, so they were obviously there as  
2           part of the community because with the age group of  
3           them, they couldn't have been the community leaders.

4           Q. So it's not that you excluded all apart from the  
5           community leaders?

6           A. No.

7           Q. There were other younger people present as well.

8           A. So I think what I'm trying to get over there, the invite  
9           would go to the community leaders and then they would  
10          actually publicise this meeting and they would bring  
11          along with them who they would bring along.

12          Q. So they would disseminate information more widely --

13          A. Yes, yes.

14          Q. -- amongst the people they knew or the groups they had  
15          contact with.

16                 Do you remember -- you have said there that concerns  
17                 could be addressed and discussed. Do you remember if  
18                 there were -- you know, we hear about action points  
19                 after meetings where people go and resolve things that  
20                 have been raised, concerns that have been raised. Do  
21                 you remember if there were any action points?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. No, not after this length of time, sorry.

2 Q. No. You have -- as part of the -- can we go up  
3 slightly. Paragraph 51:

4 "I have been asked if I know why there was not any  
5 kind of reaction from the community to the Sheku Bayoh  
6 incident as I have described. My own perception is  
7 because the local community trusted the police. There  
8 wasn't the perception of 'a big cover-up' by the police  
9 in Kirkcaldy or Police Scotland."

10 And that was your perception at the time?

11 A. That was my perception, yes.

12 Q. And that was based on the contact you had had with the  
13 community --

14 A. And the fact there were no demonstrations or protests,  
15 bar one that I'm aware of.

16 Q. What was the one you were aware of?

17 A. When the family had come to Kirkcaldy Police Station,  
18 but that, for me, was very peaceful, very dignified,  
19 more like a vigil as opposed to a demonstration.

20 Q. Right. And that was organised by the family?

21 A. I believe so.



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. You say more of a vigil?

2 A. Yes. There was no hostility, it wouldn't be  
3 a demonstration -- what I would class as  
4 a demonstration.

5 Q. So when we're thinking about any reaction from the  
6 community, or in particular from the family, it wasn't  
7 any sort of noisy --

8 A. No.

9 Q. -- difficult demonstration --

10 A. No.

11 Q. -- that -- was that at Kirkcaldy Police Office?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you have said the local community trusted  
14 the police?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Was that the local black community?

17 A. All community.

18 Q. All the community?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Can we look at paragraph 52, first of all, and 53. 52:  
21 "When I was in the job, I was the type of person, if

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 I thought somebody had done something wrong, I would  
2 stand up and say it. I was never one of those ones who  
3 wouldn't. I said it how it was and wasn't frightened of  
4 that. I have challenged senior officers at times. So,  
5 if there was something that was wrong, I would say it  
6 was wrong. I wasn't frightened of that. I wasn't  
7 frightened of my organisation. There was sexism and  
8 things like that, but as I say, as far as officers under  
9 my command being really racist, no, never saw that.  
10 Sexism, homophobia? Yeah, definitely, there was that,  
11 there were issues.

12 "53. I have been asked if there was sexism and  
13 homophobia, would I be expecting also for there to be  
14 racism. I'm not saying I wouldn't expect that. I'm not  
15 saying that that didn't exist in Fife Constabulary or  
16 Police Scotland officers. I'm not naive enough to say  
17 that. Did I witness anybody being treated differently  
18 because of race? No. Did I witness somebody different  
19 because they were gay or lesbian? Yes, I did witness  
20 that. If they were a female, were they treated  
21 differently? Yes, I did witness that."

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1                   Can I ask you a couple more questions about this.
- 2       A.   Yes.
- 3       Q.   So paragraph 52, first of all.  You're talking about
- 4           being willing to stand up and say something and
- 5           challenge.  We have heard evidence about the ranks of
- 6           officers in the hierarchy and I have asked other
- 7           officers about did they feel uncomfortable maybe
- 8           challenging a more senior officer, or a more experienced
- 9           officer and your -- as I understand your statement,
- 10          you're saying you weren't shy to do that?
- 11       A.   No.
- 12       Q.   It must have taken quite a lot of courage to do that,
- 13          however.
- 14       A.   If it was the right thing to do, it was the right thing
- 15          to do.
- 16       Q.   Right, so you had that courage to speak up?
- 17       A.   Yes.
- 18       Q.   And you have said that you had seen issues of racism and
- 19          homophobia?
- 20       A.   No, not racism.
- 21       Q.   Oh, sorry, sorry, sexism and homophobia and had you had

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           cause to challenge that type of behaviour?
- 2           A. Yes. You're going back to when I first joined the job,  
3           that's the point I'm making, it's a totally different  
4           organisation than it was in 1991.
- 5           Q. So that's examples from the early 90s?
- 6           A. Yes.
- 7           Q. Not from 2015?
- 8           A. No. Very few now in 2015.
- 9           Q. Very few?
- 10          A. Yes, we have open officers or openly gay, that would  
11          never have happened in 1991.
- 12          Q. I see. And we have heard that there were women working  
13          in Kirkcaldy Police Office in 2015?
- 14          A. Yes. A lot now.
- 15          Q. Even more now maybe?
- 16          A. Yes.
- 17          Q. We have heard evidence that there were no black officers  
18          in Kirkcaldy in 2015?
- 19          A. Not in Kirkcaldy.
- 20          Q. No. Do you remember them anywhere else?
- 21          A. There was one black officer who worked in the west of

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Fife but I couldn't give you his date of joining.

2 Q. Right. And when you say the west of Fife what --

3 A. Dunfermline. Dunfermline, Cowdenbeath.

4 Q. Dunfermline, right. Do you remember his name?

5 A. Yes. Do I need to --

6 Q. No, no, you don't need to say it out loud if you don't

7 want to. So there was one in Dunfermline; anywhere else

8 in Fife?

9 A. Yes, we've got a senior ranking officer who started her

10 service in Fife as well who is a black officer.

11 Q. And where was she based?

12 A. She moved about so I don't know where she would be in

13 2015.

14 Q. Right, okay. So these examples that you had come across

15 of sexism and homophobia were in the early 90s?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. But you have said -- you have used the phrase there --

18 let me just see if I can find it "really racist",

19 I think I saw that somewhere. Second bottom line in 52:

20 "There was sexism and things like that but, as

21 I say, as far as officers under my command being really

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 racist, no, never saw that."

2 So under your command -- you have said you were an  
3 inspector from 2010?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So is that when you began to command officers at that  
6 stage?

7 A. You could say you started that as a sergeant or even  
8 a senior officer but if you're talking about middle  
9 management that would be 2010.

10 Q. That would be 2010. So we're looking at a period from  
11 2010 and you say:

12 "As far as officers under my command being really  
13 racist, no, I never saw that."

14 What do you mean --

15 A. I don't know what I mean by "really racist", I don't  
16 know if that's a typing error. "Really racist", I don't  
17 know.

18 Q. We can check that, because we've got recordings  
19 obviously of all these things. So looking at it now, do  
20 you understand what you -- if you did say that --

21 A. No.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. -- do you understand what you meant?
- 2 A. No, just racist full stop, being racist.
- 3 Q. And can you remember any examples when you were
- 4 commanding officers of racism, whether overt or
- 5 covert --
- 6 A. No, none.
- 7 Q. Nothing like that?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. But you do say -- you're not suggesting that it didn't
- 10 exist in Fife Constabulary, you're not naive enough to
- 11 say that, so you're not suggesting that Kirkcaldy Police
- 12 Office was a haven of --
- 13 A. No, utopia, no.
- 14 Q. Thank you. Can I ask you about paragraph 55, please.
- 15 You were asked about the media. And you say when it was
- 16 Fife Constabulary -- so this is before it became
- 17 Police Scotland?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. "... the local inspector could be expected to speak to
- 20 the local reporter, local radio, but then when we went
- 21 to Police Scotland everything went there you a media

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 department."

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. So the handling or the engagement with the media became  
4 centralised?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. After April 2013?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you say:

9 "If a reporter arrived looking for a comment at an  
10 incident, the correct procedure would be to direct them  
11 to the media department."

12 And you say:

13 "I'd be really surprised if a reporter would phone  
14 the station. They would just be directed to the Police  
15 Press Office. They would know that."

16 So is that what the centralised department was  
17 called, the police press office?

18 A. Media department, yes.

19 Q. The media department.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Now, what about people who had obviously worked for Fife



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           Constabulary prior to it becoming Police Scotland: they  
2           had maybe built up good relationships, professional  
3           working relationships with members of the press and  
4           would that contact continue even after the media  
5           department was put in place?

6           A. No, not to my knowledge.

7           Q. Not to your knowledge. So although you have talked  
8           about -- you were obviously an inspector prior to 2013  
9           when it became Police Scotland?

10          A. Yes.

11          Q. And you had been expected as part of that role to have  
12          that engagement with the media. After April 2013 did  
13          you continue to have any engagement with the media  
14          yourself?

15          A. I did have engagement with the media but it came through  
16          our media department, it was arranged and authorised by  
17          them.

18          Q. So it was all done through that media department after  
19          that?

20          A. Yes.

21          Q. And was that part of the sort of rules that you were

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           supposed to abide by?

2           A. It was just a process. It made it easy for everyone  
3           that we knew what the parameters were.

4           Q. And it relieved you of that burden --

5           A. Yes.

6           Q. -- of engaging when you had, no doubt, other duties.

7                     Can I ask you to look at paragraph 70, please, and  
8           then we move on here to 3 May 2015 and you have been  
9           asked if you had a line manager or a senior officer  
10          giving you orders on that date and you say:

11                    "... I had the authority to deploy my officers where  
12          they were required."

13                    Now, can I ask you on 3 May where were you based  
14          that day?

15          A. Cowdenbeath.

16          Q. And how many officers were under your command or you  
17          were in charge of?

18          A. On that day or ...

19          Q. Well, yes, or just in general if --

20          A. My team consisted of two sergeants and 13 officers.

21          Q. Right. So the sergeants would be the more senior --

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. -- members of your team and then the 13 officers -- did  
3 they form part of a response team and community  
4 officers?
- 5 A. No, no. They were a partnership, working in partnership  
6 with other partners, so they didn't fall either in  
7 community or response.
- 8 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about their role?
- 9 A. Their role was to look at violence reduction, community  
10 engagement and we also did youth diversion and when  
11 there was anti-social behaviour we could be deployed for  
12 a period of time to try and address those issues.
- 13 Q. So that sounds like your team were involved in some big  
14 issues?
- 15 A. Yes, could be.
- 16 Q. Not individual incidents, just bigger, broader issues  
17 for Police Scotland?
- 18 A. They could be.
- 19 Q. And can you explain how you became involved with the  
20 Sheku Bayoh incident?
- 21 A. Well, I think all inspectors on duty should be aware of

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 all incidents that are ongoing so from my  
2 recollection -- I wouldn't have been working on the same  
3 radio channel, so I have picked it up from the STORM  
4 incident.

5 Q. Tell us about that?

6 A. Well, a STORM incident is created when an incident is  
7 ongoing and you can look at all the incidents that are  
8 happening in the area.

9 Q. And when you were working in May 2015, is that something  
10 that you would regularly keep on top of?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So you were aware of incidents going on in other police  
13 areas?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And that's how you became aware of the knife calls --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. -- regarding Mr Bayoh.

18 And then can we look at paragraph 71, so you  
19 specifically say there that you were reading from the  
20 STORM call cards. We have heard reference to call  
21 cards, so that's sort of a record, if you like?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes, an incident report.

2 Q. An incident report. And you became aware of the calls  
3 from members of the public at that time and can we then  
4 look at 72 and 73. 73:

5 "I have been asked if it was of my own volition that  
6 I went to help, and that nobody called and asked for  
7 support. Yes. From recollections, my instructions to  
8 my staff would be permission to use blue lights and  
9 sirens to get there. It was a serious incident. With  
10 blue lights and sirens you could get to Kirkcaldy from  
11 Cowdenbeath in under 10 minutes and I arrived around  
12 8am."

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. So when you say you arrived -- you say later in  
15 paragraph 74 "I arrived in Kirkcaldy". Did you arrive  
16 to Kirkcaldy Police Office or Hayfield Road?

17 A. Kirkcaldy Police Office.

18 Q. Thank you. So you were asked if you went of your own  
19 volition and can you tell us a little bit more about  
20 your decision-making process to go and attend.

21 A. Well, I would stand by that, that that was the right

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           decision to do. It was a priority, it was a serious  
2           call where extra resources would have been needed, so  
3           that's where I took my resources. On that day I only  
4           had four officers on.

5           Q. All right, so that day you had four officers -- did you  
6           have two sergeants as well?

7           A. No, just myself.

8           Q. Just yourself and four officers?

9           A. Yes.

10          Q. Did they all go?

11          A. Yes.

12          Q. So all five of you went?

13          A. Yes.

14          Q. And did you all go to Kirkcaldy Police Office?

15          A. Yes.

16          Q. And you have said it was a serious call, a serious  
17          incident; can you tell us what made you view it as  
18          a serious incident?

19          A. Well, the nature of the call, that there was a male  
20          brandishing a knife at members of the public in a public  
21          place.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. Right. And your recollection is that he was brandishing  
2 a knife at members of the public?
- 3 A. That's my working assumption, yes. That was what was on  
4 the call card that I read.
- 5 Q. When you say -- can you look at paragraph 71. You use  
6 that phrase about a working assumption and I wonder if  
7 you can explain to the Chair what that means in reality  
8 in terms of your day-to-day work?
- 9 A. Well, I had no reason to doubt what the members of the  
10 public were phoning in about.
- 11 Q. You weren't listening to the calls, were you? You said  
12 you got that from the STORM?
- 13 A. No, not at that time, but what I would do, my working  
14 practice would be then --
- 15 Q. Sorry, could you stop for a second. Sorry, I missed the  
16 first part of that answer.
- 17 A. I can't 100% say that I did on this day, but my working  
18 practice would have been if I was going to an incident  
19 would be then to put my radio onto the channel where  
20 that incident was.
- 21 Q. Right. So it's drawn to your attention --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- through the STORM call cards?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You could then from your position --

5 A. Move onto that channel.

6 Q. -- move onto the channel and then listen to what was  
7 happening at the time?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And we have heard about Airwaves transmissions and the  
10 calls coming in, so you could actually listen in to  
11 that?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And take a view then about whether you were going to  
14 assist.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So you arrived at Kirkcaldy Police Office at 8.00 am,  
17 you said that in paragraph 73, and in paragraph 74 you  
18 talk about arriving in Kirkcaldy and speaking to  
19 Inspector Stevie Kay in his office:

20 "I would have asked 'where do you want my resources  
21 deployed?'. Inspector Kay would have given directions



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           where they were to go. It is my recollection that  
2           I would deal with all other incidents requiring an  
3           inspector's oversight."

4           So you have turned up with your team at about  
5           8 o'clock and spoken to Inspector Kay?

6           A. Yes.

7           Q. We have heard mention of Inspector Kay. Was he the  
8           person -- a senior officer at Kirkcaldy Police Office  
9           that day?

10          A. Yes, he was the same rank as myself. I don't know  
11          whether Inspector Kay would have actually been based at  
12          Kirkcaldy Police Station at that time or arrived there  
13          because as a police incident officer you could start at  
14          other stations so I can't comment where he actually  
15          started his duty that day.

16          Q. We have not heard from Inspector Kay yet, but we have  
17          heard that he may sometimes have been at Dunfermline but  
18          on this particular day he was in Kirkcaldy.

19          A. Right. My recollection was I spoke to him in the  
20          inspector's office at Kirkcaldy Police Station.

21          Q. In the morning?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. In the morning.

2 Q. And you asked him -- you say:

3 "I would have asked 'where do you want my resources  
4 deployed?'.  
5 That's a reference to you and your team?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And do you remember now what his response was? What did  
8 he ask you and your officers to do?

9 A. No, I don't remember from the Inquiry statement, but if  
10 I go back to my operational statement I have obviously  
11 sent my four officers onto locus protection so that  
12 would be what happened.

13 Q. Right. Let's look at that for a moment. That's the  
14 15 May 2015 statement.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. PIRC 190, and page 2 at the top you talk about arriving  
17 at Kirkcaldy Police Office, contacting the duty police  
18 incident officer, Inspector Kay:

19 "... who requested my team carry out locus  
20 protection duties. My officers were thereafter duly  
21 deployed."

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           So you essentially straight away sent your officers  
2           who were from your team to Hayfield Road?

3           A. Yes.

4           Q. And just briefly for people listening in, do you mind  
5           telling us what locus protection duties are?

6           A. It would be where the incident has actually occurred, so  
7           we would have to secure that area.

8           Q. So will they be helping with things like traffic duties  
9           and taping off areas and things like that?

10          A. Yes, yes, but once the locus -- the location is secured  
11          they shouldn't have to do any traffic duties because it  
12          should be a sterile area.

13          Q. How do you secure an area?

14          A. Like just what we just said, with tape or with  
15          an officer's presence.

16          Q. All right, thank you.

17                 Then if we could go back to the Inquiry statement  
18                 please, paragraph 77 to 80, and let's -- you see 77 you  
19                 later learned that sadly Mr Bayoh had died:

20                 "Senior officers thereafter started to arrive at  
21                 Kirkcaldy Police Office. They took control of this

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 incident. My role thereafter was minimal, I was  
2 requested to act in a support role for Conrad Trickett."

3 And we have heard mention of Conrad Trickett. Was  
4 he the post-incident manager?

5 A. He was.

6 Q. And were you -- in mentioning a support role, we may  
7 have heard from someone else that you were the deputy  
8 post-incident manager?

9 A. No, I wasn't the deputy post-incident manager; I was  
10 a liaison officer.

11 Q. Can you explain the difference, please, between a deputy  
12 post-incident manager and a liaison officer.

13 A. I've never heard the term deputy post-incident manager,  
14 but if you were a deputy manager you would have some  
15 degree of taking the notes, of actually -- in carrying  
16 out, fulfilling that role of the post-incident manager.  
17 My role on that day, and I was very clear about that,  
18 was could I act in a support role for Mr Trickett, so  
19 basically show him about Kirkcaldy Police Station and  
20 getting him anything he needed to fulfil his role.

21 Q. So you were showing him about. You were familiar with

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           Kirkcaldy Police Office at that time?

2           A. Yes.

3           Q. Was he not?

4           A. No, he wasn't a Fife officer.

5           Q. So you were able to tell him where things were and that

6           type of thing?

7           A. Yes.

8           Q. So you saw that as a position of support, a liaison

9           officer.

10          A. Yes, that was my role.

11          Q. So if there's any suggestion anywhere that you had

12          a more formal role as deputy post-incident manager, you

13          would not agree with that?

14          A. No, definitely not.

15          Q. And if somebody had been appointed as a deputy

16          post-incident manager, how do you think -- do you have

17          an understanding of how that would be done?

18          A. No.

19          Q. Were you involved in part of your support role in

20          talking to the police officers who had been at

21          Hayfield Road?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. No.

2 Q. Can we look at the next paragraph. I think you mention  
3 Conrad Trickett there:

4 "He came down and asked would I act as his liaison  
5 officer."

6 You have explained that, and then you say in  
7 paragraph 79:

8 "I have been referred to my statement ..."

9 This is 15 May 2015, so your operational statement:

10 "... at page 2 ..."

11 And it says:

12 "About 1100 [in the morning] same date, I was  
13 requested to act in a support role to the post-incident  
14 manager ... who had been appointed, Chief Inspector  
15 Conrad Trickett'. I have been asked what happened in  
16 the 3 hours in-between arriving and this request.

17 I didn't have any direct supervision of the incident so  
18 would have been supervising any other calls requiring  
19 a police response."

20 I'm interested in maybe getting a little bit more  
21 information about what was happening between you

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 arriving at 8 o'clock and you being appointed to this  
2 liaison officer role or support role to Conrad Trickett  
3 at about 11 o'clock in the morning. Can you help the  
4 Chair understand what was going on then?
- 5 A. I can't obviously say what calls were coming in at that  
6 time without looking back on the STORM command and  
7 control system, but this incident was obviously the  
8 priority, but the very nature of policing there was also  
9 other calls that would come in that the police are  
10 required to respond to and that would be what I would be  
11 diverting my attention to.
- 12 Q. So that would be calls completely unrelated --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. -- to the events at Hayfield Road?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. But you would be holding the fort, if you like, keeping  
17 an eye on those --
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. -- while other things are going on?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And did you have any contact with Inspector Kay during

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           those three hours?
- 2       A. I don't know. I may have been in the same room as him
- 3           because sometimes inspectors would share the phone or
- 4           share the computer systems, but I can't recall.
- 5       Q. And when did you become aware that Mr Bayoh had passed
- 6           away?
- 7       A. I can't give you a time for that. It would be after
- 8           8 o'clock but before 11 o'clock.
- 9       Q. And during that time, do you have any understanding or
- 10          recollection now about who was in charge of what was
- 11          happening at Hayfield Road?
- 12       A. My understanding would be Inspector Stephen Kay until
- 13          the more senior officers arrived.
- 14       Q. And once the officers came back from Hayfield Road --
- 15       A. Yes.
- 16       Q. -- we have heard evidence they came back to the canteen?
- 17       A. They did, yes.
- 18       Q. Did you have an understanding, or even a recollection
- 19          now as to who was in charge once they got back to
- 20          Kirkcaldy Police Office?
- 21       A. That would be Inspector Kay.



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. So in terms of the involvement of Conrad Trickett, he  
2 wasn't in charge at that time?
- 3 A. No, not at that time.
- 4 Q. So his responsibilities began, I think you said, about  
5 11.00 in the morning?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Right, thank you. Can I ask you about recovery of some  
8 items of clothing, paragraph 81:
- 9 "Later that day, I'm not exactly sure of the time,  
10 I was requested if I would corroborate the taking of the  
11 female officers' clothing because they had to strip down  
12 to their underwear."
- 13 And I would like to ask you about the recovery of  
14 clothing, so tell us how you became involved with that  
15 aspect of your --
- 16 A. I was approached by one of the senior investigating  
17 officers who explained they were struggling to secure  
18 the services of another female officer, and they asked  
19 would I be willing to stay on duty and assist with that.
- 20 Q. Right, and this was for the female -- recovery of the  
21 female officers' clothing?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1       A. Yes, yes, primarily. But there were other officers that  
2       we took clothing from as well, male officers.

3       Q. Do you remember who the senior investigating officer was  
4       that asked you to do that?

5       A. If I look back in my statement I think it is DCI Stuart  
6       Houston, that's in my operational statement, second  
7       paragraph -- third paragraph.

8       Q. Third paragraph, about 4 o'clock in the afternoon you  
9       were asked to do that?

10      A. Yes.

11      Q. And tell us who DCI Stuart Houston was?

12      A. I believe he was part of the MIT team.

13      Q. All right. We have heard some reference to the MIT team  
14      and so he approached you. Who was the other female  
15      officer that they had secured?

16      A. I don't know this lady, but from my operational  
17      statement it is DC Jennifer McAulay.

18      Q. Thank you. And you agreed to carry out that task --

19      A. Yes.

20      Q. -- and be part of that process. Can I ask you first of  
21      all before we move on about paragraph 84 and you talk

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 about -- you are asked about the canteen and you say:

2 "I attended at the canteen within Kirkcaldy Police  
3 Office to ensure the welfare of the officers involved.  
4 By the time the officers had all returned to the  
5 canteen, I remember Amanda Givan ... being present."

6 We have heard that she was from the SPF:

7 "The first time I went down was for a duration of  
8 approximately 5 minutes. I can't recall the exact time  
9 I went down there. It was probably mid-morning."

10 So you said the first time you went down was for  
11 about five minutes. Was there a second time you went  
12 down, or more times that I went down?

13 A. No, if you look down then I went back with  
14 Conrad Trickett when he did the first -- the start of  
15 his post-incident management so that would be after  
16 11 o'clock.

17 Q. So is that paragraph --

18 A. 90.

19 Q. -- 90. Let me just see:

20 "I went back to the canteen later with Mr Trickett.  
21 It will be in Mr Trickett's statement because he was

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           documenting his actions. He explained his role in my  
2           presence because the PIM is usually just for a firearms  
3           incident. They actually adapted that to fit this  
4           circumstance. So he explained what his role was to the  
5           officers. I didn't stay in the canteen with the other  
6           officers, I left with Conrad Trickett. Amanda Givan  
7           stayed there as the constant person who was with them.  
8           That was her role as a Federation rep."

9           So does that mean you were there twice in the  
10          canteen?

11         A. Yes.

12         Q. So initially, if we can go back up to the earlier  
13          paragraph, 84, you went into the canteen to ensure the  
14          welfare of the officers involved and you were there  
15          about five minutes?

16         A. For an estimate, give or take.

17         Q. Give or take. And during that time, Amanda Givan was  
18          there?

19         A. Yes.

20         Q. What did you do during the time you were first there?

21         A. When I first went down as I say it was a welfare visit

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           to make sure that officers had refreshments, had coffee  
2           and tea and just to make sure they were all back.

3           Q. So what did you do when you were there, just ask them  
4           about that or check?

5           A. I can't remember exactly what I said, but just to make  
6           sure are they all back, did they need refreshments but  
7           I can't recall my exact wording.

8           Q. Do you remember any specific conversations with any of  
9           the officers?

10          A. I have explained this several times. There was no  
11          conversation. The only way I can describe it is -- I'm  
12          not a doctor, but these officers were in shock. It was  
13          very silent, there was no conversations ongoing with  
14          them, they just sat there very silently.

15          Q. Okay. Then the second time you went, if we can go back  
16          to paragraph 90, so you were present with Mr Trickett?

17          A. Yes.

18          Q. And he was with you at all times then, was he during the  
19          time --

20          A. I stood behind him.

21          Q. You stood behind him. And he had a conversation at that

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           time with the officers who were in the canteen. Did you  
2           say anything that time?
- 3           A. Did I say anything?
- 4           Q. Did you say anything?
- 5           A. No.
- 6           Q. No. And those were the only two times you were in the  
7           canteen?
- 8           A. Yes.
- 9           Q. And do you remember how long you were in the canteen  
10          with Inspector Trickett, Chief Inspector Trickett?
- 11          A. No, but I wouldn't -- again, it wasn't a prolonged  
12          period of time. It will be on his notes.
- 13          Q. If we have heard any evidence that Nicole Short had  
14          a conversation with you at that time about her vest, do  
15          you have any recollection at all about that  
16          conversation?
- 17          A. No, none whatsoever.
- 18          Q. Right, thank you. You do know Nicole Short, I think you  
19          have said in your statement?
- 20          A. I know who she is, yes.
- 21          Q. And she would recognise you, you would recognise her?

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 A. Yes, yes.

2 Q. Can we look at paragraph 94, please, and you were asked  
3 about the FME, Dr Norrie, and you have seen -- you say  
4 you have seen her:

5 "I think I have observed her at Kirkcaldy Police  
6 Station previously but can't recall any dealings with  
7 her. I didn't work in the custody suites; it's more the  
8 custody sergeants and inspectors who would work more  
9 closely with the FME and custody nurses."

10 Now, I think at one point there was a question asked  
11 about whether you had been involved with Dr Norrie, or  
12 shared information with her and I'm not going to go to  
13 that because we heard from Dr Norrie yesterday and she  
14 said she had never had any conversations with you at  
15 all, that the conversations she had had had been with  
16 a nurse who had phoned her to make the arrangements, so  
17 you can put to the back of your mind any suggestion now  
18 that you had a conversation -- I think you were clear in  
19 your recollection you hadn't had a conversation with  
20 her.

21 A. No, but PIRC asked what would I have said to Dr Norrie

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           and I had no reason to dispute what they had said,  
2           I would say the man had a knife.

3           Q. Yes, but Dr Norrie has confirmed that she did not  
4           actually have any direct contact with you on that day.

5                     Right, can I ask you about the seizing of the  
6           clothing and the equipment. Can we look further down,  
7           please, at paragraph -- I think it is 99, seizing  
8           clothing and equipment. So you have referred back to  
9           your previous statement to PIRC and it said:

10                    "From my previous statement ..."

11                    That will be your operational statement:

12                    "... I recall that at about 1808 hours to 1812 hours  
13           that day, Sunday 3rd May 2015, I in the presence of  
14           Detective Constable Jennifer McAulay seized the clothing  
15           and equipment of Police Constable Nicole Short."

16                    And you say:

17                    "I didn't take any clothing, it was DC McAulay --"

18                    We may hear that her name is now DC Bruce:

19                    "... in my presence. I was standing at the door to  
20           make sure no one else would come in and walk in while  
21           she was in her underwear."



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           So you were there actually to just stop people  
2           interrupting?

3           A.   And to corroborate the taking of the clothing.

4           Q.   And to see that she had collected the right clothing  
5           from the right officer?

6           A.   Yes.

7           Q.   And you say you had never met Jennifer, Jennifer McAulay  
8           before:

9           "          She was at Tayside [and] worked in Dundee, I think.  
10          I don't know where she came from but she wasn't a Fife  
11          CID officer."

12          She wasn't someone that you had had any connection  
13          with prior to that?

14          A.   No.

15          Q.   And then further down you say you also provided  
16          reassurance -- officers with reassurance that the  
17          Federation were there to support them.

18          Can I ask when was it that you were providing that  
19          reassurance: was that at the first meeting in the  
20          canteen or later when you were there with Trickett?

21          A.   I think this was from a PIRC interview was when the

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           seizing of clothing was taking place.

2           Q. All right, so it was reassurance to the officers whose  
3           clothing you were seizing?

4           A. Yes.

5           Q. Thank you. Can I ask you to look at the issue about  
6           forensic recovery of clothing. Now, there's been some  
7           evidence about the difference between seizing items and  
8           forensic recovery, and I wonder if you could just help  
9           us by explaining what those distinctions are.

10          A. I think the forensic recovery is to make sure there's no  
11          cross-contamination between the items that are taken,  
12          opposed to just physically seizing the items.

13          Q. Right. And how would officers forensically recover an  
14          item?

15          A. Usually we would use a protective white suit.

16          Q. When you were corroborating the recovery of items, were  
17          you wearing a protective white suit?

18          A. I can't recall that, but if I go to my operational  
19          statement you will actually see that we have actually --  
20          each time we have taken them off, we have taken the  
21          white suit, so that would infer to me I was wearing

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 a white suit, as was DC McAulay, but I can't recall  
2 wearing a white suit.

3 Q. But as part of your normal procedures, forensic recovery  
4 would be wearing a white suit --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- and then removing that --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- and then putting that in with --

9 A. The items.

10 Q. -- collecting that all together?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So that's available for any future forensic analysis?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Thank you. But that's not something that's done if  
15 you're just seizing an item from a police officer?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Thank you. And as we have talked about you wearing  
18 a white suit, would that have been the same for the  
19 other female officer, she would also be wearing a white  
20 suit recovering items?

21 A. DC McAulay?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. Yes, DC McAulay or DC Bruce.

2 A. Yes, I can't recall her actually wearing it, but from my  
3 operational statement, yes, we were both wearing white  
4 suits that were put in the bags.

5 Q. Thank you. Can I ask you to look at paragraph 103  
6 please and you talk about -- this is your Inquiry  
7 statement obviously:

8 "It was 7 years ago. I couldn't remember what was  
9 said but there certainly would have been no dialogue  
10 with them. By this time, I think the females were  
11 getting a wee bit more agitated and upset while their  
12 clothes were taken."

13 So this is you talking about the process of  
14 recovering the items:

15 "Unfortunately I can't remember any conversations  
16 I had with Nicole, either PIRC or Mr Sallens asked me if  
17 I remember Nicole saying to me that she had been stamped  
18 on. I'm not saying she definitely didn't say that, but  
19 I can't remember her saying that to me."

20 So this really reflects your recollection now?

21 A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. And you just don't have any detailed recollection of  
2 that?

3 A. No.

4 Q. And that remains the position today, does it?

5 A. It does.

6 Q. Thank you. Then 104:

7 "I have been referred to my statement to PIRC ..."

8 So that's the second statement at page 2 and 3:

9 "I have been asked and I cannot recall if

10 Nicole Short told me if she had been stamped on or  
11 kicked. I cannot recall if Nicole Short's equipment,  
12 specifically her body armour, had any marks, dirt or  
13 footprints on it, or if she pointed these out to me at  
14 the time. The clothing was not photographed whilst worn  
15 by the officers, nor when removed prior to being bagged  
16 as productions. I have been asked if this is still my  
17 understanding. To the best of my recollection, yes."

18 So I would like to ask you about this paragraph,  
19 please. First of all, the clothing wasn't photographed  
20 whilst worn by the officers. When Nicole Short came in  
21 to have the recovery of her items, was she wearing all

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           of her uniform, or was she carrying some of it?

2           A. I can't recall.

3           Q. No. And do you remember any photographs being taken --

4           A. No.

5           Q. -- obviously not while the examination --

6           A. No.

7           Q. No, not at all?

8           A. Not in my presence.

9           Q. Not in your presence. Would it be normal for

10          photographs to be taken when items are recovered?

11          A. Not usually if you actually have the physical item. You

12          would usually only photograph them initially if you had

13          to hand the item back or it was a large structure you

14          couldn't physically take possession of.

15          Q. All right, thank you. I would like you to look at

16          a vest and this is an actual vest, it's in a package.

17          I won't be asking you to open that, but can you confirm

18          that this is one of the items that you recovered on

19          3 May 2015?

20          A. Yes, that's my signature on the production label.

21          Q. And what item is that?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. That is Nicole Short's vest.
- 2 Q. So that's the vest that you recovered from Nicole Short  
3 after 6 o'clock in the evening on 3 May 2015?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And then we see the photographs on the screen which will  
6 just be brought up, that's photographs of the item.  
7 Now, can we leave it at that photograph please, the  
8 second one on PIRC 01176. Do you see on that photograph  
9 that there is a dark coloured mark --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- on the rear of the police vest?
- 12 A. (Nods).
- 13 Q. Was that mark drawn to your attention by Nicole Short  
14 that day?
- 15 A. Oh, I can't recall that.
- 16 Q. Do you remember seeing that mark?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. Had that mark been drawn to your attention by  
19 Nicole Short that day what would you have said about it?  
20 What would you have done about it?
- 21 A. It depends on the significance of the mark. If I wasn't

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           aware she had been stamped or kicked, a dirty mark on  
2           a piece of police clothing might not be significant, so  
3           it depends on what the significance of that was to me at  
4           that time.

5           Q.   So it would have been up to the individual officer to  
6           draw the significance to your attention if she wanted  
7           anything done about that?

8           A.   Yes, or for someone else -- I'm not saying the officer  
9           had to do that, but if an investigating -- senior  
10          investigating officer was aware that was pivotal to his  
11          enquiry, yes, we would be looking for that.

12          Q.   Thank you.  And if an officer drew the attention of an  
13          inspector to a mark and said "This is significant for  
14          some reason" --

15          A.   Yes, yes.

16          Q.   -- what would the inspector do about that?

17          A.   We would obviously possibly tell the investigating  
18          officer to see -- to make sure we didn't lose that  
19          evidence, to make sure we took all steps to preserve it.

20          Q.   So when you say the investigating officer, would that be  
21          the senior investigating officer?



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. The SIO?

3 A. Yes, SIO.

4 Q. So that would be information, if it was shared, and the  
5 significance of it shared by an officer to an  
6 inspector --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- the inspector could share that with the SIO?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And that would then be dealt with as part of the overall  
11 investigation?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. But your recollection is -- you have no recollection of  
14 that mark and no recollection of anyone saying to you it  
15 was significant?

16 A. Yes, no.

17 Q. Thank you. So would it be possible that an inspector  
18 such as yourself would just say to somebody "Put that  
19 somewhere safe"?

20 A. If you're asking if I personally -- if I knew the  
21 significance of that and said "Just go and put that some

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 place safe", no, I wouldn't have done that.

2 Q. No?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Why wouldn't you have done that?

5 A. Because it's a significant piece of evidence.

6 Q. And if you had had that drawn to your attention, is it  
7 the sort of thing that you might have noted in your  
8 operational statement?

9 A. Yes, and sought clarity over.

10 Q. Thank you. Can I ask you about -- I think it is in your  
11 Inquiry statement but we can discuss this. Can I ask  
12 you about the micro fleece. We hear that  
13 PC Nicole Short was wearing clothing underneath her body  
14 armour, or her vest and one of the things was called  
15 a micro fleece. Can you -- I think you called it -- it  
16 is quite thin material and I'm wondering if you can help  
17 us understand what a micro fleece is. Is it a standard  
18 piece of clothing that's worn by police officers?

19 A. All police officers should wear their standard  
20 authorised clothing but some officers, for different  
21 reasons, may purchase something themselves that they

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           would wear to potentially keep warmer if they needed to,  
2           so I don't know whether you're talking about a police  
3           standard issue micro fleece or one that the officer has  
4           purchased herself to wear on duty.

5           Q. Is a micro fleece something that police officers are  
6           issued with?

7           A. Yes.

8           Q. And is it thin material?

9           A. It is quite thin, yes.

10          Q. Can I ask you about your notebook on 3 May and I think  
11          it's paragraph 117 of your Inquiry statement.

12          I appreciate you weren't at Hayfield Road but what was  
13          your understanding of your obligations in relation to  
14          completion of notebook entries in May 2015?

15          A. I have no reason not to complete my notebook, so my  
16          notebook was completed as you would expect it to be  
17          completed for the duties I undertook.

18          Q. And you have said that:

19                 "If I thought the action I had taken would have been  
20                 pivotal to any subsequent enquiries I would have taken  
21                 notes. However, as I have stated, I did not deem any

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           actions I took were part of the evidential chain."  
2       A.   Yes.  
3       Q.   And I just wondered if you could explain what your  
4           understanding is of that?  
5       A.   What I mean by that is you're asking me now seven years  
6           later for times, specific times, so if I thought those  
7           would have been pivotal, for example, when I walked into  
8           the canteen, when I walked out of the canteen, I would  
9           have put them in my notebook, but the notes in my  
10          notebook are what you would you expect regarding the  
11          seizing of productions, what I started duty, when  
12          I finished duty.  
13       Q.   And is it fair to say that your operational statement,  
14           which you completed, would have been from your  
15           recollection and from entries in your notes?  
16       A.   And from my notebook, yes.  
17       Q.   And it dealt with what you considered to be your  
18           significant involvement --  
19       A.   Yes.  
20       Q.   -- with those events.  And then finally you are asked to  
21           deal with the PC Alan Paton complaint and you have been

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           asked some questions about a complaint that you were  
2           involved in. You say:

3                     "I think Alan Paton's complaint was about parking."

4           So just to be clear, these paragraphs are about  
5           a complaint that had been made about PC Paton and that  
6           you had some involvement in and it was limited  
7           involvement in and you have made that clear. As we look  
8           through these paragraphs -- I think you took a statement  
9           so we'll go through those paragraphs --

10          A. I didn't take a statement.

11          Q. Oh, sorry. We will go through the paragraphs. 120  
12          next, please:

13                     "I was only present, from my [recollection  
14           presumably] at one house when the statement of complaint  
15           was noted."

16          So you didn't take that statement?

17          A. No.

18          Q. You were present --

19          A. Yes.

20          Q. -- when the statement was taken and that's the extent of  
21          your --

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 A. Yes, I can't even give you the year or date or anything  
2 like that, as you can see from that, but I was asked  
3 about that.

4 Q. Right. And you say at 121:

5 "It's very seldom we would go unaccompanied to note  
6 a complaint. [some other inspector] had a statement to  
7 note, and I would go as his corroborating officer. Only  
8 one inspector would note a statement of complaint."

9 And that was not yourself?

10 A. No.

11 Q. And at 122:

12 "I have been asked if I was involved in the  
13 decision-making for this complaint. No, that's the  
14 investigating officer's decision and on that occasion it  
15 was [a different inspector]. I wouldn't be involved in  
16 that. I don't remember the outcome of this complaint."

17 So you had a very limited involvement, if I can say  
18 it that way, with this aspect that you have been asked  
19 about?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And your recollection now is very limited as well?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. I don't even know when that was.

2 MS GRAHAME: Right, all right.

3 Thank you very much. That completes my examination.

4 LORD BRACADALE: Are there any Rule 9 applications?

5 Ms Mitchell.

6 Ms Combe, would you mind going back to the witness  
7 room while I hear a submission.

8 (Pause).

9 Yes, Ms Mitchell.

10 Application by MS MITCHELL

11 MS MITCHELL: Yes, sir. There are two issues. The first of  
12 those issues follows paragraph 50 where the witness --  
13 paragraph 50 of her Inquiry statement where she said:

14 "Following the tragic incident there were concerns  
15 that there could be negative and adverse reaction from  
16 the ethnic minority community in Fife and the breakdown  
17 in our engagement with these communities which could  
18 manifest in demonstration and protest."

19 And she notes -- it is her evidence:

20 "However, due to the continued [I think positive]  
21 community engagement and dialogue this was avoided.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Meetings took place with community leaders where any  
2 concerns could be addressed and discussed."

3 The first issue that I want to ask about are  
4 questions around the concerns that police had, so the  
5 questions that I would like to ask are: how soon after  
6 the death of Sheku Bayoh were there concerns that there  
7 might be a negative and adverse reaction, whether or not  
8 by that she meant demonstration or protest, to ask her  
9 whether or not she was one of the people who had those  
10 concerns, to find out who else had those concerns and  
11 importantly to find out why did they have those  
12 concerns, if there was a discussion about that.

13 And finally, would she have expected the concerns,  
14 if she was one of these people that held them and other  
15 officers did, would she have expected the officers in  
16 the canteen to have these same sorts of concerns.

17 The second issue relates to matters of the community  
18 and in particular those members of the community being  
19 Sheku Bayoh's family and the issue of protest and the  
20 following questions would like to be asked in order to  
21 assist the Inquiry with a proper understanding of the



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 situation. This Inquiry may come to hear in the future  
2 that demonstrations and protests did take place, which  
3 of course were peaceful and legal, but there was  
4 a breakdown with the Bayoh family and what I would like  
5 to ask this witness was whether or not she was aware  
6 there was a complete breakdown in relationships between  
7 family liaison officers and the Bayoh family in the days  
8 following Sheku Bayoh's death. I would like to ask  
9 about the meeting with community leaders, in particular  
10 whether or not she was aware if the family of  
11 Sheku Bayoh was invited because she said that it was not  
12 all community leaders and others in the community were  
13 present.

14 I would like to ask if she can recall what the  
15 purpose of the meeting was and if the meetings were  
16 in May, which I think she said she thought it was, given  
17 the fact that the police officers hadn't yet given any  
18 statements, what information or what discussions could  
19 she recall about that and, finally, moving on to the  
20 Bayoh family themselves and protest: were you aware of  
21 demonstrations and rallies that the Bayoh family

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 participated in, not just in Kirkcaldy but through  
2 Scotland, including 7 June where there was a march of  
3 1,000 people outside the police station, a minute's  
4 silence and literally a banner which said "we want  
5 justice and without truth there can be no justice", two  
6 major marches, of other protests and September a meeting  
7 in the community centre and October another rally in  
8 Kirkcaldy, and also whether or not this witness was  
9 aware that the Bayoh family campaigned for some  
10 five years for the VRR and for the Public Inquiry, and  
11 also whether or not this witness was aware of the name  
12 Sheku Bayoh being carried at Black Lives Matter  
13 demonstrations throughout Scotland. This is  
14 particularly because of her part that she says that she  
15 was involved in community relations in Kirkcaldy at that  
16 time, so it's against that background I would like to  
17 ask these questions.

18 (Pause).

19 Ruling

20 LORD BRACADALE: In relation to the first issue, I shall  
21 allow you to explore the issues in relation to the

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 concerns.

2 In relation to the second issue, I would draw  
3 a distinction between the immediate aftermath of 3 May  
4 and the much broader matters that you mention towards  
5 the end, so I would draw the line at the 7 June matter,  
6 so you can ask about the aftermath of up to -- the  
7 subsequent issues I will not allow you to ask at this  
8 stage.

9 MS MITCHELL: Can I just clarify in relation to those  
10 matters whether or not that would include asking  
11 a question of whether or not they were aware of the name  
12 Sheku Bayoh being carried at Black Lives Matter  
13 demonstrations.

14 LORD BRACADALE: Yes, that's much later.

15 MS MITCHELL: Well, I'm --

16 LORD BRACADALE: Is it?

17 MS MITCHELL: Well, I'm not sure that it would be. I'm just  
18 wondering if that was much later. We know the dates of  
19 certain marches on 7 June and we also --

20 LORD BRACADALE: That is 7 June 2015, is it?

21 MS MITCHELL: Yes, indeed. And we also know the meeting

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           with the community was in May, so is the Inquiry just  
2           suggesting that the questions about the VRR should not  
3           be included --

4           LORD BRACADALE: No. I would restrict your questions to  
5           matters occurring in May and June 2015.

6           MS MITCHELL: I'm obliged.

7           LORD BRACADALE: And on that basis I shall allow you to ask  
8           the questions, so if we can rearrange the seating  
9           please.

10                   (Pause).

11                   Can we bring the witness back, please.

12                   Ms Combe, you're going to be asked some questions by  
13           Ms Mitchell who is the senior counsel for the Bayoh  
14           families.

15                   Ms Mitchell.

16                               MS JANE COMBE (continued)

17                               Questions from MS MITCHELL

18           MS MITCHELL: Thank you.

19                   I wonder if we could have on screen the Inquiry  
20           statement of Inspector Combe, in particular  
21           paragraph 50. Now, you will recall being asked some

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 questions by my learned friend about this already.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I would like to ask you some more questions, if I may,  
4 about that.

5 As we see there it says:

6 "Following the tragic incident, there were concerns  
7 that there could be a negative and adverse reaction from  
8 the ethnic minority community in Fife and a breakdown in  
9 our engagement with these communities which could  
10 manifest in demonstration and process sorry protest and  
11 protest."

12 Now, what I would like to ask you, first of all, is  
13 how soon after the death of Sheku Bayoh were there  
14 concerns that there might be an adverse and negative  
15 reaction?

16 A. I couldn't give you a timescale on that. I would say  
17 quite quickly after that didn't -- any victim of any  
18 crime or any incident, very quickly that would be one of  
19 the community impact assessments, so it doesn't have to  
20 be race, it could be it was a young person, it could be  
21 any number of things that we take into consideration

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           after an incident.

2           Q.   Okay.  And when -- you have identified that, you have

3           said "Quite quickly", I'm wondering if we could explore.

4           Do you mean on that day would there have been concerns?

5           A.   I would think so, as senior management, yes, it would be

6           part of your Community Impact Assessment.

7           Q.   And were you one of the people that had those concerns?

8           Did you have a concern given your --

9           A.   I wasn't part of the senior management team, but from

10          the work I have done with the communities, yes, that

11          would be a concern.

12          Q.   And you would say that not only you would have that

13          concern but you imagine senior management would have

14          that concern?

15          A.   I can't talk for senior management, but I would presume

16          so.

17          Q.   Why did you have those concerns?

18          A.   As I said, after any incident involving the police,

19          whether as I say it's a young person who has died on the

20          road, whether it's an incident like this, you have to

21          look around and see what impact is that going to have on

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           the community.

2       Q. I would like you to look at this particular instance.

3       A. Yes.

4       Q. Why in this particular instance did you have an

5           apprehension that there might be negative and adverse

6           reaction?

7       A. Because of the gentleman's heritage.

8       Q. What do you mean by that?

9       A. He is a black male.

10      Q. And why did that make you think that there would be

11         negative and adverse reaction?

12      A. Well, if I'm being perfectly honest with you, it's after

13         anything -- whether it's worldwide or in the country, if

14         it is to do with an ethnic minority, the media will come

15         on the back of that.

16      Q. And is there a particular resonance with black men in

17         police custody?

18      A. No, no. Not in Fife, no.

19      Q. Well, in general, though, you were talking about --

20      A. In general if you look at the media reporting there's

21         plenty media reporting throughout the years about black

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           people being taken into custody, your stop and search  
2           down in England.

3           Q. Was it one of your concerns that because Mr Bayoh was  
4           black there might be an adverse --

5           A. Potentially, yes.

6           Q. -- reaction.

7           A. Yes.

8           Q. You say that there were concerns that there could be  
9           a negative and adverse reaction. You have indicated  
10          that you have that concern. Who else had that concern?  
11          I'm just -- reflecting upon --

12          A. I couldn't comment on that.

13          Q. Well, you say "There were concerns", so I'm looking to  
14          help the Inquiry with where those concerns arise. How  
15          did you know about those concerns?

16          A. Because they were my concerns.

17          Q. Okay. And were you the person then that acted to carry  
18          out the community engagement and dialogue?

19          A. I was present at some of those, yes.

20          Q. And when you were present at that, did other people  
21          express their concerns about the possibility of



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 a negative and adverse reaction?

2 A. Are you talking about other persons as in the police  
3 community --

4 Q. Yes.

5 A. -- or as in the wider community?

6 Q. In the police community?

7 A. Yes, in the police community, yes.

8 Q. And were those discussions had presumably before you  
9 reached out to ethnic minority communities in Kirkcaldy?

10 A. They would have been, yes.

11 Q. Do you remember those discussions?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Do you remember any meetings about them?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Would you have expected the officers who were in the  
16 canteen to have the same sorts of concerns?

17 A. Not all of them, because some of them were very new into  
18 the organisation and might not have had that exposure  
19 previously.

20 Q. We have had evidence that some of the officers, for  
21 example, Walker and Paton, were extremely experienced

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           officers. Would you have expected them to have those  
2           sorts of concerns?

3           A. As I have already said, it depends on their exposure to  
4           these kinds of incidents, where it's involving an ethnic  
5           minority community. If police officers have never dealt  
6           with the ethnic minority community they might not have  
7           those concerns, it might not be first and foremost in  
8           their mind.

9           Q. Well, would you have expected police officers to be  
10          aware of the worldwide media about black men dying in  
11          police custody?

12          A. It would be an expectation but, as I have said, I can't  
13          speak for every police officer that they do keep  
14          up-to-date with current affairs.

15          Q. I would like to move on to another issue.

16          A. Thank you.

17          Q. This issue is in order to assist the Inquiry with  
18          a proper understanding of the situation just post the  
19          death of Sheku Bayoh. You have indicated already at  
20          paragraph 50 that "due to the continued positive  
21          community engagement and dialogue this was avoided", and

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 by "this" it means demonstration and protest.

2 Now, during the proceeding days after Mr Bayoh's  
3 death in police custody, were you aware of large-scale  
4 events?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Were you aware of a large-scale event on 7 June?

7 A. And where are you talking about this large-scale event?  
8 Is it in Fife or Edinburgh, Glasgow?

9 Q. In Fife.

10 A. In Fife. There was one -- I couldn't give you the date,  
11 there was an event in Fife.

12 Q. And if I were to suggest to you that that was a march  
13 which stopped outside the police station --

14 A. Yes, that's the one I'm referring to.

15 Q. Do you remember anything about that particular event?

16 A. As I have said, I wouldn't class that as a demonstration  
17 or a protest, there was no hostilities that I am aware  
18 of, it was very dignified by all those involved, but  
19 yes, I'm aware that there was an event.

20 Q. Were you aware that there was a minute's silence outside  
21 the police station?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Can you tell us anything else about that?

3 A. No.

4 Q. No. Now, you say you wouldn't class that as  
5 a demonstration or a protest, but of course  
6 demonstrations and protests --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- are completely legal?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And can be done peacefully?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Now, the Inquiry will come to hear that -- there will be  
13 evidence that the Bayoh family in fact stood with  
14 a banner which said "We want answers" and "Without truth  
15 there can be no justice". Do you recall seeing that?

16 A. I don't recall seeing it at Kirkcaldy but I have seen  
17 that in the media.

18 Q. And were you present at that --

19 A. No.

20 Q. Okay. Do you have any recollection of any other  
21 meetings in Kirkcaldy in the days or weeks preceding

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that --

2           A. No.

3           Q. A rally?

4           A. No.

5           Q. A meeting at a community hall?

6           A. No.

7           Q. You have already explained to us that you didn't

8           consider these demonstrations or protests because what

9           you were thinking of when you meant that was

10          something --

11          A. I will clarify that for you then. What I mean by is

12          a large-scale disturbance -- as I say, yes, I take

13          on board what you're saying, they can be classed as

14          a protest or demonstration, but there was no

15          hostilities, there was no arrests that I am aware of.

16          Q. Were you aware that there was a breakdown in relations

17          between the police and the family liaison officers and

18          the Bayoh family in the days following Sheku Bayoh's

19          death?

20          A. No.

21          Q. Did you have any interaction with the family liaison

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           officers at all?
- 2           A. Did I personally?
- 3           Q. Yes.
- 4           A. No.
- 5           Q. You spoke also about the meeting with community leaders.
- 6           A. Yes.
- 7           Q. And it would be fair to say you can't remember a huge
- 8           amount about that, is that correct?
- 9           A. That's right.
- 10          Q. Can you remember what the purpose of that meeting was
- 11          for?
- 12          A. From my recollection it was just to have that engagement
- 13          still with the community, so if there was any underlying
- 14          issues, we could try and address them.
- 15          Q. And what underlying issues might those be?
- 16          A. They could be anything, a lack of communication, a lack
- 17          of information-sharing, feeling that they were being
- 18          persecuted, you know, being targeted by other members of
- 19          the community, but there was none of that from my
- 20          recollection.
- 21          Q. At that particular time, if your understanding is

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 correct and the meeting was in May --
- 2 A. I said I couldn't remember, I said it would be May  
3 or June.
- 4 Q. May or June?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. If it was May or June. What information could you have  
7 given at that stage about the circumstances of  
8 Sheku Bayoh's death?
- 9 A. We couldn't have shared anything about the  
10 circumstances, but the community impact is to see how  
11 the community are feeling about that incident, or any  
12 other incidents.
- 13 Q. Were you aware whether or not the Bayoh family were  
14 invited to the meeting of community leaders?
- 15 A. The Bayoh family have a member of their family who is  
16 part of Frae Fife and they were invited.
- 17 Q. So through Frae Fife?
- 18 A. Yes, and there was a member of Frae Fife there and  
19 a member of their family is a quite influential member  
20 of Frae Fife.
- 21 Q. Do you have any information that anyone else in the

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 family was invited to that meeting?

2 A. I couldn't tell you who the invite list was.

3 Q. Okay. So any invite that was given was given to a body

4 of whom a member is a party of that group, but not the

5 family itself?

6 A. I couldn't tell you.

7 MS MITCHELL: No further questions.

8 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Combe, thank you very much for coming to

9 give evidence to the Inquiry. I'm going to rise now in

10 order that the next witness can be introduced and you

11 will be free to go then.

12 MS MITCHELL: Sorry, my Lord, I did forget to ask a question

13 (mic turned off) the community leaders.

14 LORD BRACADALE: Yes, very well (inaudible overspeaking) --

15 MS MITCHELL: I'm sorry, I'm sorry.

16 A. Not at all.

17 Q. You have indicated to us briefly the make-up of the

18 community leaders and I wonder if I can explore that

19 with you in a little more detail?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You described the imam of the mosque?



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Can you tell us who else you thought was there?

3 A. The leader of the Fife Arabic community, Frae Fife,  
4 business leaders, anyone who has actually been  
5 interactive with the police from any of the communities  
6 is what I would say, is somebody who is influential and  
7 we could get a message through.

8 Q. And what people of that group were members of the black  
9 community?

10 A. Frae Fife.

11 Q. And is the particular person that you're referring to in  
12 relation to Frae Fife, that particular person isn't  
13 a member of the Bayoh family that was there that day?

14 A. He wasn't -- yes, it was someone else other than the  
15 member of the Bayoh family who I have said is a member  
16 of Frae Fife.

17 Q. And do you know who that person was?

18 A. I believe it's -- Naeem is his first name, I don't know  
19 his surname.

20 MS MITCHELL: I've no further questions.

21 LORD BRACADALE: Thank you.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 (12.39 pm)

2 (Short Break)

3 (12.44 pm)

4 LORD BRACADALE: Now, Ms Grahame, who is the next witness?

5 MS GRAHAME: The next witness is Samantha Davidson.

6 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Davidson, are you a Detective Inspector,  
7 is that right?

8 A. Temporary Detective Inspector at the moment.

9 LORD BRACADALE: Would you take the oath, please.

10 TEMPORARY DI SAMANTHA DAVIDSON (sworn)

11 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Grahame.

12 Questions from MS GRAHAME

13 MS GRAHAME: Thank you.

14 You are Samantha Davidson?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And what age are you?

17 A. 38.

18 Q. And tell us how many years' service you now have?

19 A. 17.

20 Q. And in 2015?

21 A. 10 years' service.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. And your rank now, you have just told the Chair you're  
2 temporary detective inspector?

3 A. Yes, that's correct.

4 Q. And in 2015, were you a DS, a detective sergeant?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And we have heard people talk about the CID officers.  
7 Is that one -- you're that person?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Thank you. And your contact details are all known to us  
10 so I'm not going to ask you to say what they are.

11 Have you had the chance to see other aspects of the  
12 evidence that we have had in the Inquiry?

13 A. Some, not all.

14 Q. You may have seen me refer officers and witnesses to the  
15 black folder in front of you, so have a look in that and  
16 that should contain four statements and I'm going to  
17 take you through all of them now. So the first one was  
18 a self-penned statement dated 4 May 2015. I don't  
19 actually know what order they are in in your folder, but  
20 it will also come up on the screen as we go through it.

21 A. Mm-hm.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. So this is Samantha Davidson and you will see it says  
2 4 May 2015, 12.25, done by yourself at Kirkcaldy Police  
3 Office.
- 4 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 5 Q. Right. And when you prepared this, this was just the  
6 day after the events of 3 May.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Were you doing your best to give -- to give a true and  
9 accurate recollection or record of what had happened the  
10 day before?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And then can we look at PIRC 184 and we will see that  
13 this is a statement by you on 29 May 2015 at 11.10,  
14 taken by investigators John McAuley and Kevin Rooney at  
15 Kirkcaldy Police Office?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. We have heard that these are investigators from PIRC, so  
18 they took a statement from you on that date and again,  
19 were you doing your best to give a true and accurate  
20 record of what had happened?
- 21 A. Yes, I was.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Q. Thank you. And were you given the chance to change  
2 anything?

3 A. Just to clarify from my original self-penned statement,  
4 yes.

5 Q. So this was about clarifying your original statement.  
6 and then look at number 3, PIRC 185, please.

7 This is a statement of 2 June 2015, 17.20, by  
8 John Ferguson, investigating officer, again at Kirkcaldy  
9 Police Office, and again, on this date were you doing  
10 your best to give a true and accurate record of what had  
11 happened?

12 A. Yes, that's correct.

13 Q. And again, were you given the chance to clarify or make  
14 any changes if you wished?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Thank you. And then finally, can we look at the Inquiry  
17 statement. We will see that this is your Inquiry  
18 statement taken by a member of the team on 9 March 2022,  
19 and if we can look at the last page, you will see  
20 there's a paragraph there which says at 39:

21 "I believe the facts stated in this witness

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 statement are true. I understand that this statement  
2 may form part of the evidence before the Inquiry and be  
3 published on the Inquiry's website."

4 Then we should be able to -- we will have a -- yes.  
5 So we see that there was a signature there. It has been  
6 redacted on the copy that we see on the screen, but on  
7 your hard copy you should see your signature on all the  
8 pages?

9 A. Yes, that's correct.

10 Q. And that was dated -- signed by you on 26 April 2022.

11 A. (Nods).

12 Q. So when I go through things, I will ask for particular  
13 paragraphs or pages to be brought up on the screen, but  
14 at all times you're going to have the full hard copy and  
15 if you think there's an area you would like to refer to,  
16 please just tell us and we can bring that up on the  
17 screen as well.

18 A. Okay, no problem.

19 Q. So feel free to use those hard copies in any way. In  
20 addition to the folder with your statements in it, you  
21 should see a spreadsheet which has been printed off.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 It's a combined audio and video timeline.

2 Now, if you have managed to watch any of the  
3 evidence, you may have seen me refer people to this,  
4 witnesses to this. You will see on the left there's  
5 timings given in the 24-hour clock, so, for example, the  
6 first one is 7.09 in the morning, 20 seconds to 33  
7 seconds. And then to the left of centre of the  
8 spreadsheet, you will see a list of Airwave  
9 transmissions that are transcribed, and then to the  
10 right of centre, you will see a very brief description  
11 of events that are said to be happening in the CCTV or  
12 in the footage and on the right-hand side, you will see  
13 the source of that -- the video extract.

14 A. Okay.

15 Q. Now, you may have seen in the hearings, or you may have  
16 seen on the news that we have also got an evidence video  
17 timeline which combines all the footage, and that will  
18 be on the screen, and I might ask you questions about  
19 that.

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. You might have seen witnesses touch the screen and a red

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 circle appears. We might be doing that as part of your  
2 evidence as well.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. But if you're not clear about anything, just tell me and  
5 I will explain what we want to do.

6 A. Okay, no problem.

7 Q. Great, thank you very much.

8 So let's start with your Inquiry statement if I may,  
9 paragraph 5, and you have said at around 7.15 in the  
10 morning you were in the CID office in Kirkcaldy Police  
11 Office:

12 "... when I heard a transmission over the radio  
13 regarding a black male in possession of a knife in the  
14 area of Hendry Road, Kirkcaldy. I understood this was  
15 a priority 1 call requiring immediate response.  
16 DC Connell and I acknowledged the call, along with  
17 uniformed officers. While this was a call for uniformed  
18 officers rather than CID, Kirkcaldy Police Office was  
19 very short staffed at that time. That, together with  
20 the serious nature of the call, made us respond to the  
21 call."



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           I would like to ask you some general questions about  
2           this. Now, we have heard officers talk about the CID  
3           officers. Are you quite a distinct group of officers  
4           compared to other uniformed officers in a police  
5           station?

6           A. Distinct in that we wear different uniform. A CID  
7           officer will routinely wear suits as opposed to the  
8           normal standard police uniform and the distinction is  
9           what crimes we lead on as opposed to what crimes the  
10          uniform lead on. So we would lead on serious,  
11          protracted crimes, as opposed to maybe your kind of  
12          volume crime that response deal with.

13          Q. So things like murders, or serious assaults, that type  
14          of thing?

15          A. Mm-hm.

16          Q. And you would be dressed in suits rather than the  
17          standard police uniform?

18          A. Yes, that's correct.

19          Q. So you are quite easily distinguished compared to other  
20          officers maybe in a scene: you can be seen because of  
21          your normal clothing --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. -- smart clothing.
- 3 A. Mm-hm.
- 4 Q. And do you have a separate office then with CID officers  
5 in Kirkcaldy Police Office?
- 6 A. Yes, at the time -- we don't have a CID office there  
7 just now, but at the time we had a separate CID office  
8 from uniform.
- 9 Q. So do you form a unified group --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- distinct from the less serious business that other  
12 officers conduct and engage in?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And you have mentioned a DC Connell?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Who was he?
- 17 A. He was one of my detectives that was on duty that  
18 morning, DC Derek Connell.
- 19 Q. So DC Derek Connell was one of your constables?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And at that time were you a detective sergeant?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. So you have been promoted on a temporary basis since  
3 then.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. How long had you been a sergeant in May 2015?
- 6 A. I was promoted in June of 2014, so only just shy of  
7 a year.
- 8 Q. Just shy of a year. And how many officers did you have  
9 under your command?
- 10 A. In Kirkcaldy I had three or four. In Glenrothes  
11 I likewise had three or four, so anything up to about  
12 eight DCs.
- 13 Q. So we have heard about other officers, who are maybe  
14 senior officers, that their teams were in the one  
15 office; you actually spanned two offices with your --
- 16 A. Yes, so Fife is separated into central, east and west,  
17 so I would cover the central area which would encompass  
18 Kirkcaldy and Glenrothes.
- 19 Q. Right. And you have said that Kirkcaldy Police Office  
20 was very short staffed at that time. Now, do you mean  
21 in relation to CID officers or in relation to uniformed

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           officers?

2           A.   Probably across the board.

3           Q.   Right.  And what do you mean it was very short staffed?

4           A.   In terms of the team numbers, essentially with changes

5           to Police Scotland, a lot of changes had occurred, a lot

6           of staffing had moved nationally, so yes, we were going

7           through a big change at that time.

8           Q.   And we may hear that it was a time of considerable

9           change in the organisation --

10          A.   Yes.

11          Q.   -- so still feeling the effects of the change to

12          Police Scotland from the individual regions or areas?

13          A.   Yes, that's correct.

14          Q.   Would that be fair?

15          A.   Yes.

16          Q.   And you said that this was a serious call that you heard

17          and so you also acknowledged that call for that reason,

18          and what was it that made you consider it a serious

19          call?

20          A.   High risk in terms of safety.  So, you know, essentially

21          you hear it's an immediate priority 1 call, and any

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 officer, regardless of specialism, rank, can go to an  
2 immediate 1 call.
- 3 Q. Right. So when there's calls, for example we have  
4 called about all units being called for, there's not  
5 a small group of CID officers who ignore all of that?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. You're still part of the response --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And if all units are called for, that would include CID  
10 officers as well?
- 11 A. Yes, it can include, yes, depending on commitments, but  
12 it can include us.
- 13 Q. So if you were involved in some serious investigation at  
14 that moment, you wouldn't be available, but if you are  
15 available, you would be part of the all units call?
- 16 A. Yes, absolutely.
- 17 Q. And you said it was high risk for safety; whose safety?
- 18 A. Officer safety in terms of the dispatching officers, but  
19 predominantly it's the safety of the community and the  
20 subject male.
- 21 Q. Right, thank you. If Kirkcaldy Police Office had not

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           been very short staffed, would you have responded to  
2           this call?  
3       A.   Absolutely.  
4       Q.   So the staffing didn't actually matter --  
5       A.   No.  
6       Q.   -- to your initial decision to respond?  
7       A.   It was a consideration but I would have still -- I'm  
8           a police officer and that's my core responsibility,  
9           I would have still responded to that call.  
10      Q.   That's still your priority?  
11      A.   Yes.  
12      Q.   And DC Connell, did he go with you?  
13      A.   Yes.  
14      Q.   And had you attended that type of call, a knife call, or  
15           a knife incident, from Kirkcaldy Police Office before?  
16      A.   Very likely. I would very often back up uniform at  
17           immediate calls, or likewise, if we were the closest  
18           unit, we would get dispatched to that call ourselves.  
19      Q.   All right. So you have experience -- or had experience  
20           in 2015 of responding to knife incidents and knife  
21           calls?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1       A. I can't think specifically to knife calls, but certainly  
2       immediate calls. Whether that involved a knife or not,  
3       I'm unsure.
- 4       Q. Can you explain to me the distinction between immediate  
5       calls and knife calls?
- 6       A. An immediate call could be a call that's graded grade 1,  
7       with immediate threat to, it doesn't mean that there's  
8       a knife, it could be a large-scale disturbance, it could  
9       be, you know, a domestic incident with a serious nature.  
10      It doesn't have to be -- it's just graded that it is  
11      life threatening.
- 12      Q. So grade 1, immediate threat to life, but it could be  
13      from any means or source --
- 14      A. Circumstance.
- 15      Q. -- or as a result of anything, but if that call came in,  
16      you would respond to that?
- 17      A. Yes.
- 18      Q. But it may not be a knife call?
- 19      A. Yes.
- 20      Q. Thank you. Can I ask you to look at paragraph 7,  
21      please. You have said that you collected your

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 equipment:

2 "... the yard [by that time] was empty of police  
3 vehicles as the uniformed officers had already left  
4 shortly before to respond to the incident. DC Connell  
5 and I left the carpark area of Kirkcaldy Police Station  
6 in a marked CID vehicle. This was a silver Vauxhall  
7 Corsa ... DC Connell was driving. Driving time from ...  
8 and Hayfield Road is approximately 3 to 5 minutes."

9 So it's a very short journey. DC Connell was  
10 driving. Are you and he familiar with Hayfield Road and  
11 the area?

12 A. Yes. I had worked in Kirkcaldy my full service for  
13 10 years, so I was fully aware of Hayfield Road.

14 Q. So we have heard there's hospitals in the area and  
15 churches and it's -- and houses. You were fully aware.

16 So as you are driving to Hayfield Road, were you  
17 listening to the radio messages coming over the police  
18 radio?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Thank you. So -- and is that a way of keeping yourself  
21 up-to-date on what's happening at the scene?



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Thank you. You have said:

3 "We did not have blue lights or sirens in our car.  
4 We responded as quick as we could."

5 So you have said it was a marked police car but --  
6 does that mean there were no sirens or lights on it?

7 A. There's no sirens and lights, but at that time there was  
8 a Police Scotland emblem kind of taping -- like on the  
9 bonnet of the vehicle so it was identifiable as a police  
10 vehicle, but it was not kind of fitted with sirens or  
11 lights.

12 Q. So not the normal sort of equipment that would be fitted  
13 to that car?

14 A. No.

15 Q. And:

16 "During the journey to Hayfield Road we heard the  
17 emergency button activation. This indicates that  
18 an officer requires assistance. We then heard that  
19 PC Short had been injured. At that time there was no  
20 exact detail of who was responsible or the extent of her  
21 injuries."

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           So the first thing you heard was an emergency button  
2           activation, and then that an officer was injured,  
3           PC Short?

4           A. Yes.

5           Q. We have heard that when the emergency button is  
6           activated, the radio vibrates for the officers who are  
7           attending; is that what happened?

8           A. Yes, it vibrates and goes red.

9           Q. And the screen goes red?

10          A. Yes.

11          Q. And so at that stage you didn't know -- you told us you  
12          knew about the knife, the calls that had come in, but  
13          you didn't know what injuries PC Short had or the extent  
14          of those injuries?

15          A. No.

16          Q. So what was going through your head at that time as you  
17          responded?

18          A. Essentially when we heard the emergency button being  
19          pushed we were only just leaving the back yard of  
20          Kirkcaldy Police Station. With the context of the call  
21          and information known, I immediately -- my gut reaction

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           was an officer had been stabbed. That was quickly  
2           reported back on the radio that it was PC Short and she  
3           had been physically injured and I think it was,  
4           you know, confirmation that it was not -- she had not  
5           been stabbed.

6           So at that stage, you know, when the emergency  
7           button goes, obviously fear, adrenaline heightens and  
8           you just want to get there to make sure everybody is  
9           okay.

10          MS GRAHAME: All right. I'm going to be asking you some  
11          questions this afternoon about the events and we will  
12          look at the spreadsheet and go through that.

13                 Would that be an appropriate time?

14          LORD BRACADALE: Yes, certainly. We will stop for lunch and  
15          sit at 2 o'clock.

16          (1.00 pm)

17                         (The luncheon adjournment)

18          (2.01 pm)

19          LORD BRACADALE: Right, Ms Grahame.

20          MS GRAHAME: Can we turn to the spreadsheet and page 5.

21                 Actually, let's start with page 4. I think just before

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 lunch you mentioned that you had become aware that an  
2 emergency button had been pressed and you will see at  
3 7.21.19, Ashley Tomlinson's emergency button status was  
4 turned on, do you see that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And then you also mentioned hearing that the officer had  
7 been injured but didn't have serious injuries?

8 A. I believe so. There was an update prior to my arrival.

9 Q. Absolutely. Let's have a look at page 5 at the very top  
10 of page 5, and we have heard that at 7.21.38 PC Smith  
11 said:

12 "An officer's been punched to the back of the head.  
13 No obvious serious injuries. Male secure on the  
14 ground."

15 And is that the reference to the Airwaves  
16 transmission that you're thinking?

17 A. Yes, I believe so.

18 Q. Thank you. And then I would like you to look at page 6,  
19 please, and I'm going to play -- sorry, I should have  
20 actually asked you something else about page 5. Could  
21 you just go back a second, sorry about that, and I think

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 in your statement you also mention that you said over  
2 the Airwaves that you were going to give an update and  
3 do we see that at 7.21.55 Stephen Kay requests:

4 "PS Maxwell can you arrive there and give me an  
5 update please."

6 And then very shortly after that at 7.22.04 you say:

7 "We're just approaching, I'll give you an update."

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 Q. So you effectively reply to Stephen Kay to say that you  
10 will give him the update, and you're on your way at that  
11 time?

12 A. Mm-hm.

13 Q. And then can we look again, sorry, page 6 and I'm going  
14 to ask to -- I will show you a part of the evidence  
15 video timeline, so that's the footage on the screen,  
16 just to let you see, you will see the real time clock in  
17 the top left-hand corner and then at the bottom there's  
18 the CCTV from Gallaghers pub.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And you can see the emergency status buttons on the  
21 left, if they're lit up -- Paton's and Tomlinson's are

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 lit up at this time, and then in the middle at the top  
2 of the screen you will see a reconstruction tile which  
3 is a 3D reconstruction bird's eye view of the vehicles  
4 and things arriving at the scene, so what I'm going to  
5 do is ask that we play from 7.23.10 and if you look at  
6 the spreadsheet on page 6 for 7.23.10, you will see that  
7 in the description, slightly to the right of halfway on  
8 the spreadsheet, you will see:

9 "Two light coloured small vehicles appear  
10 approaching the roundabout, one from the south and one  
11 from the north, both on Hendry Road. The vehicle  
12 approaching from the south turns right at the roundabout  
13 into Hayfield Road and then stops just past the exit of  
14 the roundabout."

15 And I'm going to play that footage with  
16 Ms Wildgoose's assistance, and then I'm going to ask you  
17 some questions about it, so let's just watch that for  
18 a few seconds, please.

19 (Video played)

20 So did you see that vehicle arriving or do you want  
21 to see that footage again?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. I didn't see a vehicle.
- 2 Q. You didn't see. Right, let's go back to 7.23.10.
- 3 A. Oh, yeah.
- 4 Q. Or just slightly beforehand and ... right, and we will  
5 play that.
- 6 (Video played)
- 7 And we will just pause it there. Sorry, I maybe  
8 didn't have it rewind far enough to see it. Did you  
9 see the vehicle coming up Hendry Road from the  
10 right-hand side of the screen?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Turning right into Hayfield Road, round the roundabout  
13 and stopping on the left. We can see it behind the tree  
14 that is in front of us.
- 15 A. (Nods).
- 16 Q. And there was movement of people exiting the vehicle.  
17 Did you recognise the car?
- 18 A. Yes, that's our CID vehicle.
- 19 Q. Is that the Vauxhall Corsa --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- with the marked police on the front --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes, that's correct.

2 Q. -- that you said earlier. And DC Connell was driving?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you were in the front passenger seat?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And that's you arriving at Hayfield Road. We have heard  
7 evidence you're the sixth car arriving at the scene. So  
8 that was prior to your arrival we have heard evidence  
9 that Walker and Paton arrived in a Transit van?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Tomlinson and Short arrived in what was known as the  
12 fish van?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. I don't know if you knew that. Smith and Good arrived  
15 in something akin to the Transit van. Gibson and  
16 McDonough have arrived in the diary car?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And Maxwell had also arrived in a Corsa?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. So let's -- we have heard part of the Airwaves  
21 transmission that you made after your arrival and



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 I would like to listen to that again, so that is 7 --  
2 you will see it on the spreadsheet, 7.23.13 on page 6  
3 and we have heard snippets of that already and I think  
4 we would like to play that in full again, thanks.

5 (Video played)

6 Thanks very much, that's lovely. Were you able to  
7 hear that?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. That's your voice?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So how long after you got out of the car did you make  
12 that transmission?

13 A. I believe immediately. I did have a short conversation  
14 with Craig Walker so it could have been after that, but  
15 I believe it was immediate because I came out and made  
16 observations.

17 Q. Right, so looking again, the police vehicle arrives  
18 between 7.23.02 and 7.23.10, according to the  
19 spreadsheet and then this message is 7.23.13, so within  
20 seconds?

21 A. Within seconds, yes. So it was immediately when I got

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 out of the car, that would make sense.

2 Q. Would that make more sense to you than having stopped  
3 for a conversation with someone?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And did you immediately go over to the area of the  
6 restraint --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- in Hayfield Road.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And you have described -- you have made this  
11 transmission. Where were you standing when you made  
12 that transmission?

13 A. Between my vehicle and the restraint, an area around  
14 there.

15 Q. So you have parked on the north side of Hayfield Road  
16 and the restraint we have heard was on the south?

17 A. Mm-hm.

18 Q. So a reasonably short distance between. And during the  
19 time you're making this transmission, are you on the  
20 move to get closer to the restraint, or were you  
21 standing still?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1       A. I would likely be walking towards them, that would make  
2       sense but I don't know for sure.

3       Q. Okay. You have said there that the male's on the ground  
4       when you arrive?

5       A. Mm-hm.

6       Q. And several officers have "taken a big restraint". What  
7       did you mean by that?

8       A. In terms of resourcing I think, you know --

9       Q. Sorry?

10      A. Resourcing.

11      Q. Resourcing.

12      A. In terms of how many officers were there, it was a big  
13      number essentially.

14      Q. How many, do you remember?

15      A. I believe in my statement -- if I may refer back?

16      Q. Yes, please do.

17      A. I knew -- I could name four officers but I believe there  
18      were others that I couldn't name but were present so.

19      Q. Right, so more than four officers present?

20      A. Yes.

21      Q. And when you say "They have taken a big restraint", can

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           you help me understand whether you meant the restraint  
2           was ongoing, or whether it had stopped?

3           A. No, the restraint was ongoing.

4           Q. And when you say:

5                     "We're going to need more control with leg  
6           restraints."

7                     What did you mean by that?

8           A. I could hear them discussing that and I believe I kind  
9           of observed that they were in the process of doing or  
10          starting to do that.

11          Q. So what position was Mr Bayoh in?

12          A. He was in the prone position, lying down.

13          Q. And was he struggling at that time?

14          A. I believe -- my recollection at the time, and in my  
15          statements I have said that his legs were moving.  
16          I couldn't tell you now exactly the movement of, but  
17          certainly his legs were moving.

18          Q. So you arrive before they have actually applied the leg  
19          restraints, although it is being discussed --

20          A. Yes.

21          Q. -- and his legs are still moving at that stage?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. So you were there when the leg restraints were applied?

3 A. No.

4 Q. You had moved away by that stage?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. All right, thank you.

7 At that time when you first arrived, did you have  
8 any concerns at that time as to the manner of restraint  
9 or the number of officers that were involved in the  
10 restraint?

11 A. I had no concerns. From the short observations that  
12 I took at locus at that restraint area, I had no  
13 concerns.

14 Q. And if you had had concerns, what would you have done at  
15 that time?

16 A. I would have voiced them concerns and interjected.

17 Q. And can you tell me at any stage at that -- sorry, at  
18 that stage when you arrived and you saw the restraint  
19 and the officers and what was happening, did you  
20 consider at that time that it would be important to get  
21 the person from the ground upright because they were in

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 the prone position.

2 A. I didn't consider it at that time. If you go by the  
3 kind of timing of driving to locus, the calls coming in,  
4 I knew that due to radio messages that they had not long  
5 come to be in that position in terms of the timeline  
6 that I was aware of, so I knew that they were still  
7 gaining control, they had still to, you know, assert  
8 that control by cuffs, et cetera, and then the movement  
9 would happen thereafter. I had no concerns because  
10 I didn't believe it was a vast amount of time that he  
11 had been in the prone position.

12 Q. So when you arrived, the officers were still trying to  
13 gain control?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Mr Bayoh was prone but still -- his legs were still  
16 moving?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. No handcuffs were on and no leg restraints?

19 A. Not that I observed, no.

20 Q. Thank you. So no concerns for you at that particular  
21 time --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. No.

2 Q. -- when you arrived. Now, can you help the Chair  
3 understand when you arrived -- you told us about  
4 Mr Bayoh's position; can you tell us about the officers  
5 who were there and the positions they were in and --

6 A. Can I refer to --

7 Q. You might want to have a look at paragraph 8 of your  
8 Inquiry statement and we can get that on the screen, and  
9 just so -- I will just read part of this out. So you  
10 arrive at 7.20, you say:

11 "... [turned] right [into] Hayfield Road from  
12 Hendry Road. DC Connell parked the ... vehicle ... on  
13 the left-hand side ... I believed that there was  
14 a uniformed car on the same side of the road in front of  
15 our vehicle."

16 We have heard mention that was the fish van?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. "Immediately to the right of the CID vehicle was the  
19 officers and a man that I did not know but we later  
20 identified to be [Mr] Bayoh. The majority of [his] body  
21 was on the pavement; head and body and upper legs. He

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 was face down. His lower legs were stretched out into  
2 the road and his head was on the pavement and pointing  
3 in the direction of the hedge."

4 We have heard that he was -- his head was pointing  
5 in the direction of Gallaghers pub, is that a similar  
6 description --

7 A. I believe so, yes.

8 Q. -- to what you give there?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. "His legs were moving at this point but I couldn't tell  
11 you exactly what the exact movement was. I don't have  
12 any recollection of how the legs were moving for  
13 example, whether it was side to side or up and down, but  
14 certainly I do recall movement. I also observed four  
15 officers in particular at this point, PC Craig Walker,  
16 PC Alan Paton, PC Ashley Tomlinson and PC Daniel Gibson.  
17 PC Alan Paton being on the deceased's right-hand side.  
18 PC Craig Walker being on [his] left-hand side, at his  
19 upper shoulder area. PC Walker was on his upper  
20 shoulder area. PC Walker was lying on his right-hand  
21 side, facing away from Sheku Bayoh. PC Walker was



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           restraining him by leaning his weight on Mr Bayoh's  
2           shoulder and the arm. I am clear that PC Walker was not  
3           leaning his weight on Mr Bayoh's body at that time."

4           So I would quite like to -- then you go on in  
5           paragraph 9 to say you don't recall exactly what  
6           PC Paton was doing, Ashley Tomlinson was at his feet and  
7           likewise, so was Daniel Gibson:

8           "... what they were effectively doing, I don't know.  
9           My concentration was on speaking with Craig Walker.  
10          From my statement, I can see that I remembered somebody  
11          saying 'leg restraints'. I believed somebody was going  
12          to put Leg Fast Straps on Mr Bayoh's legs...I [don't]  
13          recall seeing this happen."

14          I would quite like to go through that and ask you  
15          some further questions if you don't mind?

16        A. Yes, no problem.

17        Q. We have obviously read that description of what  
18          PC Walker was doing but I wonder if you could help the  
19          Chair understand what you saw when you arrived walking  
20          over the road from your vehicle towards the restraint.  
21          So you have told us about Mr Bayoh, prone, face towards

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           the hedge, and tell us about where PC Walker was and  
2           what he was doing?

3           A.   So PC Walker was on the left side, so the side furthest  
4           away from the Hayfield -- the roundabout --

5           Q.   The roundabout.

6           A.   -- at Gallaghers. He was on the left side and he was  
7           lying on his side, so PC Walker was lying on his right  
8           side.

9           Q.   On his own side?

10          A.   Yes, on the ground and in a restraint, holding  
11          Mr Bayoh's kind of top of his arm and -- his shoulder  
12          and his arm down.

13          Q.   Can I just be clear, you have said PC Walker was on the  
14          left side of Mr Bayoh, Mr Bayoh's prone, but he was  
15          lying on his right side.

16          A.   Mm-hm.

17          Q.   Was he faced away from --

18          A.   Yes, he had his back to Mr Bayoh and was facing towards  
19          the hospital.

20          Q.   All right. So he had his back to Mr Bayoh at that time  
21          that you arrived?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Sitting on his right side --
- 3 A. Lying.
- 4 Q. Lying, sorry, on his right side, facing the direction of  
5 Hayfield Road that leads to the hospital,  
6 Victoria Hospital?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. What was he doing?
- 9 A. He was in a restraint -- he was doing a ground pin at  
10 that point.
- 11 Q. Right. And you have mentioned Mr Bayoh's arm. Tell us  
12 what he was doing to Mr Bayoh's arm.
- 13 A. (Inaudible overspeaking) --
- 14 Q. You have talked about a ground pin.
- 15 A. He was holding it down and he was looking away, so  
16 Mr Bayoh is behind him and he is pinning the top of his  
17 arm and looking in the other direction.
- 18 Q. Okay. And when you say he was lying, was he lying  
19 parallel to Mr Bayoh's body as he was lying on the  
20 ground?
- 21 A. Certainly the top of his body was parallel; I couldn't

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           tell you where his legs were, but certainly the top end  
2           of his body.

3           Q. But he had pinned Mr Bayoh's left arm?

4           A. Yes.

5           Q. What about PC Paton, where was he?

6           A. He was on the right side but, you know, as said in  
7           a couple of statements I can't exactly say what he was  
8           doing in terms of restraint, where his hands were,  
9           because my focus was -- I asked Craig Walker a couple of  
10          questions, he answered them and then I left, so in terms  
11          of what Alan Paton was doing exactly, I don't know, and  
12          likewise, for Daniel Gibson and Ashley Tomlinson.  
13          I knew they were at the feet of Mr Bayoh but exactly  
14          what they were doing, I don't know.

15          Q. As you approached the area of the restraint --

16          A. Yes.

17          Q. -- where were those two officers? Was one on the left  
18          and one on the right in the (inaudible overspeaking) --

19          A. I believe I have said that, yes, that -- I think it's in  
20          my PIRC statement. I don't know if --

21          Q. Okay, let's have a look at your first statement from

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           4 May which is PS 000379. That was your first  
2           self-penned statement and then we also have PIRC 184,  
3           which is your statement of 29 May.  
4           A. 185 it's in.  
5           Q. It's 185, right. Let's have a look at that. So this is  
6           the statement of 2 June 2015. Is this page 4 --  
7           A. Yes.  
8           Q. -- by any chance? Let's have a look at page 4 and we  
9           will see at paragraph 5, let's start with that, it  
10          starts:  
11                 "I saw 4 officers in particular ..."  
12                 And we can see that on the screen:  
13                 "... as I got out of the passenger side of the car.  
14                 These officers were [Walker, Paton, Tomlinson and  
15                 Gibson].  
16                 "PC...Paton was on the deceased's right-hand side  
17                 'controlling' the deceased but I don't know how.  
18                 PC...Walker was lying on the deceased's left side, his  
19                 upper shoulder area, he was lying effectively on his  
20                 right-hand side facing away from the deceased. I cannot  
21                 remember if the deceased said anything. I do not

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           remember if his face was on the left or the right. It  
2           was not face down."

3           And then you say:

4           "PC Ashley Tomlinson was at the male's feet on the  
5           male's left side."

6           So Tomlinson was on Mr Bayoh's left side, is that  
7           correct?

8           A. Yes.

9           Q. "PC Daniel Gibson was also at the feet of the deceased  
10          right side at the feet."

11          So he was on Mr Bayoh's right-hand side?

12          A. At the bottom of his legs, yes.

13          Q. "I think Ashley Tomlinson was holding his lower legs,  
14          but his legs were moving. I cannot recall what  
15          PC Gibson was doing. I remember somebody saying 'leg  
16          restraints'. I believed somebody was going to put leg  
17          restraining straps on his legs. I do not recall seeing  
18          them being put on the deceased Bayoh."

19          And you have said earlier you asked a couple of  
20          questions of PC Walker when you arrived.

21          A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. What were you asking?

2 A. I asked him where PC Nicole Short was because she wasn't  
3 visible to me and I asked him where the vehicle keys  
4 were for the Transit van.

5 Q. Right. And what information did you receive about both  
6 those things?

7 A. They're both in the van. So Nicole Short was in the van  
8 as well as the keys were in the van.

9 Q. Right. And that was PC Walker's van, the Transit van?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Thank you. Can I ask you if we could look at  
12 paragraph 11 of your Inquiry statement. You see:  
13 "I asked Craig what was taking place and where  
14 Nicole was, as I was aware she was injured. He said to  
15 me 'he is struggling' referring to Mr Bayoh and told me  
16 Nicole was in the van. I asked him where the van keys  
17 were as I intended to drive the van closer to the  
18 officers as I knew this male was being arrested. The  
19 officers would require the police van to convey  
20 a custody and this was the only van on scene. Craig  
21 said that the keys were in the vehicle. So, I made my

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 way towards the van. I was with PC Craig Walker and the  
2 other officers for a minute/two minutes at most. I see  
3 from my statement that I've checked up on control to  
4 give them an update that the male was restrained and  
5 officers had control of him."

6 So at this stage the restraint's ongoing?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You know they're going to be applying leg restraints.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And you take the view you need the custody van because  
11 he was going to be taken into custody, "he" being  
12 Mr Bayoh?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And you then went to get the Transit van that Walker and  
15 Paton had arrived in?

16 A. Yes, my focus at that time was Nicole, not the van,  
17 but -- that was a secondary.

18 Q. So Nicole Short, the officer who had been injured, was  
19 the priority at that time?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And when you went over to the van, tell me how she



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1            appeared to you?
- 2            A.    So I approached the van and I climbed in the driver's  
3            side of the van. She was sitting within the passenger  
4            area of the front of the Transit van. I think I have  
5            detailed in my statement she was visibly crying,  
6            shaking, holding at her head and, you know, looked like  
7            she was in total shock, essentially.
- 8            Q.    We have heard evidence that she was very distressed in  
9            the van?
- 10          A.    Yes.
- 11          Q.    And that seems to have been your recollection. And you  
12          have said she was holding her head. Do you remember  
13          where on her head she was holding?
- 14          A.    She just kept on gripping the back of her head, like  
15          pulling at her hair and holding the back of her head.
- 16          Q.    Right. And did she say anything about her head?
- 17          A.    I believe she said to me that she had been struck by him  
18          and I assumed she meant Mr Bayoh.
- 19          Q.    Did she say where she had been struck?
- 20          A.    I don't know if I have that recorded. I'm sure she said  
21          in the head but ...

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Q. If we look at your PIRC statement, page 6, the one we  
2 just looked at a moment ago, 185, and I'm thinking  
3 paragraph 6 on this page, it starts:

4 "When I first saw her she was crying, there were  
5 tears running down her face. Her hands were shaking,  
6 her hands were trembling, she was visibly shaking and in  
7 shock. She is very small and of slight build. I think  
8 she has only 5 years police service. I queried the  
9 injuries she had to her. She said that the back of her  
10 head was 'sore'. She had been struck to the back of the  
11 dead, she did not say how. She said 'he did it'. I  
12 took it this was Sheku Bayoh she referred to. She said  
13 something similar to he was going to jump on her head  
14 and if it was not for 'Craig' meaning PC Walker, then  
15 she broke down more. When I made reference in my  
16 earlier statement to 'other officers present protected  
17 her' I believe she meant PC Craig Walker."

18 And that's what you told PIRC on 2 June 2015.

19 A. Yes, that's correct.

20 Q. Thank you. Was there anything obvious about her head,  
21 or did you notice any obvious injury?

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1       A. No, so I got out of the van and went round to the  
2       passenger side. I comforted her and took her from the  
3       van onto the kind of pavement or the road, and I tried  
4       to have a look at her head. As you are aware, you have  
5       met Nicole, her hair is particularly thick and  
6       I couldn't actually get a proper look but what  
7       I ascertained was there was no bleeding injury and it  
8       was at that point DI Colin Robson turned up and we made  
9       the decision that we weren't waiting on an ambulance, we  
10      were just going to take her because she was walking  
11      wounded.

12     Q. And did he then make arrangements to have her taken to  
13      the hospital or did you make those arrangements?

14     A. No, he pulled up behind the van in his vehicle, so  
15      I approached the vehicle and just said "Look" -- we  
16      could see the hospital from there, it was like 200 yards  
17      away, so I put her into the passenger side of the  
18      vehicle and DI Colin Robson took her to the hospital,  
19      a short journey.

20     Q. And that was a quicker approach than actually waiting  
21      for the ambulance?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes, she was safe enough to be travelled in a police car  
2 as opposed to --

3 Q. And then at paragraph 15 of your Inquiry statement, if  
4 we can go back to that, you were asked if you remember  
5 any mention being made of her being stamped on:

6 "At that point, I was not aware of any reference to  
7 Nicole being stood on or stamped on, from Nicole or even  
8 transmissions on the radio, I don't think. Certainly,  
9 I didn't overhear that Nicole had been stamped on. It  
10 wasn't until later in the media scenario that I've seen  
11 that, but at that moment in time, I didn't ask and it  
12 was never said to me. I didn't see any marks on  
13 Nicole's uniform. But again, I wasn't paying particular  
14 attention, but certainly there was nothing obvious."

15 And that remains your position today?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Thank you. Then you have told us that you -- how long  
18 did you spend with Nicole Short, did I ask that?

19 A. A few minutes at most.

20 Q. And then you have told us you drove the Transit closer  
21 to where the restraint was going on?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. That was correct, yes.
- 2 Q. So DI Robson arrived and you arranged that he would take  
3 her to the hospital, Nicole Short.
- 4 A. Mm-hm.
- 5 Q. And then did you get the keys to the Transit van and  
6 move it at that point?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And can I ask you to look at some still images too:  
9 number 4 in the still images. Actually I think I would  
10 rather have -- sorry, it was actually number 6 that  
11 I was interested in. Right, so this is an image -- a 3D  
12 image of various vehicles at the scene at a later moment  
13 in time. Can you -- just for the purposes of clarity,  
14 can you identify your vehicle from this image?
- 15 A. Yes, it's the small grey one.
- 16 Q. And the Transit van that you moved that had had  
17 Nicole Short in it.
- 18 And for both of those vehicles, are you reasonably  
19 content that these are a reasonable indication of the  
20 position in the road, Hayfield Road, that they were in?
- 21 A. Yes, reasonable, yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. Thank you. So 2 was the Transit van that had been taken  
2 from the bus stop area?

3 A. Mm-hm.

4 Q. And then was moved to nearer the island on Hayfield Road  
5 that we see on the image.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And the restraint that you returned to was going on  
8 where?

9 A. In this area here, I believe (indicating).

10 Q. Thank you, that's lovely. That's number 3. Now, can  
11 I ask you, prior to leaving the area of the restraint  
12 and going to speak to Nicole Short, had anyone at that  
13 time been monitoring Mr Bayoh's breathing as far as you  
14 were aware?

15 A. I was not aware of that.

16 Q. All right, thank you. Can we look at the spreadsheet,  
17 please, and can we look at 7.25.17 and this is on page 7  
18 of the spreadsheet. Now, you will see that at this  
19 time, 7.25.17, it's a transmission from PC Smith which  
20 says:

21 "This male certainly appears to be unconscious,

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 breathing, not responsive, get an ambulance for him."

2 Did you remember hearing that transmission?

3 A. I recall hearing a transmission that he was  
4 unresponsive. I couldn't tell you if it was from  
5 PC Alan Smith or the full context, but I do remember  
6 knowing that he was unresponsive.

7 Q. So you realised that he had become unresponsive?

8 A. Mm-hm.

9 Q. Where were you when you heard that transmission?

10 A. I believe I was mid-driving the van back towards the  
11 restraint area.

12 Q. So you were in the Transit van, moving it to the  
13 position you just demonstrated on the image --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- when you realised that he had become unresponsive.

16 What did you do after you stopped the van? What did  
17 you do immediately after that?

18 A. I'm slightly confused as to what came first, but  
19 essentially I know I approached the restraint and  
20 observed Mr Bayoh for myself. I felt for a pulse.  
21 I couldn't feel an external pulse so I asked

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 PC Alan Smith to corroborate that because I wasn't sure  
2 that that was correct and he did so and then CPR  
3 commenced.

4 Q. Right. Let's look at PS 379 again before I ask you some  
5 further questions. So this is your self-statement dated  
6 4 May, so this is the first statement that we have in  
7 the bundle.

8 A. Mm-hm.

9 Q. And can we look at page 3 -- sorry, page 4, I should  
10 have said. At the very top of the page it says:

11 "At this point I myself checked the deceased for  
12 a pulse; right side of his neck. I could not feel  
13 a pulse. I asked PC Alan Smith to confirm or locate  
14 a pulse.

15 "I believe PC Smith could not feel a pulse as soon  
16 thereafter the officers relayed the deceased had no  
17 cardiac output and CPR commenced. I mainly observed  
18 PC Walker carry out chest compressions.

19 "An ambulance was requested to attend immediately  
20 and the current position of the deceased was transmitted  
21 on the radio."



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1                   So you yourself checked by pressing the right side  
2                   of his neck?

3           A.   Mm-hm.

4           Q.   Without success in finding a pulse?

5           A.   Mm-hm.

6           Q.   You got PC Alan Smith to do something similar. Did he  
7           touch the same area, or did he touch a different area?

8           A.   I believe he did the exact same movement I did.

9           Q.   Same thing. And he couldn't feel a pulse and then you  
10           have said:

11                   "The officers relayed the deceased had no cardiac  
12           output and CPR commenced."

13                   Does that mean there was a message transmitted?

14           A.   I believe so, yes.

15           Q.   And do we see in fact on page 7 of the spreadsheet,  
16           7.25.17, from PC Smith:

17                   "Male now certainly appears to be unconscious,  
18           breathing, not responsive, get an ambulance for him."

19           A.   I don't believe that would be the message.

20           Q.   That was the first message --

21           A.   That's the unresponsive message.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. -- and then there's a message later, on page 11 of the  
2 spreadsheet at the top, and this is 7.29.30, from  
3 Scott Maxwell:

4 "Control can you get a move on with the ambulance.  
5 This accused is now not breathing. CPR is commencing.  
6 Over."

7 Is that the message that you --

8 A. I believe so, yes.

9 Q. -- remember. So the first message when he was  
10 unconscious but breathing, where -- were you --

11 A. I was still driving the van back, so I was aware --

12 Q. You were driving the van back?

13 A. -- but I wasn't at the restraint.

14 Q. You weren't there at that time?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. But when this second message is made by Scott Maxwell  
17 that he is not breathing and CPR is commencing, were you  
18 at the restraint at that point?

19 A. Yes, yes.

20 Q. So you had returned to the restraint from there?

21 A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. The van had been moved by that point?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Thank you. From the point you were at the restraint at  
4 that stage, did you see PC Smith do a test to see if he  
5 could get a pain response from Mr Bayoh?
- 6 A. I believe I have said in statements that I heard him  
7 trying to get a verbal response.
- 8 Q. What do you mean by that?
- 9 A. I believe he was just asking him "Are you" -- "Can you  
10 hear me" type scenario, "Are you okay?" I don't remember  
11 any kind of pain response. It could have happened, it's  
12 something I didn't observe.
- 13 Q. Do you remember at all seeing PC Paton slapping or  
14 tapping or patting Mr Bayoh on the face?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. At that time, was there anyone monitoring his breathing?
- 17 A. I don't have any recollection of that because when  
18 I arrived, I have pretty much immediately felt for  
19 a pulse and it was CPR so I don't know if that was maybe  
20 pre my arrival but I didn't observe any of that.
- 21 Q. All right, thank you.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1           In relation to how the officers in the area were,  
2           can you tell us where they -- how many officers were  
3           around at that time and where were they?

4       A. I knew all eight officers from team 4 were on scene.  
5           Exactly where they were, I don't know. PS Scott Maxwell  
6           was in the area of the restraint also. I was aware of  
7           him in my periphery. PC Craig Walker was again  
8           remaining on the left side of Mr Bayoh. Alan Paton was  
9           in and around the kind of head area on the pavement and  
10          I knew Alan Smith was down to my right. He was directly  
11          next to me on the right. Where the other officers were  
12          positioned -- I suspect nearby, but I don't know.

13       Q. What was PC Walker doing at the time?

14       A. He was just kneeling down to Mr Bayoh's side.

15       Q. What was PC Paton doing, do you remember?

16       A. Likewise, he was just kneeling down on the pavement but  
17          exactly I don't know.

18       Q. Do you know what PC Smith was doing?

19       A. When I arrived? He was kneeling down and, as I said, he  
20          was trying to get a verbal response. I certainly  
21          I think recall that and then I have went over, felt for

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           a pulse, he has done similar and then CPR has commenced.

2           Q.   And which officers commenced the CPR?

3           A.   PC Craig Walker.

4           Q.   And we have heard they sometimes work in teams of two.

5           A.   Yes.

6           Q.   Who was his team -- who was his partner?

7           A.   I suspect Alan Smith took over, but I didn't observe

8           that.

9           Q.   Did you observe the CPR?

10          A.   Yes.

11          Q.   By the time CPR was being performed, was Mr Bayoh in

12          handcuffs?

13          A.   Yes.

14          Q.   Was he in leg restraints?

15          A.   I never ever observed leg restraints.

16          Q.   You didn't?

17          A.   But it is -- they would have been in position but I do

18          not have a recollection of physically seeing them.

19          Q.   Did -- can I ask you, by that time, by the time you have

20          arrived, you're a sergeant in the CID --

21          A.   Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. -- we have heard about Maxwell was an acting police  
2 sergeant --
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. -- when you arrived at the scene, in terms of your rank  
5 and seniority, were you in charge at that point?
- 6 A. No, we were -- I wouldn't be in charge initially. That  
7 is a response call and we are attending not an  
8 investigative matter, we are attending to back up other  
9 police officers, so I wouldn't take charge of  
10 PS Maxwell's team or the situation, so we can work  
11 together, that's not an issue at all, we can work  
12 together, I will help him out, he can help me out, but  
13 certainly I was going as a support officer for the  
14 response.
- 15 Q. So you're not coming onto the scene and taking  
16 command --
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. -- or taking charge of that?
- 19 A. No. Unless I see I need to do so, I wouldn't do that.
- 20 Q. If you saw the need for you to do that --
- 21 A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. -- how would you communicate that to the officer who was  
2 in charge?

3 A. I would essentially discuss it constructively and pass  
4 my guidance on.

5 Q. Okay. But that conversation did not happen?

6 A. No.

7 Q. -- on this occasion?

8 A. No.

9 Q. So as far as you are concerned, who was in charge of  
10 this incident?

11 A. PS Scott Maxwell was there in charge of the incident  
12 initially and he was in charge of his officers.  
13 However, I will be happy to share that responsibility.  
14 I was on scene also and I was a sergeant.

15 Q. Okay, right.

16 So during the CPR when you're -- you're in the area  
17 and you see that proceeding.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And you think it was commenced by PC Walker.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. At any time did you consider instructing or requesting

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           that his handcuffs be removed?
- 2           A. No, I didn't consider instructing that. My sole focus  
3           was on Mr Bayoh, his upper body, looking at his face,  
4           looking at the CPR. If I'm being honest, I didn't even  
5           look at the cuffs. The urgency was life-saving kind of  
6           intervention so I didn't look at the cuffs, I didn't  
7           consider taking them off.
- 8           Q. And are you first aid trained?
- 9           A. Yes.
- 10          Q. You can perform that type of CPR?
- 11          A. Yes.
- 12          Q. Was there anything about the CPR at that time that  
13          caused you to have any concerns about its effectiveness  
14          or the way it was being performed?
- 15          A. No. I observed Craig Walker completing the CPR. As far  
16          as I'm aware, it was very effective, and there was no  
17          restriction to the chest area that I observed.
- 18          Q. We have heard that Mr Bayoh had his hands cuffed  
19          together at the front.
- 20          A. Yes.
- 21          Q. And that that position can compress the chest.



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Mm-hm.
- 2 Q. And could interfere with effective CPR.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. I'm paraphrasing, obviously, but we have heard evidence  
5 about that, and do you -- was there anything that drew  
6 your attention or caused you to have concern about the  
7 position of the handcuffs or the fact it was to the  
8 front?
- 9 A. My observation of CPR gave me no concern, you know, it  
10 was effective and it was ongoing, I had no concern and  
11 I was not drawn to the cuffs causing any issue. As  
12 I say -- and honestly, I didn't even look at the cuffs,  
13 my focus was on Mr Bayoh and the CPR and the concern for  
14 him.
- 15 Q. Now, you have told us when you first arrived Mr Bayoh  
16 was prone; you have told us about CPR.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. When CPR was being performed, was he on his back?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Were you present when he moved from his front to his  
21 back?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Did you see at any time how he was moved from his front  
3 to his back?
- 4 A. When I first arrived he was on his left side. When  
5 I came back with the van he was on his left side.  
6 I didn't know who moved him from his back to his left  
7 side and then obviously Alan Smith and Craig Walker took  
8 part in moving him to his back to perform CPR.
- 9 Q. So when you returned from moving the Transit van --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- he was on his left-hand side by that time?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And then you witnessed him being moved onto his back to  
14 start the CPR?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Thank you. Did you see PC Smith bringing a mask to try  
17 and provide rescue breaths?
- 18 A. No, I don't -- I didn't observe that. So I have  
19 obviously left PS Maxwell, the officers, with Mr Bayoh  
20 doing CPR and gone off to do other matters.
- 21 Q. Thank you. Did you see Mr Bayoh being stretchered into

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 the ambulance later?

2 A. I did.

3 Q. So you were back by that stage?

4 A. Yes, I was in that vicinity at all times but -- yes.

5 Q. Yes. Can I ask you then about paragraph 19 of your  
6 Inquiry statement, please. You say:

7 "Derek Connell was to my right-hand side (as you  
8 face Hendry Road), not far away, just across the road.  
9 He shouted over that he had recovered a knife. Whether  
10 he did that as I approached the officers and Mr Bayoh,  
11 or whether this was after I checked for a pulse, I can't  
12 remember. The order of that is a bit jumbled and  
13 I can't be 100% sure, but it probably happened pretty  
14 much all at the same time, because we were only a short  
15 distance away from each other and things were happening  
16 simultaneously. Somebody was shouting on this side and  
17 I was helping out this side. So, it's probably all  
18 consecutively happening about the same time."

19 I'm interested in this knife.

20 A. Mm-hm.

21 Q. Can you tell me about DC Connell's involvement with

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that?

2           A. Obviously when I have arrived back with the van after  
3           Nicole Short had gone to the hospital, Mr Bayoh is  
4           unresponsive but obviously Derek is over to my right  
5           which would be the north side of Hayfield Road, the  
6           grass area on the corner, and he shouts that he has  
7           located the knife. By this point he has already  
8           collected the knife from its original position from the  
9           grass and walking towards our vehicle, so I have gone to  
10          the boot of our vehicle, there's not a big enough knife  
11          tube that we had within the boot, so I grabbed a brown  
12          evidence bag. We put it within the bag and then secured  
13          it and locked our vehicle and secured it within the  
14          vehicle.

15          Q. Could I ask you to look at something for me, please, and  
16          I'm just going to -- it's in a plastic tube and I'm just  
17          going to ask you if you recognise this.

18          A. Yes.

19          Q. And what is that?

20          A. That is the knife.

21          Q. That's the knife that you have just described to us --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- that DC Connell recovered, and actually you will see  
3 a photograph on the screen which shows the knife and  
4 that's the knife that was recovered from Hayfield Road  
5 in the grassy area?

6 A. Yes, and my signature is on that.

7 Q. That's lovely, thank you very much.

8 Then can I ask you just to confirm something,  
9 7.31.13, which you will see at the bottom of page 11,  
10 and we have heard some evidence at this stage that there  
11 had been a request initially for a dog unit to attend  
12 and during the course of the events on 3 May that  
13 a Gary Wood from the dog unit had been in touch and then  
14 you were involved to say Gary Wood at 7.31.02 said:

15 "That's great, thank you. Was there any talk,  
16 I dinnae hear the entirety of the job initially came in.  
17 Is there anything else that's outstanding that you may  
18 require a dog for?"

19 And you made the transmission at 7.31.13 and said  
20 "No negative".

21 So it was you that told the dog unit, Gary Wood,

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that he wasn't any longer required?

2           A. I believe so. I have no recollection of that, but yes,  
3           it is recorded obviously.

4           Q. Thank you. At paragraph 21 of your Inquiry statement  
5           please, if we can have that on the screen:

6                     "At the point of Mr Bayoh becoming unresponsive and  
7           in cardiac arrest ..."

8                     This is the point at which CPR was commenced?

9           A. Yes.

10          Q. "... the situation changed to a far more serious  
11          incident and something that CID would lead on. So, it  
12          was at that point that the transition is that I'm going  
13          to start taking control of this incident. It's no  
14          longer a uniformed response incident. I collected  
15          barrier tape from one of the police vehicles. I'm not  
16          sure which one. We're all in all the vehicles, so it  
17          would have been whatever vehicle was nearby to me.  
18          I then set parameters for the locus protection, which  
19          was at the junction of Hayfield Road with Hendry Road  
20          and also Hayfield Road with Poplar Road. As I was  
21          setting the barrier tape on Poplar Road, that's when the

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 ambulance has arrived. I allowed them in and then set  
2 the cordon again and I put officers on locus protection,  
3 which was PC Kayleigh Good at the  
4 Hayfield Road/Hendry Road junction and PC McDonough at  
5 the Hayfield Road/Poplar Road junction with instructions  
6 not to allow anybody to enter unless they have  
7 permission to do so."

8 If we can go back to the top of that, I will ask you  
9 some questions. So I asked you a few moments ago about  
10 who was in charge and you explained your understanding  
11 of the position initially, but you said in paragraph 21  
12 that when Mr Bayoh became unresponsive in cardiac arrest  
13 and CPR was commenced, that you realised this was a far  
14 more serious incident?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So was this the point at which things changed in terms  
17 of command and who was in charge?

18 A. Yes, I instinctively took charge at that point, knowing  
19 the kind of gravity of the situation, and obviously  
20 started completing some priority actions in containing  
21 the scene, et cetera.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. Right. So because you were on the scene at that time  
2 you were able to take that decision --

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- as soon as that happened?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And when you talk about taking priority decisions, can  
7 you maybe explain to us what priority decisions were  
8 taken by you?

9 A. So the initial one was scene management in terms of  
10 setting parameters and securing the area, in terms of  
11 any further contamination of the area. I would be  
12 resourcing persons within the ambulance and also at the  
13 hospital, and then we would then follow on to, you know,  
14 contacting initial witnesses, et cetera, gathering  
15 information to develop the situation.

16 Q. So that then becomes a serious investigation that will  
17 need witnesses and such-like?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And so in terms of you taking control, is that something  
20 that you shared with Acting Police Sergeant Maxwell, or  
21 was that something that you just naturally or



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           instinctively took control of?

2           A. No, time was not on our side. Essentially

3           I instinctively done that. PS Scott Maxwell did not

4           object to it. We didn't have a big discussion about it,

5           it was just something that happened and he went along

6           with.

7           Q. And would it have been reasonably obvious to Maxwell or

8           other officers that you were now in more of a control --

9           taking control, being more proactive?

10          A. Yes. He was still in control of his own officers,

11          I didn't take full control from him, but I was

12          controlling and containing the scene and the incident.

13          Q. Right. So by the time we looked at that message that

14          you made -- you made a couple of messages on page 11 of

15          the spreadsheet, so we see the entry at 7.29.30 towards

16          the top of the page, Scott Maxwell:

17                 "Get a move on with the ambulance. This accused is

18                 now not breathing. CPR is commencing. Over."

19          So how long after that call would you say you took

20          command? We see the entry 7.29.51 where you say:

21                 "That's me now taping this area off. Did you hear

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           the last?"

2                   Was it really from that point that you were in  
3           charge?

4           A.   Yes, in or around that point.

5           Q.   In or around.  And when you say "Taping the area off" is  
6           that -- we have seen some footage with officers taping  
7           off one end of Hayfield Road at the roundabout end.  Is  
8           that the sort of exercise that was being carried out by  
9           officers?

10          A.   Yes.  I would tell them exactly where I want it taped.  
11          It's the police barrier tape, essentially, and you just  
12          cordon that area and guard it.

13          Q.   Thanks.  And as one of the actions that you take when  
14          you're taking control of what's become a serious  
15          incident, do you also prepare a scene log?

16          A.   You don't prepare one; they're within the vehicle,  
17          they're blank documents or blank books.

18          Q.   Can we look at paragraph 22, please:

19                   "I am asked about what the usual practice would have  
20           been regarding having a scene log.  The scene log would  
21           generally start as soon as practical, if you have them

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 to hand, given the situation. We ... have [them in]  
2 vehicles ... they can be produced fairly quickly, and if  
3 not, we [could] collect them from the nearest police  
4 station."

5 So really as soon as an incident becomes more  
6 serious and you're in charge, these are the sorts of  
7 documentation that you want to have to hand?

8 A. Yes, the scene log is essentially there to log anybody  
9 coming to and from entry from the scene, so it's  
10 essentially persons, scenes of crime photographers,  
11 et cetera.

12 Q. Anyone entering into your --

13 A. Yes, cordon, yes.

14 Q. -- secure area or leaving the secure area?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And the timings of those?

17 A. The timings and rationale for visit and permission.

18 Q. And the purpose of that is to have a record of everyone  
19 entering or leaving the scene?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Thanks. Then paragraph 23 you say:

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1            "I told DC Connell to accompany [Mr] Bayoh to the  
2            hospital. I see from my statement that DI Robson was  
3            back at the scene by that time ..."

4            You told us earlier he had gone to take Nicole Short  
5            to the hospital:

6            "... and that we had a discussion about the  
7            cordons."

8            What are the cordons?

9            A. That is the police barrier tape.

10          Q. And then you say:

11          "A discussion also took place between PI Kay,  
12          Sergeant Maxwell and me regarding replacing the officers  
13          at the scene: that the officers involved should return  
14          to the Kirkcaldy Police Office and go to the canteen."

15          So do we see that Inspector Kay had arrived by this  
16          time?

17          A. Yes.

18          Q. Do you remember when he arrived?

19          A. He gave me a point-to-point. I think he was originally  
20          on Victoria Road. There was a confusion initially with  
21          a few of the calls, and he had gone to Victoria Road

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 point-to-point and I told him to come up to  
2 Hayfield Road. I don't -- I think that was after  
3 Mr Bayoh went into cardiac arrest. I don't think it was  
4 before then.

5 Q. So after he has gone into cardiac arrest, after the  
6 ambulance has been called?

7 A. Possibly, I don't know.

8 Q. But before the ambulance has arrived and taken him to  
9 hospital?

10 A. I'm not sure.

11 Q. Not sure. So -- but he was there at some point at the  
12 scene?

13 A. Mm-hm.

14 Q. And then this discussion took place between you,  
15 Inspector Kay and Sergeant Maxwell about the officers  
16 involved returning to Kirkcaldy Police Office.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Tell us about that.

19 A. Well, essentially we were on scene. All the officers  
20 looked, you know, particularly shocked, quiet, I was  
21 really worried about their welfare actually. My initial

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 concern was this was the full Kirkcaldy resource; what  
2 do we do to answer the calls that are still coming in,  
3 and my fear was that the controller would dispatch these  
4 officers to another call.

5 Q. I see.

6 A. So I made it clear to Inspector Kay that I think we need  
7 to quickly resource Kirkcaldy with other officers so  
8 these officers would not be sent to another call,  
9 because if an immediate 999 call came in there was  
10 a potential that they would get pulled away and  
11 dispatched, so I knew that they weren't fit to do so,  
12 they were in shock and they needed to return and debrief  
13 back at the station.

14 Q. Right. So as part of that you needed to resource other  
15 officers who could take control of any 999 calls that  
16 came in?

17 A. That was Inspector Kay's --

18 Q. So was that was -- but you raised that concern with  
19 him --

20 A. I raised that concern with him.

21 Q. -- at that point. And then it goes on to say:

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1            "At that time PC Good and McDonough remained on  
2 scene undertaking locus protection."

3            So did you feel at that stage that PC Good and  
4 McDonough were sufficiently well to continue with duties  
5 on locus protection?

6            A. More so than the other officers. However, I wanted to  
7 replace them as soon as I could as well, but I had no  
8 other option. It was essentially use both of them at  
9 that time. They appeared okay with that, they agreed to  
10 it, and then we quickly obviously resourced and replaced  
11 them.

12           Q. Thank you.

13           "My statement notes that I recall PC Paton and  
14 Walker were running to the police van. The word running  
15 here is incorrect. PC Paton and PC Walker were directly  
16 next to the van and would have no requirement or  
17 opportunity to run. I recall observing both sitting in  
18 the van with the engine running and they left locus  
19 thereafter."

20           So PC Walker and PC Paton, had they gone back to the  
21 Transit van that they had arrived in originally?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. They were now sitting within the Transit van, yes.
- 2 Q. Walker in the driver seat?
- 3 A. I believe so, yes.
- 4 Q. But they weren't running to the van, it was (inaudible -  
5 overspeaking) engine running?
- 6 A. No, I think that's a typo, yes, a typo in the PIRC  
7 statement which I corrected. The van was running; they  
8 weren't running.
- 9 Q. Thank you. And paragraph 24, you went back to Kirkcaldy  
10 Police Office at 8 o'clock. You say that DC Connell was  
11 at Victoria Hospital with Sheku Bayoh. So we may hear  
12 that he had gone in the ambulance.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. You had not spoken to any senior officers on your  
15 return. You mention a couple of officers there at  
16 Kirkcaldy CID and they were sent to Victoria Hospital to  
17 remain with Mr Bayoh and then if we can move up the  
18 page, please.
- 19 You made arrangements in relation to what was  
20 happening at the hospital at that time and are those two  
21 officers, Balsillie and Brown, was it, sorry?



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Mm-hm.

2 Q. Are they part of your -- or were they part of your team  
3 at that time?

4 A. Yes, they commenced duty at 8 o'clock, it is a staggered  
5 start, so it was myself and Derek Connell at 7.00;  
6 Ryan Balsillie and Andrew Brown were starting at  
7 8 o'clock.

8 Q. Right. And then:

9 "... Connell returned to Kirkcaldy around quarter  
10 past 8. He had a gold mobile phone and a lighter which  
11 I understand belonged to Mr Bayoh and these items were  
12 placed in the ambulance with DC Connell. It was at this  
13 point that DC Connell explained he had taken  
14 a photograph of the knife in situ with his mobile phone  
15 and he had been instructed by DI Robson to do this."

16 Is that the knife that you identified for me just  
17 moments ago?

18 A. Yes, it is.

19 Q. So DC Connell had actually taken a photograph at the  
20 scene of the knife, before he picked it up and recovered  
21 it?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And then paragraph 25:

3 "I am asked about an Airwave transmission at 8.18 in  
4 which I transmitted to the officers at the locus asking  
5 the officer who had taken a statement to point-to-point  
6 me."

7 We have heard that that's a direct radio call  
8 between one officer and another.

9 A. Mm-hm.

10 Q. And then you require a certain number of the radio you  
11 wish to contact in order to do that:

12 "One of the officers involved in locus protection  
13 mentioned he had been approached at the cordon.  
14 I didn't have the number to phone him. When  
15 I transmitted to request that officer to make contact my  
16 number would have been visible and able to him to then  
17 point-to-point me."

18 So this is really just you're continuing to  
19 communicate with an officer at the scene at  
20 Hayfield Road but you're back in Kirkcaldy Police Office  
21 at this time?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           A. I believe so, yes.

2           Q. Thank you. Can I ask you to look at some photographs  
3           now, please, for me. 03374. Am I correct in saying  
4           that it was you that added all the names to this  
5           photograph?

6           A. I don't believe it's my writing, it was the PIRC  
7           officer's writing, but yes, I talked through it and  
8           named each officer on scene.

9           Q. And we see DC Connell heading towards the grassy area at  
10          the top of the screen.

11          A. Yes.

12          Q. In the blue jacket.

13          A. Mm-hm.

14          Q. And then we can see you, DS Davidson, dressed in dark  
15          clothing -- did you have your hair up that day?

16          A. Yes.

17          Q. And that's you standing next to -- or to the right of  
18          PC Smith. And again, looking at that picture today, do  
19          you still agree with everyone you have identified?

20          A. Yes, I believe so.

21          Q. Now can we look at the next photograph, please, and

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           again it may not be your writing but again, did you  
2           identify people from this photograph?

3           A. Yes, I believe I did, yes.

4           Q. So again, those are your identifications. Thank you.  
5           And you agree with those today?

6           A. Yes.

7           Q. Thank you. Before you left the scene, did you issue any  
8           instructions to officers not to confer or discuss the  
9           incident with each other?

10          A. I did not instruct them.

11          Q. And is there a reason for that or not?

12          A. It just wasn't priority at the time, I didn't think  
13          about it. My concern was scene management, tasking the  
14          priority actions and the welfare of the officers. The  
15          non-conferring aspect, I didn't even consider it on  
16          scene.

17          Q. Okay. And then at some stage were you involved in  
18          identifying Mr Bayoh?

19          A. Yes.

20          Q. And I think you have given the Chair information about  
21          that in paragraph 31 of your Inquiry statement. And was

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           that in relation to, or in comparison to images that you  
2           recovered from Facebook?

3           A. I didn't recover them from Facebook; I think it was  
4           a family member that had recovered them.

5           Q. And you used that as a comparison?

6           A. Yes.

7           Q. With Mr Bayoh at the hospital?

8           A. Yes.

9           Q. And can I ask you how is it normally done, that you work  
10          out the identification of someone who is in hospital?

11          A. In hospital generally when we're in that setting, family  
12          are with the person, have probably travelled with or  
13          been contacted --

14          Q. But if you don't know the person?

15          A. In a hospital setting, it depends if it's an unexplained  
16          death or an expected death. If it's an unexplained  
17          death and there's forensic aspects to it, then it will  
18          be an SIO's decision how we go about identification.  
19          Obviously it's very important that we complete that. On  
20          most occasions, for an unexplained death where forensic  
21          integrity is a matter, we would convey the deceased to

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 the mortuary. There's an area -- a viewing area in the  
2 mortuary where it's behind glass, so there's no physical  
3 contact at that stage, so we could do the identity with  
4 least impact to the forensic integrity. That was how  
5 I would normally do it, would be at the mortuary  
6 setting.

7 Q. And you have mentioned the SIO, that's the senior  
8 investigating officer?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. So who would that have been on 3 May 2015?

11 A. Initially obviously on scene it was myself was the  
12 deputy SIO, Colin Wilson was the SIO, however, that  
13 changed dynamically throughout the day because more  
14 senior officers arrived. I'm not privy to the structure  
15 of command thereafter, so it would be probably something  
16 that would have to be asked of someone else.

17 Q. Okay. When you returned to Kirkcaldy Police Office we  
18 understand the officers went back to the canteen?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And I think you have given some information in your  
21 Inquiry statement, paragraphs 63 and 64 --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. That doesn't look --

2 Q. Maybe I've got the wrong --

3 A. Wrong numbers.

4 Q. I don't know why I've got those numbers there. Let's

5 forget that, forget I said that. Terrible typo there.

6 Did you have any involvement with speaking to the

7 officers in the canteen about what they should be doing,

8 providing any information, giving any statements?

9 A. No.

10 Q. We may have heard some evidence that one or more officer

11 felt that you and DC Connell were treated differently --

12 A. Mm-hm.

13 Q. -- to the officers who had been at the scene maybe

14 involved in the restraint.

15 A. Mm-hm.

16 Q. Were you aware of that at the time?

17 A. I was aware -- I wasn't aware of post-incident

18 procedures, that's not something I was aware of, I don't

19 believe that was routine for death in -- or serious

20 injury in custody. I believe that that was something

21 that came in later, but at that moment in time, I had no

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 awareness of post-incident procedures or the role of  
2 a post-incident manager. I don't believe the officers  
3 would have done either. My belief was that they were in  
4 the canteen for a welfare aspect, nothing other than  
5 that.

6 Q. And we may have heard some evidence -- we have heard  
7 some evidence that one of the officers felt that perhaps  
8 you were getting favourable treatment because you were  
9 allowed to leave the canteen and go about your business  
10 to some extent --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- as did DC Connell, whereas they were told to remain  
13 within the canteen. Can you explain why that would have  
14 been?

15 A. To be fair, retrospectively I understand that and  
16 I acknowledge that. At the time I wasn't told to go  
17 anywhere specific, I wasn't told I was subject to any  
18 specific procedures, so I didn't. I continued in my  
19 job, I had a job to do, I had other jobs to do and  
20 I believe -- you know, I was under the belief they could  
21 have left the canteen so no, I didn't question it.



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           Apologies.
- 2           Q. No, not at all. So you just went about your normal  
3           business that day, after you got back to Kirkcaldy  
4           Police Office?
- 5           A. Yes, I had other matters to...
- 6           Q. And did you complete your notebook and you obviously  
7           completed your self-penned statement and gave  
8           a statement to PIRC at an earlier date in May and then  
9           again on 2 June.
- 10          A. Yes.
- 11          Q. Thank you. Did you have any involvement with  
12          Amanda Givan?
- 13          A. No.
- 14          Q. Can I ask you just one or two questions about race  
15          before we complete this section.
- 16                 Can I ask you -- you're obviously an inspector.
- 17          A. Yes.
- 18          Q. I have been asking officers about equality and diversity  
19          training, and many of them have spoken about training  
20          they had at Tulliallan.
- 21          A. Mm-hm.

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

- 1 Q. And it would appear that many of them have said they  
2 didn't really receive any additional equality and  
3 diversity training. Is that your experience?
- 4 A. My experience is obviously the initial -- we had two  
5 weeks when we first joined. I believe I also had  
6 diversity and equality training locally in Fife in 2014,  
7 which is recorded on my SCoPE, and recently we have had  
8 further training online which is to do with the  
9 competency and value frameworks. Fundamentally that  
10 brings in human rights, et cetera, so within that  
11 package, online package and testing, there was also  
12 aspects to do with diversity within that.
- 13 Q. And is that training that you have had as part of your  
14 role as inspector, or is that just across  
15 Police Scotland?
- 16 A. No, that's across Police Scotland.
- 17 Q. For all officers, of any rank?
- 18 A. The competency and value framework?
- 19 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. All officers should complete that.
- 21 Q. Right, thank you. And part of that involves equality

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

- 1           and diversity training?
- 2       A.   Yes, within that, yes.
- 3       Q.   Was any of that training in relation to race,
- 4           discrimination, bias?
- 5       A.   It's about integrity, fairness and respect for all
- 6           cultures within your community, so it doesn't go
- 7           specific, it's that kind of fundamental principles, the
- 8           overarching principles or values, and how you should, as
- 9           a person have them personal values as well, on or
- 10          off-duty, so that's the framework that we as
- 11          police officers should abide by and we should value,
- 12          personally and whilst -- as an officer.
- 13       Q.   Right.  And was any part of any of the training you have
- 14          had -- did any of it relate to unconscious bias or
- 15          recognising unconscious bias?
- 16       A.   I don't believe it was labelled unconscious bias, but
- 17          I don't recall.
- 18       Q.   Has any of the training ever asked you to self-reflect
- 19          or consider your own bias, or asked you to recognise any
- 20          unconscious bias or anything like that?
- 21       A.   Most of the -- even my detective training you have to be

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 self-reflective to learn and develop and evolve, so  
2 self-reflection is something that is apparent in most  
3 training packages that we do, certainly detective  
4 packages, senior investigating officer's training, and  
5 the CVF also, to be self-reflective.

6 Q. And have you been taught any tools or skills that would  
7 allow you to guard against bias or prejudice or  
8 discrimination?

9 A. No tools, there's no specific tools to go by. It's  
10 inevitably to be open minded, considerate, and if you're  
11 open minded, you will make accurate and informed  
12 decisions. If you're not open minded and you're not  
13 taking in all accounts, then you will make inaccurate  
14 and, you know, poor decisions, essentially, so yes, open  
15 mindedness is the main factor for me anyway.

16 Q. All right, thank you. When you were at Hayfield Road  
17 were you aware at that time -- so we're  
18 talking May 2015. Were you aware at that time about  
19 some high profile deaths in the UK and abroad of people,  
20 particularly black men, dying after police restraint?

21 A. I have to say I have no recollection. I have tried --

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 I knew -- and kind of -- this question had been asked  
2 before and honestly, if I'm answering that honestly and  
3 uninfluenced, I have no -- I have no recollection.

4 Q. That's not something you had been taught about or had  
5 been raised with you in any training courses?

6 A. Possibly, but I can't recall.

7 Q. So you weren't aware of any particular risks associated  
8 with restraint in the prone position or statistical  
9 information about --

10 A. I was aware about risks in terms of prone position,  
11 we're aware about positional asphyxia, et cetera, we're  
12 taught that in OST, so I was aware of prone position  
13 being a risk.

14 Q. Right. When you saw Mr Bayoh on the ground in  
15 Hayfield Road being restrained by officers, you have  
16 told us when you arrived he was in the prone position.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Did you consider the risks, significant risks of that  
19 restraint when Mr Bayoh was in the prone position?

20 A. I did not consider intervening or thinking there was  
21 a kind of increased risk at that point. As I have

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 detailed that my impression was -- my assessment was  
2 that he had just become to be in that position due to  
3 the timeline of events and that once cuffs were applied,  
4 he would be moved into a safer position. Yes, I didn't  
5 observe that movement, however, that was my assessment  
6 and I didn't consider any risks at that point.

7 Q. Did you consider at that stage calling for an ambulance  
8 straight away?

9 A. No.

10 MS GRAHAME: If you would just give me a moment, please.

11 Thank you very much.

12 LORD BRACADALE: Any Rule 9 applications? Ms Mitchell.

13 Detective Inspector, would you retire to the witness  
14 room, please, while I hear a submission.

15 (Pause).

16 Yes, Ms Mitchell, if you come to the table please.

17 (Pause).

18 Application by MS MITCHELL

19 MS MITCHELL: Yes, the first issue is in relation to the  
20 taking control of the scene, barrier tape having been  
21 placed up, and it was simply to ask after Sheku Bayoh's

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 body was removed in the ambulance, did the officer  
2 notice batons lying around and did she consider taking  
3 any action in relation to them.

4 The next issue is in relation to the sudden death  
5 report and we had understood from a section 9  
6 application that my learned friend was going to ask  
7 questions on this, and I don't think my learned friend  
8 highlighted that particular issue so I would like to ask  
9 some of the questions that we wanted to in relation to  
10 that, namely what was the purpose of the report, what is  
11 the content of a sudden death report. The witness  
12 indicates that she had sight of and relied upon  
13 Zahid Saeed and Collette Bell's statement when she wrote  
14 the document for the sudden death report and to ask her  
15 what the relevance of those two witnesses were for that  
16 report and whether or not she thought to seek any  
17 information from the officers that were in attendance  
18 and, if not, why not? And the death report itself  
19 states:

20 "This resulted in the deceased being restrained to  
21 the ground. Handcuff and leg restraints were applied

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 (details of officers involved are known to PIRC and are  
2 not included in this report)."

3 And to ask why the details of the officers involved  
4 were not included in the death report.

5 The next issue is in relation to something  
6 my learned friend did touch on, which was the  
7 identification and the treatment of Mr Bayoh's body, and  
8 it is to ask more questions in relation to paragraph 31  
9 of the witness's statement.

10 The witness did give information that this was not  
11 an orthodox way of identifying, and she gave some  
12 information of what was the orthodox way or  
13 straightforward, and she gave an explanation about  
14 urgency, and what I want to ask was what had been the  
15 delay to that point and then ask her if she was then at  
16 11.00 am able to accurately confirm that it was  
17 Mr Bayoh, who she confirmed that to, and also given the  
18 fact was that the urgency was to let his family know as  
19 soon as possible, to explore the fact that despite some  
20 four hours passing, Sheku Bayoh's family members, his  
21 sister and other family members, had still not been



## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 informed.

2 Lastly, the Inquiry -- second last, the Inquiry may  
3 come to hear that Sheku Bayoh's sister and his  
4 brother-in-law were asked to identify Mr Bayoh later on  
5 and they asked if that could happen the next day when  
6 Mr Sheku Bayoh's mother had arrived in Scotland and to  
7 ascertain whether or not it would be orthodox to have  
8 a second identification by family members.

9 Finally, to ask this witness whether or not she is  
10 aware of the identity of the person who contacted the  
11 Sierra Leone Embassy to have Sheku Bayoh's body  
12 repatriated.

13 LORD BRACADALE: Ms Grahame, in relation to the sudden death  
14 report, is that something that the Inquiry will be  
15 looking at a later stage?

16 MS GRAHAME: Yes, and I apologise to Ms Mitchell, I should  
17 have explained this to her earlier today and it slipped  
18 my mind.

19 There is reference in the witness's Inquiry  
20 statement to the sudden death report, paragraphs 34, 35  
21 and 36, and I -- initially when I was considering the

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 Rule 9 application I said I would be happy to ask  
2 further questions. I checked the position and it was  
3 confirmed to me this morning that the sudden death  
4 report was not cleared for disclosure to core  
5 participants, has not ever been disclosed, and it is not  
6 at a stage it has been cleared for disclosure publicly,  
7 and so it wouldn't be possible to have any of that on  
8 the screen, and in relation to the Inquiry witness  
9 statement, this witness has indicated already -- and  
10 this is evidence before the Chair, that she created  
11 a synopsis used to assist DS Moore and DI Wilson to  
12 submit the SDR, and we will be exploring this at a later  
13 stage, but as at today's hearing, I'm not in a position  
14 to put any of the content of that onto the screen or to  
15 make it public.

16 LORD BRACADALE: Very well. I think we should leave the  
17 sudden death report for later.

18 Is that all the matters?

19 MS MITCHELL: Those were all the matters.

20 LORD BRACADALE: Right.

21 (Pause).



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           important matters thoroughly and in a later hearing, so  
2           I can allow you to ask the question about the batons,  
3           but the other matters seem to me to be all for later --  
4           to be addressed at a later stage.

5                       So do you wish to ask the question about the batons?

6   MS MITCHELL:   Yes, indeed, my Lord.

7   LORD BRACADALE:  We will rearrange the seating for that.

8                       (Pause).

9                       TEMPORARY DI SAMANTHA DAVIDSON (continued)

10   LORD BRACADALE:  Detective Inspector, you're going to be  
11           asked some questions by Ms Mitchell, counsel for the  
12           family.

13                       Questions from MS MITCHELL

14   MS MITCHELL:   There is just one issue I want to ask you  
15           about and that's in relation to the point at the scene  
16           at Hayfield Road, where you took control, you have given  
17           your evidence to explain that at a point you realised it  
18           was more serious and you took over control, and one of  
19           the things that you did was to put up barrier tape?

20   A.   Yes.

21   Q.   And you have given an explanation of why you might want

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 to secure that area, and I think you gave evidence to  
2 say that one of the initial things you did was scene  
3 management in terms of setting parameters and securing  
4 the area, and in terms of any further contamination of  
5 the area, is that correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. After Sheku Bayoh's body was removed and it was put in  
8 the ambulance, did you see police batons lying around?

9 A. Not at that stage, no. I was aware that they were  
10 already collected by DC Connell.

11 Q. So having known that they were collected, did you take  
12 any action in relation to them as to what should be done  
13 with them?

14 A. They were already seized from their original position,  
15 we were past that point, so they would be seized as  
16 a production. I wouldn't place them back on the ground,  
17 that wouldn't be --

18 Q. No, I wasn't suggesting that, but if you knew they had  
19 been bagged, were you going to decide to put them  
20 somewhere or...?

21 A. They were within my police vehicle and I subsequently

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 seized them individually in evidence production bags.

2 Q. Okay. So you split them up?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And tagged them, presumably?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And then did what?

7 A. They were lodged as a production with the inquiry team.

8 LORD BRACADALE: Thank you.

9 Detective inspector, thank you very much for coming  
10 to give evidence to the Inquiry. I'm going to rise  
11 briefly to let the next witness to be brought in and you  
12 will then be free to go.

13 A. Thank you, sir.

14 (3.25 pm)

15 (Short Break)

16 (3.30 pm)

17 LORD BRACADALE: Now, Ms Grahame, who is the next witness?

18 MS GRAHAME: The next witness is DC Jennifer Bruce.

19 LORD BRACADALE: Good afternoon, Detective Constable. Would  
20 you take the oath.

21 A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1                   DETECTIVE CONSTABLE JENNIFER BRUCE (sworn)

2           LORD BRACADALE: Ms Grahame.

3                   Questions from MS GRAHAME

4           MS GRAHAME: Thank you.

5                   You are Jennifer Bruce?

6           A. Yes.

7           Q. What age are you?

8           A. 37.

9           Q. How many years' service do you have?

10          A. 14.

11          Q. And you have been a DC since 2014?

12          A. 2012.

13          Q. Oh, sorry, my mistake. Prior to that you had been

14                a police constable?

15          A. Yes.

16          Q. And we have all your contact details, so we don't need

17                to look at those.

18          A. Yes.

19          Q. Have you been able to watch any of the other evidence

20                that we have had?

21          A. Yes.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 Q. Great. You will know there's a black folder in front of  
2 you?  
3 A. Yes.  
4 Q. Let's look at the two things that should be there, the  
5 first should be PS 00772, a statement dated 5 May 2015?  
6 A. Yes.  
7 Q. This was an operational statement, was it?  
8 A. Yes, this is a statement I compiled myself.  
9 Q. A statement you prepared --  
10 A. Yes.  
11 Q. -- on 5 May, two days after the events we're here to  
12 explore?  
13 A. That's correct.  
14 Q. And were you doing your best to give a true and accurate  
15 record of your involvement with these events in that  
16 statement?  
17 A. Yes.  
18 Q. Thank you. And then can we look at your Inquiry  
19 statement, please, SBPI 32. This is a statement you  
20 have given to the Inquiry taken by a member of the team  
21 on 14 March 2022. Do you have that in your black folder



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 as well?

2 A. Yes, I do.

3 Q. And can we look at the last paragraph, 35, and we will  
4 see that it says:

5 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
6 statement are true. I understand that this statement  
7 may form part of the evidence before the Inquiry and be  
8 published on the Inquiry's website."

9 And am I correct in saying you signed every page?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And that was on 14 April this year?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Lovely. You have hard copies of those. If you want to  
14 refer to any part of them at any time, please feel free  
15 to do so, and if it's not on the screen, I will make  
16 sure it gets on the screen.

17 So paragraph 4, first of all. You were part of  
18 a major investigation team and you started as a DC in  
19 MIT and you were there in May 2015.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And then paragraph 7. Your team -- you say you always

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           worked in Dundee, but your team helped cover the Fife  
2           area and sometimes worked weekend cover and occasionally  
3           be asked to go to Kirkcaldy?

4           A.   Yes.

5           Q.   And -- but it wasn't your usual base, Kirkcaldy?

6           A.   No.

7           Q.   You would sometimes work there?

8           A.   I worked in Dundee and we generally covered the north so  
9           we would go Aberdeen, Inverness way, but just given how  
10          close we were at Fife, if need be, we would come to  
11          Fife, but not very often.

12          Q.   Sometimes?

13          A.   Yes.

14          Q.   Then paragraphs 14 and 15, you tell us that on  
15          3 May 2015 you started at 8 o'clock in the morning in  
16          Dundee and that was you and a colleague and you were the  
17          only two working in the MIT in Dundee that day. It was  
18          a Sunday.

19          A.   Yes.

20          Q.   And then paragraph 15, you were asked to go and help in  
21          Kirkcaldy, so you then travelled to Kirkcaldy.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. That's right.
- 2 Q. And what time did you arrive in Kirkcaldy?
- 3 A. I think from my first statement it said we were asked to  
4 go about 11 o'clock, and then maybe we took 40 minutes  
5 to get there, so probably just before lunchtime.
- 6 Q. So was it a senior officer in Dundee asked you and your  
7 colleague to travel --
- 8 A. We had a sergeant in Dundee who was dealing with another  
9 incident, so he asked us to go to Kirkcaldy.
- 10 Q. And you went there to help in connection with the  
11 Sheku Bayoh incident?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And what was your role to be?
- 14 A. Just an enquiry officer, just to assist with any  
15 enquiries that were required. Usually it would be  
16 noting witness statements.
- 17 Q. So you are really an additional resource at Kirkcaldy to  
18 help organise and prepare the investigation?
- 19 A. Yes, generally it would be noting civilian witness  
20 statements, I think that was the role that we were  
21 tasked with.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. And I think you have said in paragraph 17 of your  
2 Inquiry statement that you did actually take a witness  
3 statement at that time?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Can I ask you about your involvement with  
6 Inspector Combe, Jane Combe?
- 7 A. Yes, so later on that day, my colleague that I had been  
8 working with finished duty, so I was left without  
9 a double up, and I was asked, being a female, if I would  
10 pair up with a female inspector to assist in seizing  
11 clothing.
- 12 Q. Right. And can we look at paragraph 18, please.  
13 I think you say Keith, your colleague, had to finish on  
14 time:  
15 " ... so I ended up there [on your] own. I was  
16 paired up with a uniform Inspector just to seize some  
17 clothing. Her name was Inspector Jane Combe. I hadn't  
18 worked with her before. I don't remember who asked me  
19 to do that."
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And were you aware of Inspector Combe at that time?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. No, I had never met her before.
- 2 Q. You had never previously met her. Can I ask you, did  
3 you have any involvement with Conrad Trickett that day,  
4 who was the post-incident manager?
- 5 A. I was aware he was there because he had also come from  
6 Tayside, but no, I didn't have any --
- 7 Q. No involvement with him?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Can I look at paragraph 19. You have been asked here  
10 about seizing clothing:
- 11 "We seized the clothing of four officers and I wrote  
12 up the labels and helped seal up the bags. Seizing the  
13 clothing of the officers is to try and preserve the  
14 productions forensically."
- 15 And we have heard some evidence today that forensic  
16 seizing rather than just normal seizing would involve  
17 officers wearing white uniforms?
- 18 A. Yes, a forensic suit.
- 19 Q. Suits, sorry, that's the word, it's Friday afternoon.  
20 So did you wear a forensic suit, a white forensic  
21 suit that day?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 A. Yes. We wore a different one for each officer and then  
2 bagged up those suits.

3 Q. And did Inspector Combe also wear that?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And we have already heard that after each item -- each  
6 officer has been dealt with, the white suit that you're  
7 wearing is then folded up and also seized at that time?

8 A. Yes, and then we put a new one on for the next officer.

9 Q. And what's the reason for that being done?

10 A. Just to avoid any cross-contamination for when they're  
11 later examined.

12 Q. So the items you're examining are then sent off to be  
13 forensically examined by other scientists and forensic  
14 people?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And some of the items that you recovered were from  
17 Nicole Short?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. PC Short?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. It wasn't just only female officers that you seized

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 items from that day, but she was one of them?

2 A. Yes. I think initially it was all females and then  
3 I think there was one male at the end.

4 Q. All right, thank you. Could we look at paragraph 20,  
5 please. It is on the screen:

6 "Specifically on that day, as best as I can  
7 remember, we got the officers to stand on a brown paper  
8 bag and take each item of their uniform off. We were in  
9 forensic suits as well, with gloves on. As they took  
10 each item off, they would hand it to me or the  
11 Inspector, and we would put it in a production bag and  
12 we would give the production a name by writing on the  
13 bag or label. We just did that until we had every item  
14 that we needed. Then we bagged up our own forensic  
15 suits and gloves. You end up with a pile of everything  
16 that they were wearing, everything that we were wearing,  
17 all bagged and labelled and sealed for each officer."

18 And then if we look at paragraph 21:

19 "Different officers wear their equipment  
20 differently. We didn't remove or unclip any of it. So  
21 for Samantha Davidson I have written in my statement on

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 page 3 'vest (with baton)' which means it is clipped on  
2 or in one of the pockets ..."

3 But they have different preferences, let's say.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Right. And can we look at paragraph 23, please. You  
6 are asked about your previous statement on page 2:

7 "... I wrote that ..."

8 This is your self-penned statement:

9 " ... I wrote that we seized PC Kayleigh Good's  
10 clothing between 1647 and 1653 hours and Nicole Short's  
11 clothing between 1808 and 1812 hours. I don't know why  
12 there was a delay between these two officers having  
13 their clothing seized. I don't think the delay would  
14 have been on our part."

15 We have heard evidence from Inspector Combe that  
16 there were a number of officers. Thinking now, can you  
17 think of any reason why there was a delay in recovering  
18 Nicole Short's clothing?

19 A. No, I have no idea. We were based in an office and the  
20 officers were either brought up to us or came up to the  
21 office and when they arrived we seized their clothing,



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1           but what was happening prior to them coming to us,  
2           I have no idea.
- 3       Q.   So it was other officers organising when the  
4           individual --
- 5       A.   Yes.
- 6       Q.   -- officers would attend with you?
- 7       A.   Yes.  It was certainly nothing to do with me.
- 8       Q.   And you were available, I think you said from about  
9           11.00 that day?
- 10      A.   I think we were asked in Dundee to go through at 11.00,  
11           so we probably arrived just before lunchtime, but then  
12           I noted statements after that.
- 13      Q.   When were you available that day to forensically recover  
14           or preserve productions or items of clothing?
- 15      A.   I think I noted a statement at about quarter past 1, so  
16           I don't know how long that took, maybe an hour or two,  
17           so potentially from between 3.00 and 4.00.
- 18      Q.   And certainly you seized Kayleigh Good's clothing at  
19           4.47?
- 20      A.   Yes.
- 21      Q.   And we have heard that there was a room within Kirkcaldy

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           Police Office and the officers attended and you were  
2           there with Inspector Combe?

3           A.   Yes.

4           Q.   And I think she described sort of standing at the door  
5           making sure nobody was coming in to interrupt, is that  
6           correct?

7           A.   Yes.

8           Q.   What time did you go home that evening? You say at  
9           paragraph 25:

10                    "I went home after that."

11                    So this was after you had gathered in these items.  
12           What time was that?

13           A.   I don't know what time I finished duty, but we have  
14           obviously seized clothes right up to 8.02 that evening,  
15           so probably just shortly after that I left and then we  
16           would have to travel back to Dundee to go off-duty.

17           Q.   Thank you. Can we look at paragraphs 26 and 27. This  
18           relates to Nicole Short. 26:

19                    "The 4 minutes to seize Nicole Short's clothing was  
20           the time for her to take them off and for us to put them  
21           in the bags. I don't think I would've spent much longer

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 with her before or after that. She would have had to  
2 get redressed into something afterwards but that would  
3 be about it."

4 Do you remember what she was wearing when she  
5 arrived? You have said at paragraph 27:

6 "When she came to us, she had her T-shirt ...  
7 microfleece and ... her vest."

8 A. They all arrived to us in uniform, but whether they were  
9 carrying some of it or wearing some of it -- I don't  
10 know if they had their vests on or not, but the rest of  
11 it, they were wearing their uniform.

12 Q. I was going to ask you: was Nicole Short wearing her  
13 body armour and her high-visibility vest or carrying it?

14 A. I don't remember.

15 Q. Thank you. When you talk about her micro fleece and her  
16 vest, what do you mean by that?

17 A. So by her vest, it's her stab-proof vest.

18 Q. The black body armour?

19 A. Yes, the body armour, yes. And the micro fleece is just  
20 a thin, fleecy top that you wear underneath your  
21 stab-proof vest.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. Is that standard police issue or something --
- 2 A. Yes, you get issued them. They've got "police" on the  
3 arm, a small zip and just thin fleece material.
- 4 Q. Right. Could I ask you to look at a vest, please. It's  
5 in a bag. Ms Wildgoose will hand this to you and I'm  
6 going to ask you if you recognise it.
- 7 A. Yes, that's my writing on the label.
- 8 Q. And is that Nicole Short's vest?
- 9 A. Yes. It's called "Nicole Short's".
- 10 Q. Thank you. And that was the item that you seized from  
11 her that day?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And do you remember anything unusual about it at the  
14 time?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Was anything drawn to your attention?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. Did PC Short indicate to you in any way that there was  
19 a mark, or something on it that was significant or  
20 important?
- 21 A. No.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 Q. Would you look at this photograph, please, that we've  
2 got on the screen, the second one, and you will see this  
3 is a photograph of the rear of Nicole Short's vest and  
4 you will see that there's a dark-coloured mark on the  
5 back of the yellow hi-vis jacket part?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Was that drawn to your attention at all on the day that  
8 you recovered it?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. If it had been drawn to your attention, what would you  
11 have done to respond to that?
- 12 A. We would have raised that with a senior investigating  
13 officer and let them decide how they wanted to proceed  
14 with that.
- 15 Q. Who was the senior investigating officer?
- 16 A. DCI Stuart Houston, I think.
- 17 Q. Right. And was he someone that you could have gone to  
18 and spoken about a mark on a vest if that had been drawn  
19 to your attention?
- 20 A. If not him, somebody just below him, yes.
- 21 Q. But ideally the senior investigating officer?

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

- 1 A. Yes, or the deputy.
- 2 Q. The deputy, whoever that may have been.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And was there any sort of mechanism or procedure in  
5 place where you would have drawn that to the attention  
6 of the forensic services in any way? Would you have  
7 marked it on the label?
- 8 A. No, I would say that's probably -- no. I would say it's  
9 probably more a decision for the SIO to make how they  
10 wanted to proceed with that, whether they wanted it  
11 photographed or taken straight to the lab, or -- that  
12 would be a decision for them.
- 13 Q. So if you have noticed something on an item, or it's  
14 drawn to your attention, you can draw that to the  
15 attention of the SIO and is there any reason you can  
16 think of why if someone has brought something to your  
17 attention, or you have noticed something, that you  
18 wouldn't mention that to the SIO?
- 19 A. Not if it was flagged up as potentially being relevant.
- 20 Q. Right. So no reason that you -- if that mark had been  
21 drawn to your attention, you can't think of any reason

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1           why you wouldn't have mentioned that to the SIO that  
2           day.

3           A. No.

4           Q. Right.

5                     Could I ask you about paragraphs 29 and 30 of your  
6           Inquiry statement please. It says:

7                     "I don't remember if Nicole Short said anything to  
8           me about her uniform when she came to us. I didn't have  
9           much of a conversation with any of them. I don't think  
10          any of them said very much at all, but I can't  
11          specifically remember.

12                    "I didn't consider photographing any of the  
13          clothing. This is not something I would normally do.  
14          It's not routinely done."

15                    I'm quite interested in the taking of photographs.

16          A. Okay.

17          Q. What's the normal routine with photographs?

18          A. We wouldn't normally photograph items of clothes that we  
19          have seized. We would package them, send them for  
20          examination and it would be for the scientists, if they  
21          find something during examination, to decide to take

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 a photo.

2 Q. So more the forensic specialists could take photographs.

3 A. We are not examining them, so it's more during the  
4 examination that if anything is found it would be  
5 photographed.

6 Q. Right, thank you. So that wasn't part of what you were  
7 doing, the process you were following, it wasn't any  
8 part of it?

9 A. No, we weren't to examine them. We were just to seize  
10 them and bag them.

11 Q. Thank you.

12 If an officer had asked about a photograph, or  
13 wished a photograph taken, is that something that you  
14 would also have spoken to the SIO about?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Thank you. Can we look at paragraph 32:

17 "When I was seizing the officers clothing, it was  
18 clear to all parties that bagging and labeling the  
19 uniform was our only role at that time. There was  
20 a mutual understanding that we would not ask the  
21 officers any questions and they would not discuss the



**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 incident with us. Our role that day was purely to seize  
2 their clothing, not to obtain any information from  
3 them."

4 And is that -- you weren't having discussions with  
5 them or noting down what had happened earlier that day  
6 or any of that?

7 A. No, there was no conversation.

8 Q. Do you have any recollection now about how Nicole Short  
9 was when you seized her clothing?

10 A. Not specifically Nicole. I remember all the officers  
11 seemed upset, but not specifically anything about  
12 Nicole.

13 Q. All right, thank you. Can we look at paragraph 33  
14 please. You are asked about the media:

15 "I have not really been following the media  
16 surrounding this case. I see the headlines  
17 occasionally, or if it is on STV news at night. I don't  
18 go out of my way to follow it.

19 "I haven't really seen much more other than that,  
20 maybe a headline on the news about his family. I really  
21 haven't followed it much at all. The family were making

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1 a complaint about how it was dealt with. That's all  
2 I know really. I've maybe seen a family member or their  
3 solicitor making comment about complaints that they have  
4 made and the processes that they are going through.  
5 I have not seen anything outwith that about the incident  
6 itself."

7 So you have not really followed this?

8 A. No, I mean other than that -- the day of the incident  
9 that I attended, I then went back to Dundee and had  
10 nothing at all to do with the inquiry thereafter.

11 Q. So you have not had any ongoing contact really with the  
12 officers who were involved?

13 A. I didn't know any of them. I have had no contact with  
14 them since and, yeah, because it was a Sunday I helped  
15 that day and then had nothing else to do with it.

16 Q. So you had an awareness that the family were  
17 concerned --

18 A. Yes, but --

19 Q. -- about certain aspects, but no more than that really?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Thank you very much. I have no further questions.

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 LORD BRACADALE: Any Rule 9 applications? No.

2 Detective Constable, thank you very much for coming  
3 to give evidence to the Inquiry. I am about to rise for  
4 the day and then you will be free to go.

5 A. Thank you.

6 (3.50 pm)

7 (The Inquiry adjourned)

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

INDEX

21

**TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY**

1 DR RUDY CRAWFORD (continued) .....1

2 Questions from MS THOMSON (continued) .....1

3 Application by MS MITCHELL .....24

4 Ruling .....27

5 MS JANE COMBE (sworn) .....28

6 Questions from MS GRAHAME .....28

7 Application by MS MITCHELL .....93

8 Ruling .....96

9 MS JANE COMBE (continued) .....98

10 Questions from MS MITCHELL .....98

11 TEMPORARY DI SAMANTHA DAVIDSON .....109

12 (sworn)

13

14 Questions from MS GRAHAME .....109

15

16 Application by MS MITCHELL .....180

17

18 Ruling .....184

19

20 TEMPORARY DI SAMANTHA DAVIDSON .....185

21 (continued)

## TRANSCRIPT OF THE INQUIRY

1	Questions from MS MITCHELL .....	185
2	DETECTIVE CONSTABLE JENNIFER BRUCE .....	187
3	(sworn)	
4		
5	Questions from MS GRAHAME .....	187
6		
7		
8		